

How We Get Mendel Wrong, and Why It Matters

Challenging the Narrative
of Mendelian Genetics

Kostas Kampourakis



CRC Press

Taylor & Francis Group

Boca Raton London New York

CRC Press is an imprint of the
Taylor & Francis Group, an **informa** business

Contents

List of Figures	vii
List of Tables	xii
Preface: "Gregor Mendel, the First Geneticist"	xiii
About the Author	xx
Acknowledgments	xxi

PART I Anachronistic Mendelism

Chapter 1	Mendel Was not a Geneticist ahead of His Time	3
	The Stereotypical Narrative about Mendel's Work and Findings	3
	What Mendel Actually Wrote in "Experiments on Plant Hybrids"	7
	Mendel Did Not Discover the "Laws" of Heredity	14
Chapter 2	Mendel Was a Brilliant Experimentalist of His Time	21
	Mendel Was not ahead of His Time	21
	The Influence of the Moravian Socioeconomic Context and Breeding Practices	23
	The Influence of the Research Tradition of Late 18th- and Early 19th-Century Plant Hybridists	26
	The Influence of Vienna's Academic Botany	29
	The Nature of Fertilization: Mendel's Possible Contribution to the Science of His Time	32
Chapter 3	Speculating about Heredity	36
	Theories of Heredity of the Latter Half of the 19th Century	36
	Spencer's Speculations about Hereditary Particles	38
	Charles Darwin, "Pangenesis", and Continuous Variation	40
	"Pangenesis" Put to the Test	46
Chapter 4	The Path to Genetics	50
	Francis Galton and Discontinuous Variation	50
	The Advances in Cytology of the 1870s	57
	August Weismann and the "Germ Plasm"	60
Chapter 5	The Reification of the "Lonely Genius"	66
	Was Nägeli Really to Blame for Mendel's Neglect?	66
	Mendel's "Rediscovery" in 1900	72
	Bateson Finds "Mendelian Genetics"	77

PART II Social Mendelism

Chapter 6	Mendel's Great Defender	85
	Weldon Criticizes "Mendelism"	85
	Bateson Fights Back—Fiercely	89
	Treasuring Exceptions	94
	The Punnett Square	98
Chapter 7	Chromosomes, "Factors", and Genes	104
	A Chromosomal Basis for Heredity	104
	Chromosome Linkage	108
	From the Mendelian "Factors" to the "Gene" Concept	112
Chapter 8	"Mendelian" Eugenics	121
	Galton's Dream	121
	"Feeble-mindedness" Becomes a Mendelian Recessive Trait	127
	A Natural Experiment in the Study of "Feeble-mindedness"	132
	The War Against the "Feeble-minded"	136
Chapter 9	Geneticists' Attitudes Toward "Mendelian" Eugenics	148
	Geneticists Accepting Goddard's Mendelian Recessive Account of "Feeble-mindedness"	148
	Goddard's Theory under Attack	156
	Geneticists Criticizing the Mendelian Recessive Account of "Feeble-mindedness"	160
	On Scientists Being Eugenicists	168
Chapter 10	Mendelian Genetics and the Nazi Racial Hygiene	175
	U.S. Racism Meets Nazi Racial Hygiene	175
	Mendelian Genetics and the Nuremberg Laws	182
	Mendelian Genetics and the Teaching of Racial Science in Schools	187
	Conclusions: Emending the Teaching of School Genetics	199
	References	209
	Index	221