
Christophe Georges

**Corporate Governance
and Corporate Social
Responsibility:
How to Tackle
Environmental Imperatives
in Company Law?**

Legal and Management Perspectives



Stämpfli Publishers

EXTENDED TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	v
Summary of the Thesis	vii
Glossary	xxi
GENERAL INTRODUCTION	1
1 Purpose of Research	3
1.1 Research objectives	3
1.2 Grounds of research	5
1.2.1 Natural resources and the tragedy of the commons	5
1.2.2 Exacerbation of the issue and time pressure	7
1.2.3 Reflection on the need for a collectivist system	9
2 Frame of Analysis	13
2.1 Multinational companies	13
2.2 Planetary sustainability and corporate sustainability	16
2.3 The role of water in our Thesis	18
2.3.1 A representative for the sustainability discussion	21
Vitality aspect	22
Economic aspect	23
Accessibility aspect	25
2.3.2 Parallels between data, water, and the environment	26
2.3.3 Definitions and relevant uses of water	28
2.3.4 Irrelevance of water regulations for our Thesis	29
2.4 CSR apprehension	30

3 Methodological and Philosophical Aspects 33

3.1 Focus on company law 33

 3.1.1 Reasons for considering company law 33

 3.1.2 The relevance of Swiss company law 36

 3.1.3 Functions and goals of company law 41

 3.1.4 Contours and apprehension of company law 43

3.2 Management codirection 45

 3.2.1 Methodology, structure, and literature imports 45

 3.2.2 Spotlight on social systems theory 47

4 Structure of the Thesis 53

I CORPORATE GOVERNANCE AND CORPORATE SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY 57

1 Two Sides of the Same Coin 59

1.1 Preliminary note on sustainable finance and the ESG acronym . . . 61

1.2 Corporate social responsibility and its evolution 64

 1.2.1 Definition and description 64

 1.2.2 Evolution and implementation 68

 1.2.3 The benefits of CSR 72

1.3 Corporate governance and its evolution 76

 1.3.1 Emergence, contours and description 76

 1.3.2 Our definition of corporate governance 80

 1.3.3 The benefits of good corporate governance 81

1.4 Linkages between CSR and corporate governance 84

 1.4.1 Internal and external dimensions 84

 1.4.2 Backward-looking and forward-looking dimensions 86

 1.4.3 Consideration of a wide spectrum of actors 87

 1.4.4 Emphasis on corporate culture, values, and purpose 89

 1.4.5 Risk management perspective 91

 1.4.6 Role of transparency and communication 93

 1.4.7 Compliance as a central notion 95

1.5 Unification of CSR and corporate governance 98

SYNOPSIS OF THE CHAPTER 101

2	Challenges and Instruments of CSR and Corporate Governance	103
2.1	Practical issues in the deployment of CSR	103
2.2	Relationship between soft law and hard law instruments	105
2.2.1	Notions	105
2.2.2	Complementarity of soft and hard law approaches	106
2.3	Comply or explain principle and its variants	111
2.4	Management instruments	115
2.4.1	Corporate and supply chain codes of conduct	115
2.4.2	CSR reports	117
2.5	Law instruments	120
2.5.1	Internationally	121
	UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights	122
	OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises	124
	UN binding treaty on business and human rights	126
	Other international instruments and developments	127
2.5.2	In Europe	132
	Green Taxonomy	133
	Reporting and transparency instruments	133
	Supply chain accountability instruments	136
2.5.3	In Switzerland	137
	Swiss Code of Best Practice for Corporate Governance	137
	SIX Corporate Governance Directive	139
	Swiss Responsible Business Initiative	140
	Other Swiss instruments and developments	141
2.6	Function of CSR in today's global world order	142
	SYNOPSIS OF THE CHAPTER	147
3	The Shareholder vs Stakeholder Governance Paradigm	149
3.1	Introducing and contextualising the debate	150
3.2	Deconstructing and understanding the debate	156
3.2.1	First layer: means vs ends	156
3.2.2	Second layer: law vs management	157
3.2.3	Third layer: opposition vs conciliation	160
3.3	Reconstructing and instrumentalising the debate	162
3.3.1	Legal vs non-legal drivers of compliance	162
3.3.2	Collectivist vs individualistic models of governance	164
3.3.3	Long-term vs short-term governance	165
3.4	CSR, corporate governance, and the sustainability challenge	169
	SYNOPSIS OF THE CHAPTER	175

II ENVIRONMENTAL IMPERATIVES AND SOCIO-ECONOMIC CHALLENGES: AN ILLUSTRATION THROUGH THE WORLD WATER CRISIS 177

1	Issues Related to the World Water Crisis	179
1.1	Introductory notions and numbers	180
1.1.1	Volume of fresh water available on Earth	180
1.1.2	Water use terminology	181
1.1.3	Shares of global water use per sector	181
1.2	The complexity in tackling the water resource	182
1.2.1	Multiple uses and multi-level governance	182
1.2.2	The different values of water	183
	Economic value	184
	Political and emotional value	185
1.2.3	Global issue but local manifestation	186
1.3	Problems related to water accessibility	188
1.3.1	Water scarcity	188
1.3.2	Water disparity	190
1.3.3	Water quality and pollution	191
1.3.4	Groundwater overexploitation	194
1.4	Challenges related to agriculture and the food system	196
1.4.1	Introductory notions and numbers	197
1.4.2	Water, food, and energy nexus	198
1.4.3	Food wastage and loss	202
1.5	Drivers and alleviators of the water crisis	206
1.5.1	Drivers of the crisis	206
	Demographics	207
	Climate change	209
1.5.2	Alleviators of the crisis	212
	Technology	212
	Societal dynamics and consumptive behaviors	214
1.6	Implications for society	215
	SYNOPSIS OF THE CHAPTER	219

2	Questionings on the Appropriate Model of Governance	221
2.1	Environmental imperatives and risk management	222
2.1.1	The strategic need for stewardship: the water example	223
2.1.2	Physical risks	225
2.1.3	Reputational risks	227
	Spillover effects	228
	NGOs' activism	229
	Alternative dispute resolution and confidentiality	230
2.1.4	Legal risks	231
	Regulatory risks	232
	Political risks	233
2.1.5	Implications for the broader environmental discussion	235
2.2	Requirements of an end state of sustainability	238
2.2.1	The need for international considerations	239
2.2.2	The need for supply chain engagement (vertically)	240
2.2.3	The need for collective action (horizontally)	242
2.2.4	The need to recognize the value of nature	244
2.3	The need for a stakeholder-value model of governance?	246
	SYNOPSIS OF THE CHAPTER	249

III ASSESSMENT OF THE CURRENT GOVERNANCE FRAMEWORK : A COMPANY LAW PERSPECTIVE

251

1	Contextualisation: CSR and the Issue of Corporate Groups	253
1.1	Preliminary note: CSR, the environment, and human rights	254
1.2	Overview of the issue of corporate groups	256
1.3	Analytical framework: various dimensions at play	261
1.3.1	Parent vs subsidiary companies' obligations	262
1.3.2	Damage caused to vs by a subsidiary	265
1.3.3	Internal vs external responsibility	266
1.3.4	Public vs private law actions for liability	267
1.3.5	Confusion of companies vs liability for own actions	269
1.3.6	Actions against parent vs subsidiary company	271
1.3.7	Sectoral vs general approaches to regulation	275
1.4	Environmental and human rights corporate due diligence	278
1.4.1	Defining due diligence	278
1.4.2	Dualism between due diligence and liability	283

1.4.3 Links with reporting 285

1.5 Methodology and structure: analysis of theory and practice 288

SYNOPSIS OF THE CHAPTER 291

2 Corporate CSR-Related Liabilities (Legal Persons) 293

2.1 Comparative overview of corporate CSR-related liabilities 294

2.1.1 Developments at national levels 296

2.1.2 Excursus: the UK approach 301

 Piercing the corporate veil 301

 Tort claims against parent companies 302

2.1.3 Developments at the EU level 305

 Non-financial reporting requirements 306

 Due diligence and accountability requirements 309

2.1.4 Note on developments at the global level 313

2.2 Timeline and overview of developments in Switzerland 315

2.3 The baseline applicable regime in Swiss law 319

2.3.1 Substantive aspects 320

2.3.2 Procedural aspects 323

 Jurisdiction issues 323

 Applicable law 326

 Foreign judgement recognition 329

2.3.3 Summary of potential issues and observations 330

2.4 The Responsible Business Initiative (rejected) 334

2.5 The counter-proposals to the Initiative 339

2.5.1 Final counter-proposal (entered into force) 340

 Non-financial information reporting 341

 Conflict minerals and child labour due diligence 342

 Observations and comments on liabilities 346

2.5.2 Initial counter-proposal (abandoned) 347

2.6 Note on the advent of climate change litigation 352

2.7 Excursus: exploring the criminal liability route 353

2.7.1 Comparative overview 353

2.7.2 Swiss regime 354

2.7.3 The international 'ecocide' crime lead 358

2.8 Positioning on the regime and its proposed reforms 359

SYNOPSIS OF THE CHAPTER 363

3	Directors' CSR-Related Liabilities (Natural Persons)	365
3.1	Framework of analysis and scope of focus	366
3.1.1	Various dimensions at play	367
3.1.2	Working hypotheses and focus on the duty of care	368
3.1.3	Other provisions relevant in the CSR context	370
	External representation of organs	370
	Inalienable and non-transferable obligations	371
	Non-financial reporting and sectoral due diligence	373
3.2	Theoretical aspects: duty of care and establishing liability	374
3.2.1	Constellation of claims, courses of action, and hurdles	374
3.2.2	Interpreting the interests of the company	380
	The law	381
	The case law	382
	The doctrine	385
3.2.3	The 'business judgment rule'	391
3.2.4	Implications: the vast leeway of the board	393
3.2.5	Enshrining the purpose in the articles of association	396
3.2.6	Abandoned recent reforms, and potential developments	399
3.3	Practical aspects and reality: capacity for effective sanction	402
3.3.1	Unattractiveness of the legal liability route	402
3.3.2	Legal mechanisms used in practice	403
3.3.3	Real stakes: the nature of the shareholding	406
3.4	Excursus: the UK approach	411
3.5	Positioning and discussion on the regime	416
	SYNOPSIS OF THE CHAPTER	421
4	Characteristics of the Current Model of Governance	423
4.1	Assessment of the theoretical, positive framework	424
4.1.1	Summary of previous observations and discussion	424
4.1.2	A shareholder model not mandated by company law	430
	Context and definitions	430
	Evolution of the corporate governance debate	432
	Flaws in the shareholder model conception of the firm?	434
4.1.3	A shareholder model practically mandated	440
	Asymmetry between shareholders and stakeholders	441
	Influence from financial markets and recent reforms	444
	Note on the autopoiesis of the shareholder model	451
4.2	Further practical considerations	454

4.2.1	The reality of the imperfection of the law	455
4.2.2	Law activation strategies: general presentation	456
4.2.3	Law activation strategies: typology and examples	459
	Fulfilment	459
	Passivity	460
	Misappropriation	462
	Bypass	464
	Innovation	466
4.2.4	Excursus: parallels with theories in management	468
4.3	A system effectively rooted in the shareholder value model	471
	SYNOPSIS OF THE CHAPTER	475

IV BRIDGING THE SUSTAINABILITY GAP THROUGH COMPANY LAW: ASSESSMENT, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND CONCLUSION 477

1	The Potential Governance Gap, The Law, and Market Forces	479
1.1	Mismatch between required and current modes of governance? . .	480
1.2	Functions and dimensions of a normative system	483
1.2.1	Characteristics and functions of the law	484
1.2.2	'Top-down' vs 'bottom-up' dimensions of the law	486
1.3	Law's responsiveness to (society's) environmental concerns	488
1.3.1	Governments' pledges as legal drivers	490
1.3.2	The advent of environmental civil disobedience	492
1.3.3	Responsiveness at the legislative and executive levels	494
1.3.4	Responsiveness at the judiciary level	497
	Litigation in connection to civil disobedience	501
	Litigation against national governments	503
	Litigation against corporate actors	505
1.4	Financial markets and the push towards 'stakeholderism'	508
1.4.1	Preliminary note: elements of confusion	509
	The different actors involved	509
	The two facets of ESG investing	510
1.4.2	The declared push towards stakeholder capitalism	513
	Global shift in rhetoric and landmark statements	513
	Changes throughout the cascade of market participants . . .	514
	ESG capital flows, assets, and related caveats	521

1.4.3	Criticisms and doubts, and market responses	526
	Risk of green bubble and unintended effects	527
	Greenwashing concerns	532
1.4.4	Regulatory reactions and responses	551
	Internationally	551
	In Europe	553
	In Switzerland	561
1.4.5	The advent of common ownership and systematic risk . . .	563
1.5	Implications - the respective roles of the law and the market	566
1.5.1	Views on the stated paradigm shift in governance	566
1.5.2	The fundamental normative question going forward	572
1.5.3	Avenues to bridge the potential governance gap	574
	Overview of the avenues considered	574
	Tradeoffs and costs at play	578
	Methodological treatment of the transparency norm	581
1.5.4	The 'minimal layer of law' underpinning all avenues	586
	SYNOPSIS OF THE CHAPTER	589

2 Company-Law Avenues to Bridge the Governance Gap 591

2.1	Preliminary note: hybrid options and unintended effects	593
2.1.1	Presentation of hybrid options	593
	'Comply or explain' and 'apply and explain'	594
	Executive remuneration	594
	Stakeholder advisory committee	595
	Election (total or partial) of the board by stakeholders	596
2.1.2	Examples of unintended effects and design challenges	598
2.2	The transparency norm ('bottom-up' approach)	601
2.2.1	Presentation and philosophy	601
2.2.2	Overview of possible options and design challenges	605
	Mandatory integrated non-financial reporting	605
	Green bonds	608
	'Say on Climate'	614
2.2.3	Incompleteness of the transparency norm?	616
2.3	The legal liability norm ('top-down' approach)	624
2.3.1	Presentation and philosophy	624
2.3.2	Overview of possible options and design challenges	626
	Group and supply chain liability mechanisms	626
	Reforming directors' duty of care and loyalty	630

	Duty of care and loyalty for shareholders	634
2.3.3	Ineffectiveness of the legal liability norm?	637
2.4	The institutional shift ('inside-out' approach)	644
2.4.1	Presentation and philosophy	644
2.4.2	Overview of possible options and design challenges	649
	The corporation as commons	650
	Pro rata unlimited liability for torts	656
	Other measures	664
2.4.3	Practical impossibility of the institutional shift?	667
2.5	The 'Realigned Shareholder Model' ('refocus' approach)	673
2.5.1	Presentation and philosophy	675
2.5.2	Overview of possible options and design challenges	680
	Options connected to but not belonging to the RSM	681
	Voting obligations	683
	System of loyalty shares	688
2.5.3	The case of environmental activist shareholders	697
2.5.4	The RSM as the most promising approach?	704
2.6	Management literature insights	714
2.6.1	Theoretical foundations	714
2.6.2	Application to our Work	718
2.6.3	Excursus: ESG and sustainable finance	725
2.7	Closing remarks and recommendations	729
	SYNOPSIS OF THE CHAPTER	736
3	General Conclusion, Contributions, and Closing Thoughts	737
3.1	General conclusion	738
3.1.1	Review of our main findings	738
3.1.2	Further reflections	750
3.2	Contributions and limitations	754
3.2.1	Analytical contributions	755
	Integration of legal and management perspectives	755
	Use of Swiss law as global reflection point	756
	Provision of conceptual frameworks of analysis	758
	Temporal dimension as a reflection point	761
	Deconstruction and reconstruction approach	763
	Use of water as a representative	764
3.2.2	Substantive contributions	765
	Identification of a potentiality for a governance gap	765

Identification of four company law avenues for reforms . . .	766
Identification of various types of risks and interactions . . .	767
Comparative analyses with UK law	768
Critical view on the operation of the law	769
3.2.3 Limitations	769
3.3 Closing thoughts: widening the debate beyond company law . . .	772
3.3.1 Company law as part of a wider system	772
3.3.2 Excursus: parallels with international law	773
Individualistic vs collectivist interests	773
Law activation strategies	777
General bibliography	781
Legislation, regulations, and related communications	885
Judgements and case law	897
Extended table of contents	905