

Drawing Lots

*From Egalitarianism to Democracy in
Ancient Greece*

IRAD MALKIN
JOSINE BLOK

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>Preface Josine Blok, Irad Malkin</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgements Irad Malkin, Josine Blok</i>	xix
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xxi

Introduction: Irada Malkin Greeks Drawing Lots: The Practice and the Mindset of Egalitarianism	1
1. An egalitarian mindset	1
2. From egalitarianism to democracy	4
3. What is new about this book? The previous discussion of the field of inquiry	5
4. A mindset for drawing lots	10
5. Vocabulary and mindset	11
6. Portions and fairness	13
7. Equality and the “middle”	15
8. Mixture lotteries and the egalitarian mindset	17
9. Mixture, equivalence, and interchangeability	20
10. Did Greeks draw lots to divine the will of the gods?	21
11. The lot and democracy, ancient and modern	26
12. Contents and contours: Parts I and II	29

PART I IRAD MALKIN THE LOTTERY MINDSET: RELIGION AND SOCIETY

1. Lotteries Divine and Human: The World of the Homeric Epics	41
Endnote 1: The debate about the distribution of spoils in the <i>Iliad</i> and the <i>Odyssey</i>	82
Endnote 2: “Getting by lot” and the verb <i>lanchano</i>	91
<i>Lanchano</i> as simply “to get”?	92
Etymology	94
Endnote 3: Group distribution and the verb <i>dateomai</i> in Homer, Hesiod, and the <i>Homeric Hymns</i>	95
2. When Does the Lot Reflect the Will of the Gods? Lots, Oracles, Divination, and the Notion of <i>Moirai</i>	98
2.1 Lot oracles and divination	106
2.2 The god Hermes	108

2.3	The lot oracle at Delphi	113
2.4	Delphi: Themis, the Pythia, and the lot	114
2.5	Delphi: Beans used as lots	117
2.6	Delphi: Mythical history and oracular procedure	120
2.7	The oracle of Dodona	126
2.8	What is religious about lot oracles?	130
2.9	One's portion in life: <i>Moirai</i> between the concrete and the abstract	132
3.	Sacrifice and Feast: Social Values and the Distribution of Meat by Lot	138
3.1	The lot and the sacrifice: Frequency and ubiquity	138
3.2	Sacrifice, equality, and sharing in the city	139
3.3	Expressions of citizenship and belonging	141
3.4	Honorific shares	142
3.5	The lot, the victim destined for sacrifice, and the priests	144
3.6	The equal feast	146

PART II IRAD MALKIN
EQUAL AND FAIR:
INHERITANCE, COLONIZATION, AND MIXTURE

4.	Partible Inheritance by Lot	151
4.1	Brothers sharing an inheritance	151
4.2	Equality versus primogeniture	153
4.3	The <i>oikos</i> and the <i>kleros</i>	155
4.4	Inheritance at home and abroad	157
4.5	Poetry and myth	161
5.	Drawing Lots on the Athenian Stage	163
5.1	Inheritance, sortition, booty, captives, and military procedures	163
5.2	The lot and Aeschylus's <i>Seven against Thebes</i>	169
6.	Founding Cities and Sharing in the <i>Polis</i> : Equality, Allotment, and Civic Mixture	176
6.1	Introduction	176
6.2	Section I: Things done	182
6.2.1	The setting: Greek colonization	182
6.2.2	Equal chances and equal outcomes: <i>Kleros</i> , inheritance, and colonization	188
6.2.3	The archaeology of <i>kleroi</i> in the archaic period	190
6.2.4	Egalitarianism and equality in a Greek colony	191
6.2.5	Territories and grids	192
6.2.6	Equal lots: Megara Hyblaea	195
6.2.7	Syracuse	204
6.2.8	Himera	205
6.2.9	Perimeters	207

6.2.10 Classical colonization	208
6.2.11 Athenian klerouchies	211
6.3 Section II: Things said: The lot, the “first plot,” equality, and the unity of the <i>kleros</i>	214
6.3.1 The First Lots articulated	219
6.3.2 First Lots: Inclusion and exclusion	222
6.3.3 First Lots and equality: Was there an aristocracy among Greek colonists?	223
6.3.4 First Lots and equality: Social and economic differentiation	229
6.3.5 Things said: The <i>kleros</i> and the <i>polis</i>	232
6.3.6 Quasihistorical accounts: Sparta and its colony Thera	237
6.3.7 Quasihistorical accounts: The great migrations	242
6.3.8 Religion and the distribution of <i>kleroi</i>	243
6.3.9 Equal and fair: <i>Isos kai homoios</i>	245
6.3.10 How to found a colony? Late archaic and classical inscriptions	247
6.3.11 Saving a <i>polis</i> : Lottery, mixture, and social engineering	256
Endnote 1: The <i>cui bono</i> argument and the ancient sources	260
Endnote 2: <i>Isomoiria</i>	261
Endnote 3: Women and the <i>kleros</i>	264
Endnote 4: Archaeology and “text-based information”	266

PART III JOSINE BLOK: DRAWING LOTS IN POLIS GOVERNANCE

7. Setting the Stage	271
7.1 Introduction	271
7.1.1 The lot becomes political	271
7.1.2 Agents, time frame, and sources	276
7.2 What did <i>poleis</i> use the lot for?	282
7.2.1 Divination	284
7.2.2 Selection	284
7.2.3 Distribution	286
7.2.4 Procedure	291
7.2.5 Military command: procedure and distribution	295
7.3 The political background of office distribution in ancient Greece	300
7.3.1 <i>Polis</i> offices and social value (<i>time</i>)	300
7.3.2 Drawing lots for office: A special case	306
7.3.3 Political inequality and equality in the Greek <i>poleis</i>	309
8. Drawing Lots for <i>Polis</i> Office	316
8.1 Introducing the lot for office	316
8.1.1 The lot in Solon's <i>politeia</i>	316
8.1.2 Solon's introduction of the lot: A first anchorage	322
8.1.3 Solon's <i>politeia</i> : The council and the court	326

8.2	Political divergence and patterns of allotment	328
8.2.1	Allotment for <i>polis</i> office in oligarchies	334
8.2.2	Democratic Athens	339
8.2.2.1	Cleisthenes's constitution	339
8.2.2.2	Did Cleisthenes reintroduce allotment for political office?	342
8.2.2.3	Forerunners of Cleisthenes's innovations	350
8.2.2.4	Reforms in the mid-fifth century: Toward full allotment	353
8.2.3	Selection for office by lot elsewhere in ancient Greece	363
8.2.3.1	Drawing lots for political office outside Athens	364
8.2.4	Drawing lots for cultic offices, in Athens and beyond	373
	Endnote 1: The historicity of Solon and his laws	379
	Endnote 2: The <i>Ath. Pol.</i> and the <i>Politics</i> on Solon's constitution	381
	Endnote 3: <i>Ath. Pol.</i> 8.1 on the procedure in Solon's <i>klerosis ek prokriton</i>	384
	Endnote 4: The vocabulary of the lot in the Ancient Near East	384
	Endnote 5: Solon's council of four hundred	385
	Endnote 6: The <i>diagramma</i> for Cyrene	386
	Endnote 7: The new body politic in Cleisthenes's system	388
	Endnote 8: Allotment tokens from Athens	389
9.	Drawing Lots for Governance: A Political Innovation	393
9.1	Drawing lots for <i>polis</i> governance: An evaluation	393
9.1.1	Ancient Greeks on selection for office by lot	393
9.1.2	What does selection for office by lot mean for <i>polis</i> governance? Some modern views	400
9.2	Conclusions: Drawing lots for <i>polis</i> governance in ancient Greece	404
	Endnote: James W. Headlam, <i>Election by Lot at Athens</i> (Prince Consort dissertation 1890; London 1891)	412

PART IV CONCLUSIONS AND ENVOI

Irad Malkin	Conclusions and Implications	419
1	The mindset: Antiquity, Ubiquity, and Religion	419
2	Equality and fairness	423
3	Group definition	424
4	The will of the gods	424
5	Lot oracles	425
6	Frequency, ubiquity, and sacrifice	426
7	Partible inheritance by lot	428
8	New foundations	430
9	Cleisthenes and the constitutive lottery	437
10	Our modern democracies	438

Josine Blok Envoi: Drawing Lots Today: Fair Distribution and a Stronger Democracy	441
<i>Elena Iaffe Appendix: A Lexicographical Survey of Lottery Practices in the Archaic and Classical Periods</i>	447
Lexicographic overview of the key terms of lottery	448
1. Instruments used in lottery practices	448
2. Words indicating a participant in a lottery	449
3. Words for the procedure of drawing lots	449
4. Verbs of lottery practices	450
(a) Verbs related to the participants of a lottery	450
(b) Verbs indicating the type of lottery	451
(c) Verbs related to the procedure itself, e.g., the action “of” or “upon” the instrument of drawing lots	452
5. The semantic fields of the disputed key terms of lottery: <i>lanchano</i> and <i>kleros</i>	453
6. List of references for key lottery terms in archaic and classical Greek literature and inscriptions	459
Key lottery terms, excluding metaphoric usages	459
Metaphoric and idiomatic usages of lottery terms	461
Epigraphic evidence for lottery, excluding metaphorical usages (a selection up to the end of the fourth cent.)	461
<i>Bibliography</i>	463
<i>Index of Names and Places</i>	505