

Vito J. Bumbaca

Habitual Residence in International Family Law

Theory, Practice and Reform



UNIVERSITÉ
DE GENÈVE

FACULTÉ DE DROIT

Schulthess § 2022
ÉDITIONS ROMANDES

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Executive Summary | IX |
| Table of Contents | XIII |
| Table of Cases | XXIII |
| Table of Legislation | XL I |
| Abbreviations and Terminology | LIII |
| Acknowledgements and Dedications | LVII |
| Introduction | 1 |
| Part I: Concept and Operation of Habitual Residence | 11 |
| Chapter I: History and Origins | 11 |
| Section I Hague Conventions and Social Justice | 12 |
| § I. Historical Roots of Habitual Residence | 12 |
| § II. Focus on the 1902 Hague Convention on Guardianship | 13 |
| Section II International Family Law Conventions after World War II | 17 |
| § I. Hague Conference Activity During 1950 | 17 |
| § II. UN Convention on the Recovery Abroad of Maintenance 1956 | 17 |
| § III. Geneva Convention 1951 and its 1967 Protocol | 18 |
| § IV. Hague Conference Activity During 1960 | 20 |
| § V. Specific Focus on the Hague Convention 1961 and the Protection of Minors | 20 |
| § VI. Hague Conference Activity During 1970 | 22 |
| § VII. Hague Conference Activity During 1980 | 25 |
| Section III Focus on the Contemporary Family Law Conventions | 27 |
| § I. Hague Convention 1980 on the Civil Aspects of International Child Abduction | 27 |
| § II. Hague Convention 1993 | 29 |
| § III. Hague Convention 1996 | 31 |
| § IV. Hague Convention on the International Protection of Adults | 34 |
| § V. Some Remarks on the Lugano Convention | 37 |
| § VI. Hague Convention 2007 | 38 |

| | |
|---|----|
| § VI. Hague Protocol 2007 | 40 |
| Section IV European Union Family Law Regulations | 42 |
| § I. Realistic Expectations from the Brussels Convention 1968 to the Brussels II Regulation | 43 |
| § II. EU Family Law Acquis in the 21st Century: Brussels IIA and Rome III | 46 |
| § III. EU Parental Responsibility and the CJEU Guidance on Habitual Residence | 48 |
| § IV. EU Maintenance Regulation | 53 |
| § V. EU Succession Regulation | 55 |
| § VI. Dublin III | 58 |
| § VII. EU Property Regimes' Regulations 2016 | 62 |
| Section V Habitual Residence in the Policies of the Council of Europe | 64 |
| Chapter II: Comparative Perspective: National Operation of Habitual Residence | 66 |
| Section I Common Law Legal Systems | 67 |
| Section II Civil Law Legal Systems | 69 |
| Section III Mixed Legal Systems | 74 |
| Section IV Focus on Shari'a Law | 75 |
| Section V Asian Practice | 76 |
| Section VI Directions for Inter-country Habitual Residence | 78 |
| Chapter III: Habitual Residence Interplay | 79 |
| Section I Nationality | 79 |
| § I. Conflicts of Nationalities | 79 |
| § II. Nationality and Proximity | 82 |
| § III. Statelessness | 83 |
| § IV. Bottomline on the Interplay of Habitual Residence with Nationality | 85 |
| Section II Domicile | 86 |
| § I. Characteristics of Domicile | 86 |
| § II. Civil Law Notion of Domicile in its Interplay with Habitual Residence | 88 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| § III. Common Law Notion of Domicile in its Interplay with Habitual Residence | 93 |
| § IV. Suitable International Approach Differentiating Domicile from Habitual Residence | 95 |
| Section III Residence | 96 |
| § I. Residence Simpliciter | 96 |
| § II. Tax Residency | 97 |
| § III. Ordinary Residence | 100 |
| § IV. Permanent Residence | 101 |
| § V. Prospective Use of the Different Grounds of Residence | 103 |
| Section IV Physical Presence and Prospective Acclimatization | 104 |
| § I. Physical Presence | 104 |
| § II. Prospective Acclimatization | 104 |
| Chapter IV: Basis for a Two-fold Test Approach | 107 |
| Section I Habitual Residence Uniform Application | 107 |
| § I. Harmonised Terminology | 107 |
| § II. Initial Uniform Reference | 109 |
| § III. A Proposed Handbook and/ or Protocol as an International Guide | 109 |
| Section II Habitual Residence under Social Security Law | 111 |
| Section III Alternate Habitual Residence or Concurrent Habitual Residence | 112 |
| § I. Alternate Habitual Residence or Résidence Alternée | 112 |
| § II. Concurrent Habitual Residence | 114 |
| Section IV Absence of Habitual Residence | 115 |
| Section V Forum (Non)Conveniens or Transfer of Jurisdiction | 116 |
| § I. Common Law Forum Conveniens | 116 |
| § II. Similarity with the Civil Law Transfer of Jurisdiction | 118 |
| § III. Lis Pendens Rule and the Consistent Transfer of Jurisdiction | 119 |
| Section VI Forum Shopping | 120 |
| Conclusions | 121 |
| PART II: Marriages, Registered Partnerships and Property Regimes | 123 |
| Chapter I: Marriages and Registered Partnerships | 124 |
| Section I National Conflict-of-law Rules | 124 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| § I. Jurisdiction of the Administrative Authorities for the Celebration or Registration | 125 |
| § II. Formal and Substantive Validity | 129 |
| § III. Rules on Recognition | 133 |
| Section II Effects of Marriages: in particular the Name | 136 |
| § I. International Instruments | 137 |
| § II. Jurisdiction and Applicable Law | 138 |
| Section III Habitual Residence and its Interplay with other Connecting Factors | 142 |
| § I. Celebration of Marriages and Partnerships: Key Points | 142 |
| § II. Effects of Marriage to the Name: Key Points | 145 |
| § III. Interpretation of Habitual Residence | 147 |
| § IV. Summary of Recommendations | 148 |
| Chapter II: Property Relations | 149 |
| Section I Property Regimes within National Legal Orders | 150 |
| Section II EU Regulations | 152 |
| § I. Jurisdiction and Applicable law | 152 |
| § II. Practical Implementation | 154 |
| § III. Adapting Habitual Residence to Different Contexts | 157 |
| § IV. Pros and Cons of the Proposal | 158 |
| § V. Some Remarks on the Guiding Operation of Habitual Residence | 160 |
| § VI. (Minimal) Operation of Habitual Residence on the Validity of Agreements | 161 |
| Section III Hague Convention 1978 and Related Practice | 162 |
| § I. Case law Analysis | 163 |
| § II. Two-fold Test Approach Applied in Context | 165 |
| Section IV National Perspectives | 166 |
| § I. Property Relations in the Context of Nordic Situations | 166 |
| § II. Turkey-EU | 167 |
| § III. US-EU | 170 |
| § IV. UK-EU | 173 |
| § V. Switzerland-EU | 176 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| Section V Two Habitual Residences | 179 |
| § I. Alternate habitual residence | 179 |
| § II. Concurrent Habitual Residences | 183 |
| Section VI Absence of Habitual Residence | 187 |
| § I. Case Studies | 187 |
| § II. Current Issues | 188 |
| § III. Proposed Resolution Model on ‘Mere’ Presence | 191 |
| § IV. Proposed Resolution Model on Prospective Acclimatization | 192 |
| § V. Lis Pendens | 192 |
| Section VII Proposed Model for a Collaborative Determination and Transfer of Jurisdiction | 193 |
| Conclusions | 194 |
| PART III: Divorce, Parental Responsibility and Maintenance | 199 |
| Chapter I: Divorce | 199 |
| Section I Habitual Residence under the Hague Convention 1970 | 200 |
| Section II EU Acquis in Divorce Matters | 202 |
| § I. Brussels IIA: Guiding Principles for the Habitual Residence Uniform Determination | 202 |
| § II. Pre- and Post- Brussels IIA: National Case Law | 206 |
| § III. Rome III: Relevant Provisions and Preliminary Remarks | 209 |
| § IV. Rome III: National Case Law | 210 |
| Section III Prorogation of Jurisdiction | 211 |
| Section IV Concentrate Jurisdiction under the EU Acquis and the Swiss Legislation | 213 |
| Section V Divorce Conflict-of-law Rules in the US and Turkey | 215 |
| § I. US-EU | 215 |
| § II. Turkey-EU | 216 |
| § III. Prospect of an International Convention on Divorce | 218 |
| Section VI Concurrent, Alternate, Absence of Habitual Residence | 219 |
| § I. Concurrent Habitual Residence | 219 |
| § II. Alternate Habitual Residence | 221 |
| § III. Absence of Habitual Residence: Mere Presence or Prospective Acclimatization? | 223 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| § IV. Lis Pendens, Collaborative Determination and Transfer of Jurisdiction | 225 |
| Chapter II: Parental Responsibility | 226 |
| Section I Establishing of the Parent-Child Relationship | 227 |
| § I. Legal Parentage and Surrogacy | 227 |
| § II. National PIL Rules on Parent-Child Relationship | 229 |
| § III. Habitual Residence within Inter-country Adoption | 233 |
| Section II Child Custody and Visiting Rights | 236 |
| § I. General Jurisdiction under Brussels IIA | 236 |
| § II. General Jurisdiction under the Hague Convention 1996 | 239 |
| § III. Continuing Jurisdiction under Brussels IIA and the HC-1996 | 243 |
| § IV. Transfer of Jurisdiction under Brussels IIA and the HC-1996 | 247 |
| § V. Temporary Jurisdiction under Brussels IIA and the HC-1996 | 249 |
| § VI. Rules on Applicable Law under the HC-1996 | 252 |
| § VII. Alternate Habitual Residence | 254 |
| § VIII. Concurrent Habitual Residence | 258 |
| § IX. Absence of Habitual Residence | 261 |
| § X. Inter-country Child Assessments | 264 |
| § XI. Home State under the US UCCJEA | 265 |
| Section III International Child Civil Abduction | 270 |
| § I. Case Law Analysis | 271 |
| § II. A Child Centred Approach: Factual Proximity and Best Interests | 281 |
| § III. Alternate Habitual Residence in Relation to Abduction | 283 |
| § IV. Absence of Habitual Residence in Relation to Abduction | 285 |
| Chapter III: Maintenance | 287 |
| Section I Maintenance Legal Framework | 288 |
| § I. Hague Convention 1973 | 288 |
| § II. Hague Protocol 2007 | 289 |
| § III. Hague Convention 2007 | 293 |
| § IV. EU Maintenance Regulation | 295 |
| Section II Maintenance as a Principal Matter and Ancillary to Parental Responsibility/ Divorce | 296 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| § I. CJEU Case Law | 297 |
| § II. National Case Law | 302 |
| Section III Alternate and Absence of Habitual Residence | 306 |
| § I. Absence of Habitual Residence | 308 |
| § II. Alternate Habitual Residence | 310 |
| Conclusions | 311 |
| Part IV: Incapacitated Adults | 317 |
| Chapter I: The ‘New’ International Protection of Adults | 317 |
| Section I The EU Protection of Adults | 318 |
| Section II Hague Convention 2000 | 320 |
| § I. Vulnerability, Interests and Proximity: An Adult-centred Approach | 321 |
| § II. General Jurisdiction and Applicable Law | 324 |
| § III. Determination of Habitual Residence | 325 |
| § IV. Change of Habitual Residence | 328 |
| § V. Absence of Habitual Residence | 329 |
| § VI. Transfer of Jurisdiction | 332 |
| § VII. Concurrent Subsidiary Jurisdiction: Nationality and In Rem | 333 |
| § VIII. Concurrent Temporary Jurisdiction | 334 |
| § IX. Party Autonomy | 335 |
| Section III Two Habitual Residences | 336 |
| § I. Alternate Habitual Residence | 336 |
| § II. Concurrent Habitual Residence | 337 |
| Section IV International Adult Abduction | 339 |
| Chapter II: Beyond the Treaty Rules | 343 |
| Section I US Uniform Adult Guardianship and Protective Proceedings Jurisdiction Act | 344 |
| § I. Primary Home-state Jurisdiction | 344 |
| § II. Primary Significant-connection Jurisdiction | 346 |
| § III. Special Jurisdiction | 347 |
| Section II National conflict-of-law Rules of Canada and China | 347 |
| § I. Canada (Ontario) | 347 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| § II. China | 349 |
| Section III Lessons Learned from other National Connecting Factors | 349 |
| Conclusions | 350 |
| Part V: International Successions | 355 |
| Chapter I: EU Succession Regulation | 356 |
| Section I Habitual Residence: Guiding Indicators and Derogations | 356 |
| § I. Assessment for Jurisdiction and Applicable Law | 356 |
| § II. Debated Rules and Excluded Factors | 358 |
| § III. The Principle of (Specific) Coincidence on Habitual Residence | 361 |
| § IV. Closest Connection and the ‘Situation de Précarité Economique ou de Besoin’ | 363 |
| § V. EU Uniform Interpretation | 365 |
| Section II Relevant Legal Framework | 367 |
| § I. Provisions on Jurisdiction and Applicable Law | 367 |
| § II. Validity of the Testamentary Dispositions | 370 |
| § III. Party Autonomy: A Proposed Model | 371 |
| Chapter II: EU Jurisdiction over Property Regimes and Successions | 372 |
| Section I Coincidence of Forum and <i>Jus</i> | 373 |
| Section II Concentrate Jurisdiction | 374 |
| Chapter III: Remarks on the EU25- Swiss, UK and US Contexts | 376 |
| Section I Swiss PIL Rules Before the 2018 Ongoing Reform | 377 |
| § I. Current Operation of Swiss Domicile and the EU25 Habitual Residence | 378 |
| § II. Current Operation of the Swiss and the EU25 Habitual Residences | 380 |
| Section II Swiss PIL Rules After the 2018 Ongoing Reform | 382 |
| § I. Habitual Residence Exclusion | 382 |
| § II. Jurisdiction and Applicable Law under the ‘Avant-projet’ | 384 |
| Section III UK and the US Conflict-of-law rules | 387 |
| § I. UK-EU25 | 387 |
| § II. US-EU25 | 390 |
| Chapter IV: Potential Issues Arising Out of Habitual Residence Determinations | 391 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| Section I Absence of Habitual Residence | 392 |
| § I. EU25 Legal Context | 392 |
| § II. Swiss-EU25 Current Remedies | 393 |
| § III. Proposed Rules | 394 |
| Section II Alternate and Concurrent Habitual Residence | 396 |
| § I. The Context and the Current Remedy | 396 |
| § II. Proposed Rules | 398 |
| Section III Transfer of Jurisdiction | 399 |
| Conclusions | 400 |
| Part VI: The Future Prospect: Conclusive Remarks | 403 |
| Reference List | 409 |
| Appendix 1 Conferences and Workshops | 443 |
| Appendix 2 Interviews | 444 |
| Appendix 3 Curriculum Vitae | 444 |