

The Treaty on the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons

LEGAL CHALLENGES FOR MILITARY DOCTRINES
AND DETERRENCE POLICIES

JONATHAN L. BLACK-BRANCH

ISLAND - Foundation of International Society of Law
and Nuclear Disarmament



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	page xiii
<i>Preface</i>	xvii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xviii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xix
1 Changing the Status Quo in Nuclear Arms Control Law: The Treaty on the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons 2017	1
Introduction to the Book	1
A New Direction in International Disarmament Law	3
Toward Humanitarian Nuclear Disarmament	4
Legal Congruence with Existing Treaty Obligations	5
Universality under Customary International Law	6
Safeguards, Verification and Implementation	6
Nuclear Deterrence Policies and the Prohibition Treaty	7
Nuclear Defense Doctrines and Disarmament	7
A Bifurcated International Legal Infrastructure	8
Stigmatization Action	8
Toward Neo-Universalism	8
Obligations <i>Erga Omnes</i>	9
Conclusion: United We Stand, Divided We Fall	10
2 Adopting the Treaty on the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons 2017: A New Dawn, a New Deal, a New Direction in Nuclear Disarmament Law?	11
Introduction: The Evolution of Nuclear Disarmament Law	11
How and Why Did the New Treaty Arise?	12
The Process: Determined to Disarm	15
Outcome: The Treaty on the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons 2017	41
Conclusion	44

3	Humanitarian Nuclear Disarmament: Challenging the Status Quo through New Approaches to Legal Process, Purpose and Provisions	46
	Changing Times, Changing Voices?	47
	TPNW Provisions Contrasted with the NPT	67
	Impact on Nuclear Disarmament: Process, Purpose and Provisions	70
	Conclusion: Impact on Nuclear Disarmament	72
4	Legal Congruence with Existing Treaty Obligations: Toward Complementary or Competing Interests?	74
	A New Treaty toward Nuclear Nonproliferation?	74
	Legal Congruence with Existing Treaty Obligations	75
	Scope and Implementation of the CTBT: The Preparatory Commission for the Comprehensive Nuclear Test-Ban Preparatory Organization	86
	Treaty on the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons 2017	88
	NATO's Position Is Not Inconsistent with ICJ Jurisprudence	101
	Conclusion: Complementary or Competing Interests?	103
5	Customary International Law, <i>Opinio Juris</i> and State Practice Regarding the Treaty on the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons 2017: Toward Universality?	105
	Introduction: A New Direction in Nuclear Nonproliferation and Disarmament?	105
	Universality	105
	Wider State Participation, Treaty Legitimacy and Credibility	106
	NATO and Allies against the Prohibition Treaty	114
	Customary International Law, State Practice and <i>Opinio Juris</i>	116
	Doctrine of the Persistent Objector	119
	Nuclear-Weapon States: Disarmament and Ending the Arms Race or <i>vel non</i> ?	127
	Specially Affected States Doctrine	129
	<i>Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons, Advisory Opinion:</i> Customary Law	131
	Conclusion: Changing <i>Opinio Juris</i> ?	134
6	Treaty Safeguards, Verification and Implementation: A Simple-Ban Approach and a Need for Oversight	135
	Verification: Correctness and Completeness	135
	The Scope of Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons and Explosive Devices	136
	Verification under the TPNW	137
	A "Simple-Ban" Humanitarian Approach	137

	Verification Difficulties under the “Simple-Ban” Approach	138
	Effectiveness of the Prohibition Treaty	139
	Understanding Verification: Definition, Terms and Conditions	148
	Effectiveness, Transparency and Confidence Building	150
	Lessons Regarding Verification: Iran	151
	Lessons from the Chemical and Biological Convention Verifications	155
	The International Atomic Energy Agency Safeguards System and the Prohibition Treaty	156
	A Competent International Authority: Authority to Disarm and Dismantle	162
	Conclusions	166
7	Nuclear Deterrence Policies and the Prohibition Treaty: Disarmament Considerations	168
	Nuclear Weapons and the Theory of Deterrence	168
	Legal and Political Ramifications for NATO Members, Umbrella and Other States under the TPNW	177
	Forcing Nuclear Disarmament in NATO and Umbrella States?	183
	NATO, Umbrella and Other States	200
	Other Arrangements: The CSTO and SCO	200
	Analysis and Conclusions	201
8	Nuclear Defense Doctrines: Disarmament and Emerging Humanitarian Concerns	204
	The Threat of Force and the ICJ Advisory Opinion	206
	The Implementation of the TPNW and Its Potential for Change as to How Nuclear Weapons Are Perceived and Utilized around the World	226
	Conclusions	234
9	Competition, Fragmentation and Polarization: A Bifurcated International Legal Infrastructure Regarding the Nuclear Architecture and Regulation?	236
	The TPNW: Uniting Division	236
	The TPNW in the International Context	237
	Two Camps: Resolute States and Stalwart States	237
	Stalemate between Resolute and Stalwart States	243
	Nuclear-Weapon-Free Zones	266
	How the TPNW and NWFZs Might Interact	273
	The TPNW Creates a New NWFZ	276
	Conclusion	278

10	Stigmatization-Action and Changing Global Perceptions to Delegitimize and Eliminate Nuclear Weapons	280
	Stigmatization and Moral Traction	280
	Stigmatizing Nuclear Weapons	281
	Nuclear Weapons: Stigmatize, Deligitimize, Eliminate	284
	Conclusions: Stigmatize, Delegitimize, Eliminate	303
	A Call to Action to Overcome the Growing Schism	304
11	Toward Neo-Universalism: Toward a New Reality in International Law?	306
	Introduction	307
	Toward Universal Acceptance of a Non-Nuclear World	307
	Public and Government Support for Disarmament	309
	State Support for the TPNW	310
	Nuclear-Weapon States	310
	Nuclear-Armed States	314
	Non-Nuclear-Weapon States that Relinquished Nuclear Weapons	317
	Nuclear-Weapon-Free Kazakhstan, Ukraine and Belarus	317
	Africa: A Nuclear-Weapon-Free Zone	319
	Latin America and the Caribbean: A Nuclear-Weapon-Free Zone	321
	Non-Nuclear-Weapon States Living in Nuclear Fear	321
	EU Member States	324
	European Non-NWS NATO Members	324
	Other EU NATO States	325
	Anti-nuclear EU Members	326
	Ambivalent EU States	328
	Other States	329
	Public and Government Support for Disarmament	332
	A Shift from Realism to Universalism?	333
	Conclusion: Changing the Status Quo through Neo-Universalism	338
12	Obligations <i>Erga Omnes</i>: The Missing Link for Nuclear Nonproliferation and Disarmament Compliance	340
	What Are <i>Erga Omnes</i> Obligations?	341
	Does the International Community Currently Recognize any <i>Erga Omnes</i> Obligations?	346
	Why Are Nuclear Obligations Effective <i>Erga Omnes</i> ?	348
	How Should the International Community Enforce Nuclear Obligations <i>Erga Omnes</i> ?	370

How do Obligations <i>Erga Omnes</i> Act as a Link between the Goals of the TPNW and a Binding Legal Framework that NWS already Adhere to?	374
Summary and Conclusion	376
13 The Treaty on the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons within the Nuclear Nonproliferation and Security Architecture in International Law: From Grand Bargain to Grand Challenges with the Right to Nuclear Peace and Freedom from Nuclear Fear: Summaries and Conclusions	377
Toward New Approaches to Old Problems	377
From a Passive to an Active Role for TPNW States	384
The Nuclear Paradox	388
Human Rights Obligations to Peace and Freedom from Fear	392
Conclusions and Recommendations	404
Nuclear Declaration on the Right to Nuclear Peace and Freedom from Nuclear Fear 2028	412
<i>Index</i>	414