

The Political Economy of Education

MARTIN CARNOY

Stanford University, California

with Aleksei Egorov and Daria Platonova

CONTENTS

List of Figures	page xi
List of Tables	xv
Preface	xvii
Acknowledgments	xx

PART I INTRODUCTION **1**

1 The Political Economy of Education	3
1.1 Introduction	3
1.2 The Economics and Politics of Education	5
1.3 Agency and Structure	6
1.4 The Case for Students and Policymakers to Study the Political Economy of Education	7
1.5 Taking on These Issues	12
2 The Contribution of the Economics of Education to Education Policy	13
2.1 Introduction	13
2.2 The Economic Dimension of Education	13
2.3 The Economic Value of Education	14
2.4 The Role of Education in Economic Growth	18
2.5 School Production Functions and Education Policy	20
2.6 Economists and Empirical Methodology in Education Policy Analysis	23
3 The State and Education	31
3.1 Introduction	31
3.2 The Unequal Distribution of Political Power in Democratic Societies	32
3.3 Implications for a Theory of the State to Frame a Political Economy of Education	34
3.4 Taking It a Step Farther: Educational Systems as Sites of Economic and Political Conflict	35
3.5 The Political Conflict over Resources for Education	37
3.6 State-Generated Social Capital	39

PART II HUMAN CAPITAL **42**

4 Education, Labor Markets, and Earnings	45
4.1 Introduction	45
4.2 Underlying Concepts	45
4.3 Demand and Supply	47
4.4 Productivity and Wages	49
4.5 The Demand for and Supply of Human Capital	51
5 Age-Earnings Profiles and the Returns to Human Capital	56
5.1 Introduction	56
5.2 Age-Earnings Profiles	57

5.3 The Human Capital Model Interpretation of Age-Earnings Profiles	62
5.4 The Returns to Human Capital	65
6 Measuring the Returns to Investment in Education according to the Human Capital Model	69
6.1 Introduction	69
6.2 Education as a "Durable Good" Requiring Time and Resources to Produce	69
6.3 The Concept of Present Value	70
6.4 Costs of Education	75
6.5 Social Benefits and Social Costs	78
6.6 Estimating "Calculated" Rates of Return to Education	80
6.7 The Option Value of Schooling	81
6.8 Estimating Mincer Rates of Return	82
6.9 Selection Bias	83
PART III ALTERNATIVES TO HUMAN CAPITAL	86
7 Alternative Conceptions of the Relation between Skill Acquisition and Productivity	88
7.1 Introduction	88
7.2 Signaling Theory	89
7.3 Queuing Theories and Internal Labor Markets	93
7.4 The Contrast between Human Capital Models and Screening Models	97
7.5 Why Nations Might Spend So Much on Educational Systems Even If Signaling Theory Were Correct	99
8 Conditioned Choice and Discrimination	102
8.1 Introduction	102
8.2 Male-Female Earnings Differences	104
8.3 Race Earnings Differences	107
PART IV EDUCATION, ECONOMIC GROWTH, AND INCOME DISTRIBUTION	115
9 Education and Economic Growth	118
9.1 Introduction	118
9.2 Accounting for Economic Growth	119
9.3 Economic Growth Models and the Role of Education	122
9.4 Endogenous Growth and the Quality of Education	126
9.5 The Political Economy of Cognitive Skills and Endogenous Growth	129
10 Education and Income Distribution	133
10.1 Introduction	133
10.2 Explanations of Changing Personal Income Distribution	134
10.3 The Human Capital Argument for Education's Role in Income Distribution	136
10.4 Post-Human Capital Analyses of Education and Income Distribution	141
10.5 Macroeconomic Analyses of Educational Expansion and Earnings Distribution in Latin America	142

PART V EDUCATIONAL PRODUCTION FUNCTIONS	147
11 Underlying Issues in Educational Production Functions	151
11.1 Introduction	151
11.2 Joint Production: Social Class and Schooling	151
11.3 The Argument for Education as an “Equalizer”	153
11.4 Other Issues in Modeling Education Production Functions	158
11.5 Optimizing Output Subject to a Budget Constraint	162
12 Modeling and Estimating Educational Production Functions	170
12.1 Introduction	170
12.2 The Basic Model	170
12.3 Choosing Educational Inputs and Outputs and Estimating Parameters	172
12.4 Examples of EPFs That Estimate Teacher Effects	176
12.5 Which Teacher Characteristics Contribute to Higher Student Performance	181
12.6 Examples of Estimating the Impact of Inputs on Student Outcomes Using Other Causal Inference Methods	187
13 Cost-Effectiveness and Cost-Benefit Analysis	192
13.1 Introduction	192
13.2 Distinguishing Two Types of Evaluations	192
13.3 Cost-Effectiveness Analysis	193
13.4 Cost-Benefit Analysis	196
14 Issues in Early Childhood Education	199
14.1 Introduction	199
14.2 The Social Benefits of Public Investment in Child Care and ECE	200
14.3 Access to ECE in the United States and Worldwide	207
14.4 The Impact of Investments in ECE on Reducing Achievement and Earnings Gaps between Low- and High-Income Students	208
14.5 Evidence for Effective ECE	210
15 Issues in the Production of Vocational Education and Training	215
15.1 Introduction	215
15.2 Variation in the Production of Vocational Education and Its Relation to Labor Markets	217
15.3 Comparing the Effectiveness of Achievement Outcomes for VET and Academic Schooling	222
15.4 Labor Market Outcomes of Vocational and Academic Education Graduates	226
15.5 How the Vocational/Academic Education Debate Informs Our Understanding of Educational Production	227
PART VI TEACHER LABOR MARKETS	229
16 Fundamental Elements in the Study of Teacher Labor Markets	232
16.1 Introduction	232
16.2 Defining a Market: Key Concepts and Terms	233

16.3 How Labor Markets Differ from Other Types of Markets	233
16.4 How Teacher Labor Markets Differ from Other Labor Markets	235
16.5 How the Teaching Profession Differs from Other Professions	239
16.6 Characteristics of Teacher Careers	241
17 The Demand for and Supply of Teachers	246
17.1 Introduction	246
17.2 The Demand for Teachers	246
17.3 The Supply of Teachers	249
17.4 Working Conditions and the Theory of Compensating Wage Differentials	252
17.5 Equilibrium, Shortages, and Surpluses of Teachers	255
17.6 Teacher Quality	257
18 Teacher Salaries	259
18.1 Introduction	259
18.2 Real versus Nominal Salaries	259
18.3 Relative Salaries	260
18.4 International Comparisons of Teacher Salaries	264
18.5 Criteria for Teacher Pay	267
18.6 Teacher Incentive Pay	269
19 The Politics of Teacher Labor Markets	276
19.1 Introduction	276
19.2 The Role of Teachers' Unions	276
19.3 Higher Teacher Salaries as a Strategy for Educational Improvement	279
19.4 Raising Teacher Quality through Education and Training	281
PART VII SCHOOL SYSTEM ACCOUNTABILITY	286
20 Public Sector Accountability	290
20.1 Introduction	290
20.2 Input/Standards-Based Accountability	291
20.3 Test-Based Accountability	294
20.4 Early Test-Based Accountability Regimes	295
20.5 National Accountability Systems	299
20.6 The Evidence for Whether Test-Based Accountability Raises Student Test Scores	301
20.7 The "Shame Effect" of International Test Results on National Educational Policy	310
20.8 Summing Up	314
21 Market Accountability	316
21.1 Introduction	316
21.2 The Case for Market Accountability	317
21.3 Market Accountability in Chile and Milwaukee	321
21.4 Comparing Achievement Gains of Publicly Subsidized Private School Students and Public School Students	325
21.5 Market-Based Accountability and Overall Student Achievement Gains	328

21.6 Market-Based Accountability and Net Public Benefits	335
21.7 The Case That Some Accountability Systems Are "Better" Than Others	337
Appendix to Part VII: Modeling Differential Parental Demand for School Quality	341

PART VIII FINANCING EDUCATION **345**

22 Educational Spending	348
22.1 Introduction	348
22.2 Public Educational Effort	349
22.3 Public versus Private Effort	352
22.4 Factors Determining How Much Money a Society Collects for Education	354
22.5 Paying for Education when Benefits are not Distributed Equally	357
22.6 Externalities and Public Goods	358
22.7 Factors Influencing Enrollment in Privately Financed Education	360
 23 Collecting and Allocating Revenue for Education	 363
23.1 Introduction	363
23.2 Types of Taxes	364
23.3 Allocating Education Monies	368
23.4 Educational Adequacy	377
23.5 Advantages and Disadvantages of Decentralized Control of Spending	381
 24 More Spending on Education, Improved Student Achievement, and Other Student Outcomes	 387
24.1 Introduction	387
24.2 Greater Public Educational Financial Effort and Increasing Enrollment/Educational Attainment	388
24.3 The Public Spending per Student: Higher Student Achievement Debate	390
24.4 Causal Estimates of the Effect of Higher Spending on Student Achievement	396

PART IX THE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF HIGHER EDUCATION **405**

25 Higher Educational Expansion as a Global Phenomenon	409
25.1 Introduction	409
25.2 The "Massification" of Higher Education	410
25.3 Explaining the Expansion of Higher Education Systems on a Worldwide Scale	413
25.4 Higher Education as a Private and Public Good	420
 26 The Financing of Higher Education	 423
26.1 Introduction	423
26.2 Private and Public Provision of Higher Education	426
26.3 Charging Tuition ("User Taxes") in Public Institutions	431
26.4 Stratification in Higher Education	442
26.5 Empirical Evidence for Increased Stratification	448
26.6 Schemes of Allocating Public Funds in Higher Education	451
 27 Higher Education as an Industry	 458
27.1 Introduction	458

27.2 What Higher Education Institutions Produce	460
27.3 Higher Education Cost Functions	462
27.4 Knowledge Gains in Higher Education	463
27.5 Estimating Earnings Gains from Study in Different Types of Higher Education Institutions	469
27.6 Measuring Research Output	471
27.7 Some Final Notes	475
 28 Academic Labor Markets and Student College Choice Strategies	 477
28.1 Introduction	477
28.2 Academic Labor Markets	477
28.3 A Brief Review of Academic Labor Markets across Countries	491
28.4 Admissions and Student Choice	495
28.5 Affirmative Action	502
28.6 Legacy Admissions	505
28.7 A Brief Summary of the Affirmative Action Debate	506
 References	 507
Index	530

FIGURES

1.1	United States: annual earnings, 2018	page 9
1.2	New York teacher shortage	11
2.1	Example of correlational analysis	24
4.1	The demand curve	47
4.2	The supply curve	47
4.3	Supply and demand equilibrium	48
4.4	Shifts in supply and demand and new equilibria	48
4.5	Marginal product and wages	49
4.6	Demand for and supply of human capital	52
4.7	Varying supply of and demand for human capital	53
5.1	Ratios of 25- to 34-year-old workers with BA equivalent and postgraduate degrees relative to secondary graduates	57
5.2a	United States: age–mean earnings profiles, non-Hispanic White male, 2017	58
5.2b	United States: age–mean earnings profile, non-Hispanic White female, 2017	58
5.3	United States: longitudinal age–earnings profiles, non-Hispanic White males, 1995	60
7.1	Separate equilibria in the signaling model	91
8.1	United States: annual earnings, male and female, non-Hispanic White workers, 2018	105
8.2	United States: annual mean earnings, male, African-American and non-Hispanic White workers, 2018	108
8.3	United States: longitudinal real annual mean earnings, African-American and non-Hispanic White male workers, 2016	109
10.1	Pre-tax/transfer and post-tax/transfer Gini coefficients (* 100), Europe and Latin America	135
10.2	Supply and demand for human capital under public provision of mass education	138
10.3	Income distribution (Gini coefficient), second decade 2000s, and distribution of cognitive skills (PIAAC numeracy score), 2012–2018	140
10.4	Argentina, Brazil, and Mexico: income distribution (Gini coefficient), 1992–2018	143
11.1a	Baltimore City school sample: initial reading literacy test score and literacy achievement gains	155
11.1b	Baltimore City school sample: sources of gaps in 9th grade reading literacy test score	155
11.2	United States: Black–White gap in long-term NAEP reading scores, 1975–2012	156
11.3	A model of educational production	159

11.4	Isoquants of student mathematics gains using class size and teacher math knowledge as inputs	163
11.5	Iso-costs of class size and teacher math knowledge as inputs under a given budget constraint	164
11.6	Isoquants and iso-costs for two inputs, one output production function	165
11.7	Two output model of isoquants of student mathematics gain using class size and teacher math knowledge as inputs	166
11.8	Production possibilities frontier	167
12.1	A conceptual framework for the education production process	171
14.1	Skills, behaviors, and attainment across childhood	203
14.2	United States: percentage of 3- to 4-year-olds enrolled in preschool by race/ethnicity	207
14.3	Percentage of 3- to 4-year-olds enrolled in ECE, by country, 2019	208
15.1	Percentage of upper secondary school students, 15- to 19-year-olds, enrolled in VET programs, by country, 2018	217
16.1	Women teachers as a proportion of total teachers, by level of schooling, selected countries, 2015–2018	236
16.2	The local school district as a monopsony of teacher labor	237
17.1	Teacher supply in two different schools	254
18.1	United States: nominal and inflation-adjusted real mean combined primary and secondary teacher salary, 1959–2017	260
18.2	OECD: inflation-adjusted index of real mean primary and secondary teacher salaries for teachers with 15 years' experience, 2005–2019	261
18.3	United States: teacher wage gap compared to other college-educated workers, by gender, 1979–2021	262
18.4	Teacher wage premia across twenty-three countries, 2012–2015	265
18.5	Ratio of teacher to scientist salaries at 35 years old, by country, 2000–2006	266
18.6	Uniform salary schedule and the supply and demand for math and language teachers	268
18.7	North Carolina: student test scores and teacher years of experience, by subject taught	269
19.1	United States: median annual earnings, females with BA degrees, by age and occupation, 2000	280
19.2	Chinese Taipei: median monthly earnings, females with BA degrees, by age and occupation, 2004	281
20.1	Increasing quality of education by regulating increased demand for quality	292
20.2a	United States, Texas, and North Carolina: White NAEP 4th grade math scale scores, 1992–2019	302
20.2b	United States, Texas, and North Carolina: Black NAEP 4th grade math scale scores, 1992–2019	302
20.2c	United States, Texas, and North Carolina: Hispanic 4th grade NAEP math scale scores, 1992–2019	303

20.3a	United States, Texas, and North Carolina: White NAEP 8th grade math scale scores, 1990–2019	303
20.3b	United States, Texas, and North Carolina: Black NAEP 8th grade math scale scores, 1990–2019	304
20.3c	United States, Texas, and North Carolina: Hispanic NAEP 8th grade math scale scores, 1990–2019	304
21.1	Public school monopoly rent argument	319
21.2	Chile: PER (1982–1984) and SIMCE math and language test score, 1982–1996	329
21.3a	NAEP 8th grade Black students' math scores, large urban school districts, 2009–2022	332
21.3b	NAEP 8th grade Black students' reading scores, large urban school districts, 2009–2022	332
21.4	Public supply and institutional demand for achievement gain	339
A.1	Supply of labor, males	342
A.2	Supply of labor, females	343
A.3	Supply of parent time for child intellectual development	343
A.4	Adjusted supply of parent time for child development	343
23.1	Ratio of public spending per student in higher education to primary education, 2000–2017, selected countries	373
24.1	Log net enrollment rate and log public educational spending per secondary student as a percent of GDP/capita, 2016–2017	389
24.2	United States: NAEP mathematics LTT scale scores, 9-, 13-, and 17-year-old Black and Hispanic students, 1973–2012	393
24.3	United States: annual social class adjusted gains in NAEP 8th grade math scores and annual increases in current spending/pupil, 1992–2013	395
24.4	Event and difference-in-differences analysis of relative spending increases	398
24.5	Chile: student 4th grade math achievement trends, private subsidized eligible schools treated four years vs. private eligible schools treated one year, 2002–2011	402
25.1	Higher education gross enrollment ratio (GER), 1970–2020, by regions	413
25.2a	United States: real wage growth by education and gender, full-time employed, 25- to 64-year-olds, 1979–1989 and 1989–1998	415
25.2b	United States: real median income growth by education and gender, 1999–2019, 25- to 34-year-olds, full-time employed	415
25.2c	United States: real median income growth by education and gender, 1999–2019, 35- to 44-year-olds, full-time employed	416
25.3	Growth in the demand and supply of skills in endogenous skill growth model	416
26.1	OECD: total expenditure on tertiary education by educational institutions per full-time equivalent student	424

26.2	OECD: relative share of private expenditure (all sources) in total spending on higher education institutions	425
26.3	A model of forces affecting public/private higher education expansion	426
26.4	Latin America: proportion of tertiary higher education enrollment in private institutions, 1998/2000–2018	429
26.5a	United States: proportion of total revenues of higher education institutions from public sources, by type of institution, 1970–2018	433
26.5b	United States: tuition as proportion of total revenues of higher education institutions, by type of institution, 1970–2018	434
26.6	United States: absolute real average higher education tuition and fees charged, by type of institution, 1970–2018	435
26.7	Russia: higher education enrollment in public (fully subsidized and fee-paying) and private institutions, 1995–2017	440
26.8	United States: mean percentile SAT/ACT score of colleges, 1962–2007, by colleges' selectivity in 1962	445
26.9	Measuring productivity of tiers of higher education institutions relative to the least selective group of institutions	446
26.10	China: spending per student by type of institution, 1994–2018	450
26.11	Russia: estimated public spending per “budget place” student in public higher education, by category of university, 2013–2018	450
27.1	Production possibility frontier and efficiency measurement	459
28.1	United States: academic labor supply	479
28.2	United States: total fall enrollment, 1980–2020, by type of institution	481
28.3	United States: total first time undergraduate fall enrollment, by type of institution, 2002 and 2012	482
28.4	United States: average salary for full-time professors on nine-month contracts, by rank and type of higher education institution, 2020–2021	484
28.5a	United States: average salary for full-time professor rank faculty on nine-month contracts, by type of higher education institution, 1999–2000 and 2020–2021	486
28.5b	United States: average salary for full-time assistant professor rank faculty on nine-month contracts, by type of higher education institution, 1999–2000 and 2020–2021	487
28.6	Simulated faculty salaries for selected academic disciplines, by gender	490
28.7	Entry-level, average, and top-level academic monthly salary in 2010, by country	493
28.8a	Example of demand and supply analysis of higher education market for higher-ability students from higher and lower social class families	500
28.8b	Example of demand and supply analysis of higher education market for low-ability students from higher and lower social class families	501

TABLES

6.1	United States: mean annual earnings, by level of education and age, non-Hispanic White males, 2017 (current dollars)	<i>page 72</i>
6.2	United States: mean earnings, by education and age, non-Hispanic White males, 2017	73
8.1	United States: age-earnings profiles, BA degree completers, by sex and race/ethnicity, full-time, full-year workers, 2017 (current dollars)	113
12.1	Estimates of learner mathematics achievement and achievement gain as a function of teacher characteristics, school characteristics, and country effects in Botswana, Kenya, and South Africa, 2009 (un-weighted student achievement and achievement gain standardized across all three countries)	184
12.2	New York City: estimated effect sizes for teacher credentials, student math achievement gains, grades 4–5 with student fixed effects, 2000–2005	186
13.1	Average effect sizes for four interventions in elementary grades, 1970s	195
13.2	Average ECRs for four interventions in elementary grades, 1970s (effect size for each \$100 cost/student)	196
22.1	Public expenditures on education as a percentage of GDP, 1998, 2008, and 2017/2018, and GDP growth rate, 1998–2018, by selected country (percent)	350
22.2	Private expenditures on education as a percentage of GDP, 2008, and 2017/2018, and percent private enrollment 2018, by level of education and selected countries (percent)	353
23.1	Public educational expenditure per student as percent of GDP per capita, by level of education, 1999/2001 and 2015/2017, by selected countries (percent)	370
23.2	Growth in enrollment by level of education, 1999/2001 to 2017/18, selected countries (base year =100)	371
23.3	Types of educational systems characterized by concentration of educational finance and management	381
24.1	Estimated PISA 2018 math and reading achievement related to 2017 public spending on secondary education as percent of GDP/capita, across countries	396
25.1	Enrollment in tertiary education per 100,000 population, by country, 1920–2018 (total tertiary-level students enrolled/100,000 population)	411
25.2	A taxonomy of goods and services	421
26.1	Post-Soviet countries: proportion of students paying tuition fees, 1995–2015 (percent)	441
26.2	United States: instructional costs per student, tuition fees, and SAT mathematics scores, by type of institution, 2005–2019	449
26.3	A higher education financing strategy based on private and social rates of return	456