

Proclus on Whole and Part: A Reappraisal of Mereology in Neoplatonic Metaphysics

By

Arthur Oosthout



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Contents

Acknowledgements IX

Figures and Tables XI

- 1 Introduction 1
 - 1.1 Status Quaestionis 4
 - 1.1.1 *Established Scholarship on Proclean Mereology* 5
 - 1.1.2 *The Author's Own Recent Work on Proclean Mereology* 7
 - 1.2 A Preview of Proclean Mereology 8
 - 1.3 Overview of the Study 10
 - 1.4 Essential Proclean Concepts and Terminology 13
 - 1.5 Critical Editions and Translations 15

PART I

The Mereological Question

- 2 Mereology 101 21
 - 2.1 Classical Extensional Mereology 22
 - 2.2 David Lewis's Argument for Unrestricted Composition 24
 - 2.3 Peter Van Inwagen and the Special Composition Question 28
 - 2.4 The Whole as a Structure in Plato 32
 - 2.4.1 *Socrates and Theaetetus versus Extensional Mereology* 33
 - 2.4.2 *The Whole-as-Structure Model* 36
 - 2.4.3 *Philebus 23c–26d* 38
 - 2.4.4 *Timaeus 31b–32c* 40
 - 2.5 Structure as a Part in Aristotle 42
 - 2.5.1 *Harte versus Koslicki on the Regress Argument* 43
 - 2.5.2 *Mereological Considerations on Koslicki's Neo-Aristotelian Theory* 46
 - 2.5.3 *Aristotle versus Van Inwagen* 47
 - 2.6 The Two Sides of Modern Mereology 47

PART 2

The Central Tenets of Proclean Mereology

- 3 Quantity versus Complexity 55
- 3.1 Proclus' Rule in the *Elements of Theology* 57
- 3.2 'A Being First, Then a Living Being': the Proclean Rule in Action 64
- 3.3 Stacking Material Substrates: the Proclean Rule and Demiurgy 70
- 3.4 The Compatibility of the *TP*- and *IP*-Passages 77
- 3.5 The Double Meaning of Συυθετώτερον 78
- 4 A Wholesome Trinity 83
- 4.1 The Basics of the Threefold Wholeness 87
- 4.2 Whole above Part: the Roots of Proclean Mereology 92
- 4.3 Two Examples from Proclus' Cosmology 98
- 4.4 The Whole in Each Part: a Reappraisal of Previous Readings 105
- 4.5 Stronger Apart and Stronger Together 108

PART 3

Part and Whole in Proclus' Theology and Cosmology

- 5 Dividing the Indivisible 115
- 5.1 Balancing the Relativistic Whole and the Determinate Whole 117
- 5.2 The Distinctive Character of the Intelligible Whole 122
- 5.2.1 *The Eternal Whole* 124
- 5.2.2 *The Perfect Composite* 128
- 5.3 Unfolding the Heaven 131
- 5.4 The Evolution of Whole into Part 135
- 5.5 The Division of the Platonic Forms by the Intellective Gods 142
- 5.6 The Development of Axiology, Cosmology, and Perfection 150
- 5.7 The Indivisible Divided 154
- 5.7.1 *The Concepts 'Whole', 'Perfect', 'Part', and 'Division' in Proclean Theology* 154
- 5.7.2 *Relative or Rigid?* 157
- 5.7.3 *The Whole and the Good* 159
- 6 Uniting the Imperfect 161
- 6.1 The Mereological Role of Time 163
- 6.2 Between a Systematic and an Exegetical Mereology 168
- 6.2.1 *The Introduction to the Third Book of the Timaeus-Commentary* 169
- 6.2.2 *The Third Gift of the Demiurge: the Whole of Wholes* 171

- 6.2.3 *The Tenth Gift of the Demiurge: Resemblance to the Paradigm* 172
- 6.2.4 *The Demiurge's Speech to the Young Gods* 175
- 6.2.5 *The Mereological Lessons from the Four Passages* 178
- 6.3 Material Existence and the Partial Wholeness of the Individual 182
- 6.4 The Question of the Partial Good 195

PART 4

Bringing the Parts Together

- 7 The Best Kind of Whole (for a Neoplatonist) 205
 - 7.1 Reflecting on the Sum of the Parts 205
 - 7.1.1 *Formalists versus Naturalists (Aka to Be Fuzzy or Not to Be Fuzzy)* 205
 - 7.1.2 *The Right Kind of Composition* 207
 - 7.1.3 *Expanding the Concept of Wholeness* 207
 - 7.1.4 *The Division of the Indivisible Whole* 208
 - 7.1.5 *(A)Part Alone, Whole Together* 210
 - 7.2 What Is Proclus' Definition of the Whole(Some)? 211
 - 7.3 Is Proclus' Mereology Consistent? 219
 - 7.4 Is the Proclean Whole Fuzzy or Fantastical? 224
 - 7.5 Are Proclean Compounds Whole in an Ethical Sense? 227
 - 7.6 Is Proclus' Mereology Actually Any Good? 229

Bibliography 231

Index locorum 245

Index rerum 249