



Collection lausannoise

Tsubasa Shinohara

# Paving the Way for the Protection of Human Rights in Sports

The Case of Intersex and Transgender Female Athletes



Stämpfli Editions

# Table of Contents

Preface .....	XIII
Table of Cases .....	XV
Abbreviations .....	XXVII
<b>General Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
A. Background.....	1
B. Purpose.....	3
C. Structure.....	6
<b>Chapter 1. An Introduction to Sports and Human Rights : Responsibility of Sports Governing Bodies for the Respect of Human Rights?.....</b>	<b>9</b>
1.1. Introduction.....	9
1.2. The Legal Status of Non-State Actors under International Law : Subject, Object or Other?.....	12
1.2.1. International Organisations .....	13
1.2.2. Quasi-Private Entities.....	14
1.2.3. Private Entities .....	14
1.3. The Relationship Between the Concepts of “Positive Obligations”, “Private Autonomy” and “Public Policy” .....	15
1.3.1. Positive Obligations and Horizontal Effect under the ECHR : Human Rights Protection in the Private Relationship between Non-State Actors .....	16
1.3.1.1. Positive Obligations under the ECHR .....	16
1.3.1.2. Horizontal Effect of the ECHR on the Private Relationship between Non-State Actors .....	18
1.3.2. Relationship between Sporting Regulations, Private Autonomy and Public Policy .....	20
1.4. Corporate Social Responsibility and Human Rights Protections in Sports .....	22
1.4.1. The Development of the Concept of the CSR in the context of Human Rights Protection .....	22
1.4.1.1. The Definition of the CSR .....	22
1.4.1.2. The Development of Normative Instruments for the Respect of Human Rights under the Concept of the CSR.....	24
1.4.2. The Responsibility for the Respect of Human Rights in Private Sectors under the UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights .....	26
1.4.2.1. The Development of Human Rights Protection in Private Sector under the UNGPs.....	26
1.4.2.2. How Can Sports Governing Bodies Respect Human Rights in light of the UNGPs in their Activities?.....	29
1.5. Human Rights Protection in Sports Through Sporting Regulations.....	30
1.5.1. International Olympic Committee.....	31
1.5.2. Fédération Internationale de Football Association.....	35

1.5.3. World Athletics .....	38
1.6. What Should Sports Governing Bodies Do for the Prevention of Human Rights Violations in Sports?.....	39
1.7. Conclusion .....	40
<b>Chapter 2. Legal Issues Caused by the Discrimination Against Intersex and Transgender Female Athletes Based on Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics.....</b>	<b>43</b>
2.1. Introduction.....	43
2.2. Definitions .....	44
2.2.1. Sex and Gender .....	45
2.2.2. Sexual Orientation (Homosexual and Bisexual).....	46
2.2.3. Gender Identity (Transgender or Transsexual).....	47
2.2.4. Sex Characteristics (Intersex).....	48
2.3. The Emergence of Sex or Gender Verification Tests After the Inclusion of Female Athletes in Sports Competitions .....	49
2.3.1. Inclusion of Female Athletes into the Female Category of Sports Competitions .....	50
2.3.2. Exclusion of Intersex and Transgender Female Athletes from the Female Sports Competitions due to Sex or Gender Verification Tests .....	53
2.4. Sporting Regulations on the Prohibition of Discrimination against Intersex and Transgender Female Athletes .....	56
2.4.1. International Olympic Committee.....	56
2.4.2. Fédération Internationale de Football Association.....	61
2.4.3. World Athletics .....	64
2.5. Sports-Related Disputes Concerning Discrimination based on Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics in Female Sports Competitions .....	66
2.5.1. Intersex Female Athletes.....	67
2.5.1.1. <i>Dutee Chand v. Athletics Federation of India (AFI) &amp; International Association of Athletics Federations (IAAF)</i> .....	67
2.5.1.1.1. Facts.....	67
2.5.1.1.2. CAS Award .....	68
2.5.1.1.3. Summary.....	71
2.5.1.2. <i>Caster Semenya and Athletics South Africa (ASA) v. International Association of Athletics Federations (IAAF)</i> .....	71
2.5.1.2.1. Fact .....	71
2.5.1.2.2. CAS Award .....	72
2.5.1.2.3. SFT’s Judgement.....	74
2.5.1.2.4. ECtHR’s Proceeding .....	77
2.5.1.2.5. Summary.....	78
2.5.2. Male-to-Female Transgender Athletes.....	79
2.5.2.1. <i>Renee Richards v. The United States Tennis Association</i> .....	79
2.5.2.2. <i>Worley v. Ontario Cycling Association</i> .....	80
2.5.2.3. <i>Lia Thomas Case</i> .....	81

2.6.	What Human Rights-related Issues Can be Identified in cases of Intersex and Transgender Female Athletes?.....	82
2.6.1.	The Right to Prohibition of Inhuman or Degrading Treatment .....	83
2.6.2.	The Right to Respect for Private Life .....	85
2.6.2.1.	The Right to Privacy .....	85
2.6.2.2.	The Right to Personal Integrity.....	86
2.6.2.3.	The Right to Protection of A Person’s Honour and Reputation ....	86
2.6.3.	The Right to Prohibition of Discrimination .....	87
2.6.4.	The Right to Participate in Sports Activities.....	87
2.7.	Conclusion .....	88

**Chapter 3. Can Intersex and Transgender Female Athletes Bring Their Complain of Human Rights before the UN Human Rights Bodies? .....89**

3.1.	Introduction.....	89
3.2.	The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.....	94
3.2.1.	Individual Communications Procedure and Admissibility Criteria before the Human Rights Committee.....	95
3.2.2.	Prohibition of Discrimination based on Sexual Orientation, Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics under the ICCPR .....	99
3.2.3.	Whether Intersex and Transgender Persons Can Claim a Violation of their Substantive Rights Guaranteed by the ICCPR due to Discrimination based on Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics .....	103
3.2.3.1.	The Right to Privacy .....	104
3.2.3.2.	The Right to an Effective Remedy.....	106
3.2.4.	Conclusion.....	107
3.3.	The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	107
3.3.1.	Individual Communication Procedure before the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights .....	109
3.3.2.	Substantive Obligations : Immediate Obligations, Duty of Progressive Realisation, and Minimum Core Obligations.....	114
3.3.3.	Prohibition of Discrimination based on Sexual Orientation, Gender Identity, and Sex Characteristics under the ICESCR .....	117
3.3.4.	Whether There Is a Violation of the ICESCR Rights due to Discrimination based on Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics .....	119
3.3.4.1.	The Right to Work .....	119
3.3.4.2.	The Right to Participate in Sports Activities .....	121
3.3.5.	Conclusion.....	124
3.4.	The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women.....	124
3.4.1.	Individual Complaints Procedure before the Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women .....	126
3.4.2.	Does the CEDAW Include the Discrimination based on Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics?.....	129

3.4.3.	Obligations to Respect, Protect, and Fulfil under Article 2 of the CEDAW .....	132
3.4.4.	Whether Substantive Rights under the CEDAW Are Infringed by Discrimination based on Sexual Orientation, Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics .....	135
3.4.5.	Conclusion.....	136
3.5.	The Convention on the Rights of the Child .....	137
3.5.1.	Individual Communications Procedure and Admissibility Criteria under the Third Optional Protocol to the CRC.....	139
3.5.2.	General Principles of Children’s Rights : Non-Discrimination Rule and the Right to Equality.....	140
3.5.3.	Does the CRC Prohibit Discrimination against LGBTI Children based on Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics? .....	145
3.5.4.	Whether the Intersex and Transgender Children Can Claim a Violation of the CRC Rights due to Discrimination based on Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics .....	147
3.5.4.1.	The Right to Privacy .....	148
3.5.4.2.	The Right to Participate in Sports and Recreational Activities ...	150
3.5.5.	Conclusion.....	152
3.6.	The Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities .....	153
3.6.1.	Individual Communications Procedure: Admissibility Criteria under the Optional Protocol to the CPRD.....	155
3.6.2.	Purpose of the CRPD and the Prohibition of Discrimination against Persons with Disabilities based on Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics .....	156
3.6.3.	General Obligations under the CRPD .....	160
3.6.4.	Conclusion.....	161
3.7.	Conclusion .....	162
<b>Chapter 4. Can Intersex and Transgender Female Athletes Bring Their Complain of Human Rights before the Regional Human Rights Regimes?....</b>		
4.1.	Introduction.....	165
4.2.	The European Human Rights Regime .....	167
4.2.1.	The European Convention on Human Rights .....	167
4.2.1.1.	The Brief Overview of Admissibility Conditions.....	168
4.2.1.2.	Whether There Is a Violation of Substantive Rights guaranteed by the ECHR due to Discrimination based on Gender Identity and Sexual Orientation .....	171
4.2.1.3.	The Application of the ECHR to the case of Discrimination against Intersex and Transgender Athletes in Sports .....	174
4.2.1.4.	Article 1 of Protocol No. 12 to the ECHR.....	176
4.2.1.5.	Conclusion .....	177
4.2.2.	The European Social Charter .....	177
4.2.3.	The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union .....	181

4.2.3.1.	The Applicability of the EU Charter to the Private Relationship between Individuals .....	184
4.2.3.1.1.	Applicability of the EU Charter .....	184
4.2.3.1.2.	Restriction on the Exercise of the Rights and Freedoms laid down by the EU Charter .....	188
4.2.3.1.3.	Horizontal Effect of Article 21 of the EU Charter in Private Relationship between Individuals .....	189
4.2.3.2.	The CJEU's Jurisdiction over a Case in relation to the EU Charter .....	191
4.2.3.3.	The Prohibition of Discrimination based on Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics under the EU Charter .....	193
4.2.3.3.1.	The Principle of Non-Discrimination in the EU under Article 21 of the EU Charter .....	193
4.2.3.3.2.	Whether Discrimination based on Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics Can Fall within the Scope of Article 21 of the EU Charter ....	196
4.2.3.4.	Conclusion .....	197
4.3.	The Inter-American Human Rights Regime .....	198
4.3.1.	Individual Petitions Procedure and the IACtHR's Jurisdiction .....	202
4.3.2.	The General Obligations under the ACHR .....	207
4.3.3.	Does Discrimination based on Gender Identity and Sexual Orientation Fall within the Non-Discrimination Rule under the ACHR? .....	209
4.3.4.	Whether There Is a Violation of Substantive Rights guaranteed by the ACHR due to Discrimination based on Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics .....	213
4.3.4.1.	The Right to Privacy and Reparations .....	213
4.3.4.2.	The Right to Equal Protection .....	218
4.3.4.3.	Economic, Social and Cultural Rights .....	219
4.3.5.	Conclusion .....	221
4.4.	Conclusion .....	221
<b>Chapter 5. The Role of the Court of Arbitration for Sport in Protection of Human Rights .....</b>		<b>223</b>
5.1.	Introduction .....	223
5.2.	Applicable Law and Arbitrators' Powers in Arbitral Proceedings .....	225
5.3.	The Application of Regulatory Framework for the Prohibition of Discrimination by the Internal Dispute Resolution Body .....	227
5.3.1.	International Olympic Committee .....	228
5.3.2.	Fédération Internationale de Football Association .....	228
5.3.3.	World Athletics .....	230
5.4.	What Actions Should the CAS Take to Protect Human Rights in the context of Sports? .....	231
5.5.	Conclusion .....	236

<b>Chapter 6. Protection of Intersex and Transgender Female Athletes against Discrimination in Sport before the Swiss Federal Tribunal.....</b>	<b>239</b>
6.1. Introduction.....	239
6.2. Do the Grounds of Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics Fall within the Scope of Article 8(2) of the SFC?.....	242
6.3. Relationship between Article 8(2) of the SFC and Article 190(2)(e) of the PILA... 243	
6.3.1. The Concept of “Public Policy” under Article 190(2)(e) of the PILA.....	244
6.3.2. How Can Athletes Claim a Violation of their Human Rights under Article 190(2)(e) of the PILA?.....	245
6.4. Infringement of Personality Rights and Substantive Public Policy due to Discrimination based on the Prohibited Grounds under Article 8(2) of the SFC.....	247
6.5. Conclusion .....	251
<b>Chapter 7. Protection of Substantive Human Rights of Intersex and Transgender Athletes against Discrimination before the European Court of Human Rights.....</b>	<b>253</b>
7.1. Introduction.....	253
7.2. Admissibility Criteria for Sports-Related Disputes before the ECtHR .....	255
7.2.1. Jurisdiction <i>ratione personae</i> (Articles 1 and 35(3)(a) of the ECHR).....	255
7.2.2. Exhaustion of All Domestic Remedies (Article 35(1) of the ECHR) .....	257
7.3. How Can Intersex and Transgender Athletes Claim a Violation of Article 14 of the ECHR?.....	258
7.3.1. Conditions for the Application of Article 14 of the ECHR.....	259
7.3.1.1. Whether the Alleged Claim Falls within the Ambit of One of the Substantive Provisions of the ECHR in conjunction with Article 14 .....	261
7.3.1.2. Whether There Is a Differential Treatment for Individuals by the State Parties or Non-state Actors within its Jurisdiction.....	263
7.3.1.3. Whether the Person Concerned Is Treated Differently Compared to Others in Similar or Analogous Situations to Him or Her .....	266
7.3.1.4. Whether There Is Objective and Reasonable Justification .....	267
7.3.2. Can Intersex and Transgender Female Athletes Claim a Violation of Article 14 of the ECHR taken in conjunction with Article 8 of the ECHR? .....	270
7.4. Open the Door to Athletes Being Able to Claim a Violation of Article 8 of the ECHR taken alone in Sports-Related Disputes before the ECtHR?.....	271
7.4.1. Procedural Rights in Sports guaranteed by Article 6 of the ECHR .....	273
7.4.2. Substantive Rights in Sports guaranteed by the European Convention on Human Rights?.....	276
7.4.2.1. Facts .....	276
7.4.2.2. Judgment .....	277
7.4.2.2.1. Applicability of Article 8 of the ECHR.....	277
7.4.2.2.2. Nature of the Obligation Imposed and Margin of Appreciation.....	278

7.4.2.2.3. Consideration.....	279
7.4.3. The Perspective on the <i>Caster Semenya</i> Case before the European Court of Human Rights .....	280
7.4.4. Can Intersex and Transgender Female Athletes Claim a Violation of Article 8 of the ECHR due to Discriminatory Measures based on Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics? .....	282
7.5. Standard for Determining Which States Parties Are Held Responsible for Implementing Positive Obligations under the ECHR in Sports-Related Disputes...283	
7.5.1. How Does the CAS Identify a Nexus between Sports Governing Bodies and Duty of Human Rights Protection under International Human Rights Law?.....	285
7.5.2. Standard for Identification of A Duty Bearer under the ECHR in Sports-Related Disputes .....	288
7.6. <i>Caster Semenya v. Switzerland</i> before the ECtHR .....	291
7.6.1. Jurisdiction <i>ratione personae</i> and <i>ratione loci</i> .....	291
7.6.2. Violation of Article 14 in conjunction with Article 8 of the ECHR .....	292
7.6.3. Violation of Article 8 of the ECHR .....	293
7.6.4. Violation of Article 3 of the ECHR .....	293
7.6.5. Violation of Article 13 of the ECHR .....	294
7.6.6. Judges' opinions .....	295
7.6.6.1. Partial Concurring and Dissenting Opinion of Judge Serghides ....	295
7.6.6.2. Common Dissenting Opinion of Judges Grozev, Roosma and Ktistaki .....	296
7.6.7. Consideration .....	297
7.7. Conclusion .....	299
<b>General Conclusion .....</b>	<b>303</b>
A. Before Which Courts, Tribunals or Human Rights Bodies Can Intersex and Transgender Female Athletes Bring Their Complaints of A Violation of Substantive Human Rights Guaranteed by International Human Rights Law? ...	304
B. How Can Intersex and Transgender Female Athletes Claim a Violation of Substantive Rights due to Discrimination based on Gender Identity and Sex Characteristics before Dispute Resolution System in Sports Society?.....	306
C. Conclusion .....	310
<b>Bibliography .....</b>	<b>315</b>
<b>Index.....</b>	<b>361</b>