

The Regulatory Landscape of Transnational Corporations

Embracing its Complexity by Adopting a Transnational Perspective

Dissertation
der Rechtswissenschaftlichen Fakultät
der Universität Zürich

zur Erlangung der Würde einer Doktorin der Rechtswissenschaft

vorgelegt von

Lea Ina Schneider

von Zürich/Uster

genehmigt auf Antrag von

Prof. Dr. Christine Kaufmann
und

Prof. Dr. Daniel Moeckli, LL.M.

Dike Verlag Zürich 2024

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	V
Content Overview	VII
Abbreviations	XIX
List of Scholarly Literature.....	XXV
List of (Draft) Regulatory Initiatives and Legislation.....	LIX
List of Materials.....	LXIII
List of Internet Sources	LXV
Introduction.....	1
1. Setting the Scene: The Approach of this Analysis.....	4
a) The Discourses of Business and Human Rights and Transnational Law	4
b) The Need for a Transnational Perspective.....	7
(i) Thinking Beyond the Westphalian Paradigm	8
(ii) Conceptualising the Regulation of Transnational Corporations as an Inherently Transnational Challenge.....	13
2. Further Framing of this Analysis	14
3. Aim of this Analysis	17
4. Structure of this Analysis.....	19
5. Limitations of this Analysis	20
6. Methodology of this Analysis.....	21
Mapping the Terrain.....	23
1. Starting Point: Definition of Key Terms	23
a) Preliminary Remarks.....	23
b) Definition of ‘Transnational Corporation’	23
c) Definition of ‘Regulation’	26

2. Contextualising the Present Analysis	27
a) The Wider Picture: Globalisation as a Starting Point.....	27
b) The Need for Regulating Transnational Corporations	30
c) Transnational Corporations – Regulatory Nuts to Crack	35
i. Preliminary Remarks	35
(ii) State-Based World Order and Flexibility of Transnational Corporations	36
(ii) The Problem of (Inter)national Legal Personality	38
(iii) The Problem of Legal “Nationality” of Transnational Corporations and the Challenge of Jurisdiction	41
3. Conclusion	42
Chapter 1: The Concepts of Transnational Law and Transnational Regulatory Corporate Governance	43
1. Preliminary Remarks	43
2. Transnational Law: Introducing the Concept of this Analysis	44
a) Contextualising the Concept of Transnational Law for the Purpose of this Analysis	44
(i) Transnational Law as a Body of Norms	45
(ii) Transnational Law as a Methodological Framework	48
b) <i>Transnationalisation of Law</i> : Application of Peer C. Zumbansen’s Approach for the Following Analysis	49
(i) Diversification	50
(a) Diversified Actors.....	50
(b) Diversified Regulations.....	51
(ii) Blurring of Legal Categories	52
(a) Public versus Private	52
(b) National versus International	52
(c) Soft versus Hard Law.....	53
3. Transnational Regulatory Corporate Governance	53
a) Terminology	53
b) Contextualising the Present Concept of Transnational Regulatory Corporate Governance.....	55

c) Grasping the Present Concept of Transnational Regulatory Corporate Governance	58
(i) Regulatory Diversification of Transnational Corporations	59
(ii) Regulatory Hybridisation of Transnational Corporations	60
4. Concluding Remarks on Transnational Law and Transnational Regulatory Corporate Governance.....	61
Chapter 2: Regulatory Diversification	62
1. Preliminary Remarks	62
a) The Need for Categorisation	62
b) Terminology	63
c) Methodology	64
d) Justification of the Selected Regulatory Initiatives.....	65
2. Setting the Criteria for Analysing the Existing Regulatory Initiatives	70
a) <i>Who</i> Regulates? – The Regulatory Actor(s).....	70
b) <i>Who</i> is Addressed? – The Regulatory Addressee(s)	70
c) <i>What</i> is the Legal Nature of the Regulatory Initiative? – The Legal Nature.....	72
d) <i>What</i> is the Regulatory Level of the Initiative? – The Regulatory Level.....	72
e) <i>What</i> is Regulated? – The Regulatory Content	72
f) <i>How</i> is the Regulatory Initiative Implemented? – The Regulatory Implementation.....	73
g) <i>How</i> is Compliance with the Regulatory Initiative Ensured? – The Regulatory Compliance	73
3. Application of the Criteria	74
a) International Hard Law Initiatives	74
(i) Global: Building a United Nations Treaty on Business and Human Rights (UN-Treaty).....	74
(a) Background Information	74
(b) Regulatory Analysis	76
(c) Interim Conclusion: <i>Actors, Norms and Processes</i> Involved.....	77
(ii) Regional: Initiatives by the European Union	77
(a) European Union: EU-Regulation 2017/821 (EU Conflict Minerals Regulation)	77

(i) Background Information.....	77
(ii) Regulatory Analysis.....	78
(b) European Union: EU-Directive 2014/95 (EU Non-Financial Reporting Directive).....	80
(i) Background Information.....	80
(ii) Regulatory Analysis.....	80
(c) Interim Conclusion: <i>Actors, Norms and Processes</i> Involved.....	82
b) International Soft Law Initiatives.....	83
(i) Introducing the Soft Law Concept of this Analysis	83
(ii) United Nations: Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights	85
(a) Background Information.....	85
(b) Regulatory Analysis	86
(iii) Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development: Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises	90
(a) Background Information.....	90
(b) Regulatory Analysis	92
(iv) International Labour Organisation: Tripartite Declaration of Principles Concerning Multinational Enterprises and Social Policy	95
(a) Background Information.....	95
(b) Regulatory Analysis	96
(v) Interim Conclusion: Actors, Norms and Processes Involved	98
c) National Hard Law Initiatives.....	99
(i) Home State Initiatives	99
(a) United Kingdom: Modern Slavery Act	100
(i) Background Information.....	100
(ii) Regulatory Analysis	100
(b) France.....	102
(i) Loi Relative au Devoir de Vigilance	102
(ii) Loi Relative à la Croissance et la Transformation des Entreprises	105
(c) Switzerland.....	108
(i) Swiss Responsible Business Initiative	108
(ii) Indirect Counter-Proposal to the Swiss Responsible Business Initiative.....	110
(d) Interim Conclusion: <i>Actors, Norms and Processes</i> Involved.....	114

(ii)	Host State Initiative: Nigerian Companies and Allied Matters Act.....	115
(a)	Background Information	115
(b)	Regulatory Analysis	116
(c)	Interim Conclusion: <i>Actors, Norms and Processes Involved</i>	117
d)	Corporate Self-Regulation: Corporate Codes of Conduct.....	118
(i)	Clarification of Key Terms	118
(ii)	Regulatory Analysis.....	119
(iii)	Interim Conclusion: Actors, Norms and Processes Involved	121
e)	Institutionalised Private Initiative: International Organization for Standardization: ISO 26000	122
(i)	Background Information	122
(ii)	Regulatory Analysis.....	124
(iii)	Interim Conclusion: Actors, Norms and Processes Involved	125
f)	Third-Party Certification	126
(i)	Clarification of Key Terms	126
(ii)	Regulatory Analysis.....	126
(iii)	Interim Conclusion: Actors, Norms and Processes Involved	128
g)	Multi-Stakeholder Initiatives	128
(i)	Towards a Definition of Multi-Stakeholder Initiatives.....	128
(ii)	International Accord for Health and Safety in the Textile Industry.....	129
(a)	Background Information	129
(b)	Regulatory Analysis	131
(iii)	Dutch International Responsible Business Conduct Agreements	134
(a)	Background Information	134
(b)	Regulatory Analysis	134
(iv)	Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative	136
(a)	Background Information	136
(b)	Regulatory Analysis	137
(v)	Interim Conclusion: Actors, Norms and Processes Involved	139
4.	Key Observations on A Diversified Regulatory Landscape of Transnational Corporations	139
a)	Characterisation of Traditional and New Regulatory Approaches.....	141
b)	Exemplification of the Traditional and New Regulatory Approaches.....	142
5.	Conclusion: The Trias of <i>Actors, Norms and Processes</i> as a Tool to Unravel the Regulatory Diversification.....	145

Chapter 3: Regulatory Hybridisation	146
1. Preliminary Remarks	146
a) Terminology	146
b) Methodology	147
2. References Between Different Regulatory Frameworks	149
a) Explicit References	149
(i) References in Regional International Hard Law Initiatives to International Soft Law Initiatives and to a Private Initiative	149
(a) Examples: EU-Regulation 2017/821 and EU-Directive 2014/95	149
(b) Regulatory Hybridisation	150
(ii) References in a Regional International Hard Law Initiative to a Multi-Stakeholder Initiative.....	151
(a) Example: EU-Directive 2013/34/EU	151
(b) Regulatory Hybridisation	152
(iii) References in an International Soft Law Initiative to an International Soft Law Initiative and to a Multi-Stakeholder Initiative	153
(a) Example: OECD Due Diligence Guidance for Responsible Supply Chains of Minerals from Conflict-Affected and High-Risk Areas.....	153
(b) Regulatory Hybridisation	154
(iv) References in a National Hard Law Initiative to International Soft Law Initiatives and to Regional International Hard Law Initiatives	155
(a) Example: The Swiss Indirect Counter-Proposal to the Swiss Responsible Business Initiative and the corresponding Ordinance on Conflict Minerals and Child Labour.....	155
(b) Regulatory Hybridisation	156
(v) References in Private Initiatives to International Soft Law Initiatives and to a Multi-Stakeholder Initiative	157
(a) Example: ISO 26000 and Corporate Code of Conduct of Coca-Cola.....	157
(b) Regulatory Hybridisation	158
(vi) References in a Multi-Stakeholder Initiative and in a Third-Party Certification Initiative to International Soft Law Initiatives	159
(a) Examples: Dutch International Responsible Business Conduct Agreements and Fairtrade Textile Standard	159
(b) Regulatory Hybridisation	159
(vii) Interim Conclusion	161

b) Implicit References.....	162
(i) Regional International Hard Law Initiatives as an Inspiration for a National Hard Law Initiative	162
(a) Example: Indirect Counter-Proposal to the Swiss Responsible Business Initiative and the corresponding Ordinance on Conflict Minerals and Child Labour	162
(b) Regulatory Hybridisation	163
(ii) Interaction between International Soft Law Initiatives and National Hard Law Initiatives and Multi-Stakeholder Initiatives	163
(a) Description of the Mechanism and Examples.....	163
(b) Regulatory Hybridisation	165
(iii) Memoranda of Understanding as a Harmonisation Tool during the Drafting of an Initiative	166
(a) Example: ISO 26000	166
(b) Regulatory Hybridisation	168
(iv) Interim Conclusion	169
3. References Within the Same Regulatory Framework.....	170
a) Explicit References.....	170
(i) References in International Soft Law Initiatives to other International Soft Law Initiatives	170
(a) Examples: OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises, United Nations Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights and International Labour Organisation Tripartite Declaration of Principles Concerning Multinational Enterprises and Social Policy ...	170
(b) Regulatory Hybridisation	170
(ii) Strengthening the Compliance Mechanism of one International Soft Law Initiative through the Implementation Mechanism of another International Soft Law Initiative	171
(a) Example: National Action Plans referring to National Contact Points	171
(b) Regulatory Hybridisation	172
(iii) Interim Conclusion	172
b) Implicit References.....	173
(i) International Soft Law Initiatives as Incentive for other International Soft Law Initiatives	173

(a) Examples: OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises and United Nations Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights ...	173
(b) Regulatory Hybridisation	173
(ii) National Hard Law Initiatives as Incentive for Other States to Adopt National Hard Law Initiatives	173
(a) Example: Swiss Responsible Business Initiative	173
(b) Regulatory Hybridisation	174
(iii) Interim Conclusion	174
4. Concluding Remarks on Regulatory Hybridisation.....	174
Chapter 4: Insights from a Transnational Perspective	176
1. Preliminary Remarks	176
2. Key Findings from a Transnational Perspective	176
a) Introduction to the Three Key Findings	176
b) An Adequate Mapping of the Regulatory Landscape of Transnational Corporations	177
c) The Changing Regulatory Role of the State	178
d) The Role and Functioning of the International Soft Law Initiatives.....	178
(i) The Transnational Perspective as a Tool to Understand the Role of the International Soft Law Initiatives	178
(ii) The International Soft Law Initiatives as an Instrument of Harmonisation in a Diversified Regulatory Landscape.....	179
(iii) The International Soft Law Initiatives as Authoritative Reference Points	182
(iv) The International Soft Law Initiatives as Future Customary International Law.....	182
3. The Transnational Perspective on the Regulatory Landscape of Transnational Corporations as an Entry Point into Shallow Waters.....	184
a) Introduction to the two Revealed Problem Areas	184
b) The Nature of Law	184
c) The Democratic Challenge.....	187
(i) Towards Conceptual and Terminological Clarity	187
(ii) Contextualising the Problem Area.....	188

(iii) The Democratic Challenge of Soft Law	189
(a) Lack of National Democratic Legitimacy of the International Soft Law Initiatives	189
(b) The Democratic Challenge of the International Soft Law Initiatives and Multi-Stakeholder Initiatives in the Context of the Regulation of Transnational Corporations	191
(iv) The Democratic Challenge of Private Regulatory Actors	193
(v) Re-Conceptualising the Present Concept of Democratic Legitimacy	196
(vi) The Special Significance of Legitimacy in the Regulatory Context of Transnational Corporations	201
4. Concluding Remarks on the Insights from a Transnational Perspective	204
Chapter 5: A Glimpse of a Possible Future.....	205
1. Preliminary Remarks	205
2. Looking Forward – The Way to Go.....	206
a) Holistic Approach.....	206
(i) A Holistic Vision of the Future Regulatory Landscape of Transnational Corporations	206
(ii) Implications for the Regulatory Actors	208
(iii) Implications for the Legal Scholarship on Business and Human Rights ...	209
b) An Underexplored Avenue: Re-Defining the Purpose of the Transnational Corporation.....	213
3. Concluding Remarks on a Possible Future.....	215
Conclusion	217
1. Recapitulation of the Findings.....	217
2. Need for Future Research	219
3. Closing Remarks.....	220