

Herausgegeben im Auftrag der Rechtswissenschaftlichen Fakultät  
der Universität Zürich von G. Biaggini, O. Diggelmann, T. Gächter, A. Glaser,  
A. Griffel, C. Kaufmann, H. Keller, R. Kiener, A. Kley, R. Matteotti,  
D. Moeckli, M. Oesch, J. Reich, M. Simonek und F. Uhlmann

**Marie-Hélène Peter-Spiess**

**Food regulation and public health:  
the case of sugar**

# Table of contents

Acknowledgments.....	VII
Content overview .....	IX
Table of contents.....	XI
Abbreviations.....	XXI
Bibliography .....	XXIX
Reports and guidelines.....	XLIX
Parliamentary objects .....	LXI
Legislation .....	LXV
Internet sources .....	LXXI

<b>Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
I. Introductory remarks .....	3
II. Research interest and delimitations .....	7
III. Thesis structure.....	9
IV. Methodology.....	10

## **Part 1: The case against sugar—Notions, foundations, and challenges .....**

**13**

<b>A. Sugar, noncommunicable diseases, and the need for action .....</b>	<b>15</b>
I. History and notion of sugar .....	15
1. Historical perspectives on sugar.....	15
2. Sugar: a definition .....	16
II. The global burden of noncommunicable diseases.....	18
1. The noncommunicable disease pandemic .....	18

2.	Risk factors for noncommunicable diseases.....	20
3.	Urgency to act on the global threat of noncommunicable diseases.....	21
III.	Link between sugar and noncommunicable diseases .....	22
1.	Sugar as a risk factor for noncommunicable diseases .....	22
2.	Recommendations to reduce sugar intake .....	24
IV.	Need for action .....	25
1.	The public health case for regulating sugar.....	25
2.	Sugar: an economic burden .....	27
3.	Absence of international legal framework .....	28
4.	Legal framework in Switzerland: a gap to fill .....	31
4.1	Swiss legislation on foodstuffs.....	31
4.2	Absence of a specific Swiss legislation targeting sugar .....	32
4.3	Voluntary approach by Swiss authorities .....	33
4.4	Recent developments: Discreet advances or mighty setback? .....	36
4.5	Need for additional binding or nonbinding measures .....	38
V.	Concluding remarks.....	39
<b>B.</b>	<b>Legitimation of regulation .....</b>	<b>43</b>
I.	Preliminary remarks .....	43
II.	General justifications for regulation.....	44
1.	Public health as a state duty.....	44
1.1	Notion of public health .....	44
1.2	Grounding in public health ethics.....	45
1.3	Protection of public health in Switzerland .....	46
2.	Prevention.....	46
2.1	Notion of prevention.....	47
2.2	Delimitation from the precautionary principle .....	47
2.3	Prevention and precautionary principles under Swiss law .....	48
2.4	The draft Federal Act on Health Prevention and Promotion: A failed attempt at further regulating prevention for public health.....	51
III.	Legal foundations for regulation .....	51
1.	Swiss Constitutional foundations for regulation .....	52
1.1	Art. 118 Fed. Cst. on health protection .....	53
1.2	Other constitutional provisions.....	58
2.	International human rights and other legal foundations .....	62

2.1 International human rights foundations.....	62
a Right to health .....	63
b Human rights and the regulation of unhealthy foods .....	64
2.2 Other international law foundations .....	68
IV. Concluding remarks.....	68
<b>C. Objections to regulation .....</b>	<b>71</b>
I. Preliminary remarks .....	71
II. General objections to regulation.....	72
1. Legitimacy of measures tackling noncommunicable diseases called into question.....	72
2. The antipaternalism objection .....	73
3. Political and economic obstacles to regulation .....	75
III. Legal objections to regulation .....	76
1. Swiss fundamental rights at stake.....	76
1.1 Right to personal freedom .....	77
1.2 Right to privacy .....	79
1.3 Freedom of expression and information.....	81
1.4 Freedom of the media .....	82
1.5 Right to economic freedom .....	84
2. International legal objections to regulation .....	86
2.1 International human rights law .....	86
2.2 International trade law .....	87
2.3 Other international sources.....	89
IV. Tension between collective interests and individual rights.....	91
1. Conditions of restriction to fundamental rights.....	91
2. Legal basis .....	92
3. Public interest .....	93
4. Proportionality .....	95
4.1 Ability of measure .....	96
4.2 Necessity of measure.....	98
4.3 Proportionality in the strict sense .....	99
4.4 Outcome of proportionality test.....	100
5. Essence of fundamental rights as inviolable .....	102
6. Interim conclusion .....	103
V. Concluding remarks.....	104

## **Part 2: Measures to promote public health ..... 107**

<b>A. Public health governance instruments by the state.....</b>	<b>109</b>
I. Preliminary remarks .....	109
II. Taxation of sugar .....	110
1. Outline .....	110
1.1 Preliminary remarks .....	110
1.2 Political endeavors in favor of a sugar tax .....	111
a Interpellation by Ruth Humbel to the Federal Parliament.....	112
b Neuchâtel initiative to the Federal Parliament and counterproject to the Neuchâtel cantonal initiative in favor of a dental care insurance .....	112
c Motion by members of the Geneva parliament and initiatives by the Cantons of Geneva and Fribourg to the Federal Assembly.....	114
d Postulate by Valérie Piller Carrard to the Federal Council .....	118
e Attitude of Swiss authorities towards sugar taxation .....	119
2. International insights .....	119
2.1 History and development of sugar taxes.....	119
2.2 Efforts by the WHO.....	120
2.3 Current situation worldwide .....	122
3. Implementation and challenges .....	123
3.1 Application of the standard VAT rate to sugary foodstuffs supply .....	124
a Current functioning of VAT taxes and contemplated change .....	124
b Possible challenges to a change in VAT rate .....	125
3.2 Special consumption tax.....	128
a Possible implementation.....	128
b Possible challenges to special consumption tax .....	130
4. Concluding remarks.....	132
III. Measures relating to the production and the manufacturing of foodstuffs.....	133
1. Outline .....	133
1.1 Preliminary remarks .....	133
1.2 Current legislation on production and manufacturing of sugary foodstuffs .....	134
a Restrictions on sugar content for certain foodstuffs.....	134
b The Declaration of Milan: a voluntary industry commitment.....	135
1.3 Attempts at further regulating the production and manufacturing of sugary foodstuffs.....	137

a	Postulate Fehlmann Rielle to the National Council.....	137
b	Initiative by the Canton of Geneva to the Federal Assembly.....	138
c	Parliamentary initiative by Laurence Fehlmann Rielle to the National Council .....	140
d	Motion by Manuela Weichelt to the Federal Assembly.....	141
e	Attitude of Swiss authorities towards additional production and manufacturing constraints on sugary products.....	142
2.	International insights .....	142
3.	Implementation and challenges .....	145
3.1	Possible measures on the production and manufacturing of sugary foodstuffs .....	145
a	Further reduction of the sugar content in certain foodstuffs .....	145
b	Introducing regulated portion sizes of certain products .....	148
3.2	Legislative adaptations required for the adoption of production and manufacturing obligations targeting certain foodstuffs.....	149
4.	Concluding remarks.....	151
IV.	Labelling and packaging measures.....	152
1.	Outline .....	152
1.1	Preliminary remarks .....	152
1.2	Current legislation on food labelling and packaging.....	154
a	Important mandatory provisions on foodstuffs labelling and packaging <i>de lege lata</i> .....	154
b	Nutri-Score: a voluntary labelling system .....	160
c	Summary of relevant legislation on sugar labelling and packaging..	164
1.3	Attempts at further regulating sugar labelling and packaging.....	165
a	Postulate Tornare to the Federal Council .....	166
b	SSHC Nutri-Score postulate to the Federal Council .....	167
c	Postulate Bendahan to the Federal Council.....	168
d	Initiative by the Canton of Fribourg to the Federal Assembly .....	170
e	Attitude of Swiss authorities towards additional packaging and labelling duties on sugary products.....	173
2.	International insights .....	174
2.1	Efforts and available tools at international level .....	174
2.2	Labelling measures targeting foodstuffs around the world .....	176
2.3	Packaging measures targeting noncommunicable disease risk factors around the world.....	178
3.	Implementation and challenges .....	180

3.1	Legislative adaptations required for the adoption of further labelling and packaging constraints.....	180
3.2	Possible measures on the labelling and packaging of sugary foodstuffs: implementation and challenges .....	181
a	Implementing additional labelling constraints concerning sugar .....	182
b	Making Nutri-Score compulsory .....	184
c	Exploring the avenue of plain packaging for certain sugary products .....	186
4.	Concluding remarks.....	187
V.	Measures relating to marketing .....	189
1.	Outline .....	189
1.1	Preliminary remarks .....	189
1.2	Restrictions on the marketing of certain foodstuffs <i>de lege lata</i> .....	191
a	Mandatory restrictions on the marketing of certain foodstuffs .....	191
b	Swiss Pledge: a voluntary commitment to reduce food marketing targeting children .....	193
c	Summary of relevant legislation on food marketing .....	195
1.3	Attempts at introducing policies on the marketing of foodstuffs .....	195
a	Motion by Valérie Piller Carrard to the National Council .....	195
b	Neuchâtel initiative to the Federal Parliament .....	197
c	Interpellation by Hans Stöckli to the Council of States.....	197
d	Motion by Sophie Michaud Gigon to the National Council.....	198
e	Question by Olivier Feller to the National Council.....	200
f	Attitude of Swiss authorities towards new marketing restrictions for foodstuffs .....	200
2.	International insights .....	201
2.1	Guidance on the marketing of foodstuffs .....	201
2.2	Measures on food marketing around the world .....	204
3.	Possible measures, implementation, and challenges .....	206
3.1	Possible measures and implementation .....	206
a	General restrictions on the marketing of sugary foodstuffs .....	207
b	Restrictions on the marketing of sugary foodstuffs targeting minors.....	207
c	Prohibition of the marketing of sugary foodstuffs on certain platforms and sponsoring restrictions .....	209
d	Introducing health messages when broadcasting advertising.....	210

3.2 Possible challenges to the adoption of marketing restrictions .....	211
4. Concluding remarks.....	213
VI. Measures on sales and supply.....	214
1. Outline .....	214
1.1 Preliminary remarks .....	214
1.2 Restrictions on the sale and supply of certain foodstuffs <i>de lege lata</i> .....	215
1.3 Attempts at introducing policies on the sale and supply of foodstuffs .....	216
a Neuchâtel initiative to the Federal Parliament .....	217
b Interpellation by Laurence Fehlmann Rielle to the National Council .....	218
2. International insights .....	218
3. Implementation and challenges .....	220
3.1 Possible measures and implementation .....	220
a Restrictions regarding minors and supply .....	221
b Time restrictions on sales .....	222
c Restrictions on food layout.....	222
3.2 Possible challenges .....	223
4. Concluding remarks.....	224
VII. Concluding remarks on public health governance instruments by the state.....	225
<b>B. Voluntary measures and soft instruments .....</b>	<b>227</b>
I. Preliminary remarks .....	227
II. Current approach and foundations.....	228
1. The Swiss voluntary approach.....	228
2. Foundations .....	228
2.1 Human rights implementation and nonstate actors.....	229
2.2 Corporate social responsibility .....	230
III. Possible voluntary measures and other soft tools.....	231
1. Information, communication, training, and public awareness .....	232
1.1 Preliminary remarks .....	232
1.2 Current measures in place and endeavors towards additional ones .....	232
1.3 Possible further measures .....	234
2. Third-party certifications.....	235

2.1 Preliminary remarks .....	235
2.2 Available certifications.....	235
2.3 Possible measures .....	236
3. Nonfinancial reporting for large corporations .....	237
3.1 Health sustainability and the sugar consumption risk .....	237
3.2 Sustainability reporting currently in place.....	238
3.3 Possible new reporting options.....	240
IV. Concluding remarks on voluntary and soft measures.....	241

### **Part 3: Appreciation .....243**

<b>A. Binding state action, soft tools, and their interplay .....</b>	<b>245</b>
I. Preliminary remarks .....	245
II. Binding versus nonbinding measures .....	246
1. Advantages and drawbacks of hard law .....	246
2. Promises and perils of soft instruments .....	247
III. The delicate interplay between binding and nonbinding instruments .....	250
IV. Concluding remarks.....	251
<b>B. Reflections <i>de lege ferenda</i>.....</b>	<b>253</b>
I. Preliminary remarks .....	253
II. Proposed solutions at Swiss federal level.....	254
1. Hard law as an inevitable path to curbing sugar overconsumption? .....	254
2. Soft tools and voluntary initiatives as essential components of an effective sugar regulation .....	255
3. Additional factors to be considered.....	256
III. Need for a global response .....	258
1. Considering an approach beyond national frontiers and involving multiple stakeholders.....	258
2. Towards an international convention on sugar control?.....	259
IV. Concluding remarks.....	261

### **Conclusion .....263**

I. Recapitulation of the findings .....	265
---	-----

II. Need for further research..... 267

III. Closing remarks..... 268