

Subsidiarity: The ECHR Between Law and Politics

Dissertation
der Rechtswissenschaftlichen Fakultät
der Universität Zürich

zur Erlangung der Würde eines Doktors der Rechtswissenschaft

vorgelegt von

Reto Benedikt Walther

von Bern

genehmigt auf Antrag von

Prof. Dr. Helen Keller
und
Prof. Dr. Tilmann Altwicker

Table of Contents

Preface	V
Acknowledgments.....	VII
Note on Style and Citation.....	XVII
Cases of the European Court of Human Rights.....	XIX
Introduction.....	1
A) Approach and framing	4
a) Subsidiarity <i>qua</i> legal fact	5
b) Political equality and democracy	6
c) Viability and effectiveness.....	9
B) Research plan	16
a) Subsidiarity: what's in a name?	16
b) Outline.....	17
c) General methodological remarks.....	21
Part I: Basics of Subsidiarity.....	25
Chapter 1: Roots, History and Contexts.....	27
A) Subsidiarity: a principle with many faces	27
B) Social pluralism, Catholic social doctrine and liberal contractualism	30
a) Social pluralism and Catholic social doctrine	30
b) Liberal contractualism.....	33
C) Althusius, confederalism and fiscal federalism	35
D) Subsidiarity in international law.....	38
a) Complementarity in the Rome Statute.....	40
b) EU subsidiarity.....	42
c) Subsidiarity in international human rights law.....	46
E) Conclusion	49
Chapter 2: ECHR Subsidiarity in Its Context.....	53
A) Shared responsibility	54
B) Subsidiarity	60
C) Margin of appreciation.....	64
D) Checks and balances and the separation of powers.....	68

E) Outlook	74
Chapter 3: Some Preliminaries Concerning ECHR Subsidiarity	77
A) Who is subsidiarity about?	78
B) What is subsidiarity about?.....	81
C) What is subsidiarity to do?	91
D) Summing-up	95
Part II: The Problem	97
Chapter 4: The Rise of Subsidiarity	99
A) The juridification of the Convention system.....	100
a) A Western European bulwark against totalitarianism (1950–1974).....	101
b) Legalisation and internationalisation (1975–1989).....	105
c) A transnational, judicialised human rights regime (1990–2004).....	108
d) The Court’s major transformative power	114
B) Concerns, criticism and backlash (mid-2000s–today).....	115
a) From caseload concerns to substantive criticism	116
b) The ‘breakthrough’ of subsidiarity	131
C) Summary reflections	143
Chapter 5: The Concerns Behind Subsidiarity	147
A) State sovereignty and international control.....	149
B) National leeway and common standards	157
C) Democratic politics and judicial review	165
a) The Court’s review as a challenge to political democracy	166
b) The problem of representation and participation	178
c) The Court and politics: how much counterweight?	181
d) Judicial and political reasoning	191
e) Equality and procedural justice	205
D) Summing-up	209
Chapter 6: Liberal Rights and Democratic Politics	213
A) Liberalism and democracy.....	216
a) A contradiction in terms?.....	216

b) Rights as democratic self-constraints?.....	221
c) Self-constraints and reasonable disagreement.....	227
d) A matter of approach?	231
B) Politics and law	236
a) The diverging logic of political and legal decision- making.....	236
b) Political and legal authority	238
c) Constitutional authority as a politico-legal hybrid	240
d) Legal and political constitutionalism.....	244
C) Outlook.....	247
Chapter 7: The Court Between Law and Politics	249
A) The Court as politico-legal hybrid.....	250
a) The political dimension of rights-based review	252
b) The Court's law-making.....	256
i) Multipolar rights cases.....	257
ii) Procedural rights.....	259
iii) Positive and socio-economic rights and horizontal rights protection.....	260
iv) Democratic rights	265
v) Remedial practice	266
vi) Proportionality.....	269
c) Summing-up	272
B) The Court's democratic vacuum.....	273
C) Reflections and outlook	282
Part III: Two Views	291
Chapter 8: Rights as Liberal Moral Truths.....	293
A) Letsas' ' <i>supra</i> -national legal constitutionalism'.....	295
a) Moral rights	296
b) Judicial reason.....	299
c) Liberal egalitarianism.....	303
d) Liberal meliorism.....	317
B) Judicial activism unleashed.....	322
C) The problem of idolatry.....	324
Chapter 9: Rights as Claims Within Democratic Politics.....	331
A) Bellamy's ' <i>inter</i> -national political constitutionalism'.....	334

a) Political rights	334
b) The relationality of rights.....	339
c) Democratic equality.....	347
d) The contingency of liberalism.....	362
B) <i>Demoi</i> -cratic control of the Court	370
C) The problem of naive trust.....	373
D) Summing-up.....	378
Part IV: ECHR Subsidiarity.....	381
Chapter 10: An Attempt at an Explanation and Justification.....	383
A) Moral status equality: rights, democracy and the state polity	384
B) On the Court's dual role between moral and judicial authority	394
a) Parochial and international rights	396
b) The bottom-up process and the Court as 'facilitator'.....	400
c) The top-down process and the Court as 'harmoniser'.....	406
d) Revisiting the Court's democratic vacuum	411
e) The dialectical logic of ECHR subsidiarity.....	414
C) The dialogic justification of rights	422
a) Proportionality.....	423
b) Between weak-form and strong-form review	428
D) Summary	438
Chapter 11: Subsidiarity and Interpretation.....	441
A) The Court's varied jurisprudential authority.....	442
a) Flexible interpretative authority and precedential effect.....	443
b) Interpretative incrementalism.....	449
c) The gradual convergence of an <i>acquis conventionnel</i>	457
d) Excursus: subsidiarity, well-established case-law and dubious priorities.....	461
e) Summary reflections.....	467
B) Domestic interpretation	470
a) The States' interpretative obligations	471
b) Preconditions of domestic law.....	474
C) European consensus	480

a) Some preliminaries.....	481
b) European consensus and the Court's subsidiarity	484
i) Ubiquity and flexibility.....	486
ii) Methodology	489
iii) Majoritarianism	493
D) Summary reflections.....	500
Chapter 12: Subsidiarity and Review.....	507
A) Legality: the link between rights and democracy	512
B) Legitimate aims: the purposes of a democratic community ..	516
a) Broad notions, succinct review	519
b) Non-abdication of control.....	520
c) Bad faith	522
C) Necessary in a democratic society	526
a) A rhetorical device rather than framework for dialogue..	527
b) Standards of review	532
c) Subsidiarity, restraint and deference and procedural review.....	542
D) Limits on the limits?	549
E) Summing-up.....	555
Conclusion: An Appeal to the States.....	557
A) ... to sustain the Court's procedural legality	559
B) ... to nurture substantive Convention law	564
C) ... to cultivate the Convention system's moral foundations.....	567
Bibliography.....	579
Curriculum vitae	663