

Contextualising Legal Research

A Methodological Guide

Sanne Taekema

Professor of Legal Theory, Erasmus School of Law, Erasmus University Rotterdam, The Netherlands, and Adjunct Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Bergen, Norway

Wibren van der Burg

Professor of Legal Philosophy and Legal Theory, Erasmus School of Law, Erasmus University Rotterdam, The Netherlands

ELGAR STUDIES IN LEGAL RESEARCH METHODS



Edward Elgar
PUBLISHING

Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>Permissions to reprint</i>	xiii
PART I DOCTRINAL RESEARCH	
1 Introduction: Methodology of legal research	2
1.1 Why research methods?	2
1.2 Legal practice and academic legal research: Different purposes and methods	6
1.3 Knowledge and understanding	8
1.4 Doctrinal research: Collection of materials, interpretation and reconstructive analysis	9
1.5 Law-in-context research	12
1.6 Interdisciplinary doctrinal research	14
1.7 Background and philosophical presuppositions of this book	16
1.8 Aims and outline of this book	19
2 Relative autonomy: A characterisation of doctrinal legal scholarship	22
2.1 Introduction	22
2.2 First characteristic: Oriented towards professional practice	23
2.3 Second characteristic: Both descriptive and normative	27
2.4 Third characteristic: An internal perspective	31
2.5 Fourth characteristic: The methods of the humanities	36
2.6 Characterising doctrinal scholarship in relation to law: Relative autonomy	42
3 Methods of doctrinal research	44
3.1 Introduction	44

3.2	Research objectives	45
3.3	State of the art and theoretical framework	51
3.4	Research questions and subquestions	55
3.5	Collection of research materials	62
3.6	Interpretation	69
3.7	Reconstruction	73
3.8	Critical analysis	75
3.9	Conclusions	77
4	Theoretical and normative frameworks for legal research	79
4.1	Introduction	79
4.2	Theoretical frameworks and their purposes	80
4.3	Explanatory and normative frameworks	84
4.4	Internal and external normative frameworks	88
4.5	Normative scholarship	90
4.6	Concluding remarks: Daring to be normative	92
5	Methodologies for law-in-context research	93
5.1	Introducing law in context	93
5.2	A wide range of contextual aspects	97
5.3	Research objectives as a starting point	102
5.4	From perspectives to context	105
5.5	From research questions to context	110
5.6	Law-in-context methods: From contextual to interdisciplinary doctrinal research	112
5.7	Designing a research project: The entry points for context	116
PART II INTERDISCIPLINARY DOCTRINAL RESEARCH		
6	The promises of interdisciplinary doctrinal research	120
6.1	Introduction	120
6.2	The inclusion of an auxiliary discipline in primarily doctrinal projects	121
6.3	Other types of interdisciplinary research	124
6.4	Which auxiliary disciplines?	127
6.5	A brief overview of the following chapters	130

7	Evaluations and recommendations	131
7.1	Introduction	131
7.2	Some conceptual clarifications	133
7.3	State of the art: Terra incognita	134
7.4	The characteristics of normative arguments	138
7.5	Evaluation standards	143
7.6	The structure of evaluative arguments	148
7.7	From evaluation to recommendations	151
7.8	Asking too much?	154
8	Problems of interdisciplinary research	160
8.1	Introduction	160
8.2	Differences between disciplines	160
8.3	Integrating auxiliary disciplines into doctrinal research: Translation	164
8.4	Integrating auxiliary disciplines into doctrinal research: Transformation	167
8.5	Integrating auxiliary disciplines into doctrinal research: Incorporation into legal orders	168
8.6	Practical issues	172
8.7	Cooperation in interdisciplinary teams	174
9	Methodological design	177
9.1	Introduction	177
9.2	A methodological framework for law-in-context research	178
9.3	The execution of the project: The need for flexibility	185
PART III LAW AND HUMANITIES		
10	Law and humanities research: An introduction	188
10.1	Introduction	188
10.2	The relevance of humanities for legal research	191
10.3	How to include humanities in legal research	194
10.4	A brief overview of the following chapters	195
11	Legal philosophy as an enrichment of doctrinal research	197
11.1	Introduction	197
11.2	Some remarks on legal philosophy	199

11.3	Three philosophical methods	203
11.4	Seven purposes that philosophy can serve	214
12	Law and ethics: Deepening normative arguments	227
12.1	Introduction	227
12.2	Ethics as a philosophical subdiscipline	229
12.3	The legal context: Relating ethics to regulation and policy	234
12.4	Methodological approaches to law and ethics	240
12.5	Conclusion	242
13	Law and literature: Engagement with language	244
13.1	Introduction	244
13.2	Varieties of law-and-literature research	245
13.3	Methodologies of law-and-literature research	248
13.4	Connecting law and literature to other humanities	251
13.5	Four purposes for law-and-literature research	254
PART IV CONCLUDING REFLECTIONS		
14	Using interdisciplinary doctrinal research: Research for law reform	259
14.1	Introduction	259
14.2	Why interdisciplinary doctrinal research? Contributing to law reform	260
14.3	Triangulating research perspectives	265
14.4	Applying the idea of triangulation: Research into rule of law reform	274
14.5	Conclusion: A contribution to the methodology debate	277
	<i>References</i>	280
	<i>Index</i>	303