

Louis Ballivet

# Beyond the Arm's Length Principle



UNIVERSITÉ  
DE GENÈVE  
FACULTÉ DE DROIT

Schulthess § 2021  
ÉDITIONS ROMANDES

# Contents – extensive

<b>Introduction</b> .....	<b>1</b>
1 Imaginary orders.....	1
2 Why tax corporations?.....	1
2.1 Introductory comments .....	1
2.2 Against corporate taxation .....	2
2.3 In favor of corporate taxation.....	3
3 Institutional context .....	4
3.1 Tax sovereignty .....	4
3.2 Arm’s length principle and enterprise doctrine.....	4
3.3 Rise of multinational enterprises.....	5
3.4 Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) Program .....	6
4 Academic interest.....	6
5 Framework of analysis .....	8
<b>Part I Principles of international tax law</b> .....	<b>9</b>
1 Contents.....	9
2 Legal principles .....	9
2.1 Introductory comments .....	9
2.2 Dilemma between the residence and the source principles .....	10
2.2.1 Residence principle.....	10
2.2.2 Source principle .....	12
2.2.3 Compromise .....	14
2.2.3.1 Notion of permanent establishment .....	15
2.2.3.1.1 Introductory comments .....	15
2.2.3.1.2 Definition .....	15
2.2.3.1.2.1 Auxiliary and preparatory activities .....	16
2.2.3.1.2.2 Electronic commerce .....	16
2.2.3.2 Action 7 of the BEPS program .....	17
2.2.3.3 Attribution of profit to a Permanent Establishment.....	18

3	Economic principles.....	19
3.1	Introductory comments .....	19
3.2	Competitiveness.....	19
3.3	Tax competition.....	21
3.3.1	Analogy between States and corporations.....	21
3.3.2	Definition .....	22
3.4	Tax neutrality .....	23
3.4.1	Capital import neutrality versus capital export neutrality.....	23
3.4.1.1	Capital export neutrality .....	24
3.4.1.2	Capital import neutrality.....	24
3.4.1.3	Implementation in the OECD and UN MCs.....	25
3.4.2	Harmful tax competition .....	25
3.4.2.1	Definition .....	25
3.4.2.2	OECD perspective .....	26
3.4.2.2.1	1998 Report.....	26
3.4.2.2.2	BEPS Action 5.....	27
3.4.3	Subjectivity of the notion of harmful tax competition .....	28
3.4.4	The relation between tax competition and tax avoidance .....	29
3.5	Prisoner's dilemma applied to international tax law .....	30
3.5.1	Prisoner's dilemma.....	30
3.5.1.1	Individual context.....	30
3.5.1.2	International context .....	31
3.5.1.3	Trust barriers.....	32
3.5.2	Statutory corporate income tax drop .....	33
3.5.2.1	Application of the prisoner's dilemma.....	33
3.5.2.2	Context .....	35
3.5.2.3	Drop in domestic tax rates.....	36
4	How to judge a tax regime? .....	36
4.1	Introductory comment .....	36
4.1.1	Not an exact science .....	36
4.1.2	Wealth of Nations .....	36
4.1.3	OECD framework.....	37
4.2	Benchmarks for the purpose of this dissertation.....	38

4.2.1	Practicability .....	38
4.2.1.1	Context .....	38
4.2.1.2	The notion of normative density .....	39
4.2.1.2.1	High normative density .....	39
4.2.1.2.2	Low normative density .....	40
4.2.1.2.3	Intermediate normative density .....	40
4.2.1.3	Predictability versus flexibility, the eternal trade-off .....	41
4.2.1.4	The notion of ectopia .....	42
4.2.1.4.1	Baseline and overlaying relationship .....	42
4.2.1.4.2	Regulatory vicious circle .....	43
4.2.1.5	Proxies in tax law .....	44
4.2.1.5.1	Introductory comments .....	44
4.2.1.5.2	Historic examples .....	44
4.2.1.6	Assessment of practicability in this dissertation .....	46
4.2.2	Efficiency .....	46
4.2.2.1	Classification of tax-related behaviors .....	46
4.2.2.2	Tax abuse and aggressive tax planning .....	48
4.2.2.2.1	Tax abuse .....	48
4.2.2.2.2	Aggressive tax planning .....	48
4.2.2.3	Tax competition .....	49
4.2.2.4	Assessment of efficiency in this dissertation .....	50
4.2.3	Fairness .....	50
4.2.3.1	Repartition of international corporate income tax base .....	50
4.2.3.2	Supply and demand .....	51
4.2.3.3	Assessment of fairness in this dissertation .....	52
4.2.4	Relation among practicability, efficiency, and fairness .....	52
5	Synthesis .....	53
<b>Part II Arm's Length Principle .....</b>		<b>55</b>
1	Contents .....	55
2	Historical perspective on the theory of value .....	55
2.1	Introductory comments .....	55
2.2	Antiquity and Middle Ages .....	55

- 2.3 Classical school of economics ..... 56
- 2.4 Neoclassical school of economics ..... 57
- 3 Value creation in an MNE..... 58
  - 3.1 Introductory comments ..... 58
  - 3.2 Chain of production ..... 58
    - 3.2.1 Notion of integration..... 58
      - 3.2.1.1 Introductory comments ..... 58
      - 3.2.1.2 Vertical integration..... 59
      - 3.2.1.3 Horizontal integration ..... 60
      - 3.2.1.4 Four degrees of integration ..... 60
      - 3.2.1.5 Michael Porter’s value chain ..... 61
    - 3.2.2 Intangible assets ..... 62
  - 3.3 Product image ..... 64
    - 3.3.1 Product ..... 65
    - 3.3.2 Price ..... 65
    - 3.3.3 Promotion ..... 66
    - 3.3.4 Placement..... 66
    - 3.3.5 People ..... 67
  - 3.4 The digitalization of the economy ..... 68
    - 3.4.1 Introductory comments ..... 68
    - 3.4.2 Integration..... 69
      - 3.4.2.1 Scale without mass ..... 69
      - 3.4.2.2 From value chain to value network and value shop ..... 69
        - 3.4.2.2.1 Value shop ..... 69
        - 3.4.2.2.2 Value network..... 70
        - 3.4.2.2.3 Comparison between traditional and digital businesses ..... 72
      - 3.4.3 Group synergies ..... 73
        - 3.4.3.1 Economies of scales ..... 73
        - 3.4.3.2 Users participation and data..... 73
      - 3.4.4 Competition ..... 74
        - 3.4.4.1 Network effects..... 74
        - 3.4.4.2 Double-sided markets ..... 75

3.4.4.3	Lock-in effect .....	75
3.4.4.4	Final remarks.....	75
4	Origins .....	76
4.1	Model Double-Taxation Conventions.....	76
4.1.1	Appearance of the legal person .....	76
4.1.2	International Chamber of Commerce .....	77
4.1.3	League of Nations.....	78
4.1.3.1	1923 Report.....	78
4.1.3.2	1925 Report.....	78
4.1.3.3	1927 Report.....	79
4.1.3.4	1928 Report.....	79
4.1.4	Mitchell B. Carroll (1930-1933).....	80
4.1.5	Model Tax Conventions.....	80
4.1.6	OECD and UN.....	81
4.2	Transfer-pricing guidelines .....	82
4.2.1	1968 US Regulations .....	82
4.2.2	1979 OECD TP Report.....	82
4.2.3	OECD TP guidelines from 1995 to 2017 .....	83
4.3	Adoption of the ALP by many States .....	83
5	Article 9 OECD MC.....	84
5.1	Introductory comment .....	84
5.1.1	Arm's-length principle.....	84
5.1.2	Article 9 OECD MC .....	86
5.2	Whom to tax?.....	87
5.3	What to tax? .....	88
5.3.1	Introductory comments .....	88
5.3.2	Accurate delineation of the transaction (step one) .....	89
5.3.2.1	Contractual terms of the transaction.....	89
5.3.2.2	The functional analysis .....	90
5.3.2.2.1	Introductory comments .....	90
5.3.2.2.2	Identify economically significant risks.....	91
5.3.2.2.3	Contractual assumption of risk .....	91
5.3.2.2.4	Functional analysis in relation to risk.....	91

5.3.2.2.5	Allocation of risk.....	92
5.3.2.2.6	Inevitable tangle of functions, risks, and assets .....	93
5.3.2.3	Characteristics of property or services .....	93
5.3.2.4	Economic circumstances.....	93
5.3.2.5	Business strategies .....	93
5.3.3	Comparability analysis (step two) .....	94
5.3.3.1	Introductory comments .....	94
5.3.3.2	Comparable Uncontrolled Price Method .....	96
5.3.3.3	Resale price method .....	96
5.3.3.4	Cost-plus method .....	97
5.3.3.5	Transactional Net Margin Method.....	97
5.3.3.6	Transactional Profit Spilt Method .....	98
5.3.3.6.1	External data.....	100
5.3.3.6.2	Internal data .....	100
5.3.3.6.3	Discounted cash-flow analysis, rules of thumb, and survey approach.....	101
5.3.3.6.3.1	Discounted cash-flow analysis .....	101
5.3.3.6.3.2	Rules of thumb.....	101
5.3.3.6.3.3	Survey approach.....	102
5.3.3.7	Most appropriate method.....	102
5.4	Where to tax?.....	102
5.4.1	Introductory comments .....	102
5.4.2	Primary adjustment.....	103
5.4.2.1	Valuation adjustment.....	103
5.4.2.2	Structural adjustment.....	103
5.4.3	Corresponding adjustment .....	105
5.4.4	Secondary adjustment.....	105
5.5	Interest (Article 11 OECD MC) and Royalties (Article 12 OECD MC) .....	106
5.6	Interpretation.....	106
6	The transfer-pricing challenges of digitalization.....	107
6.1	Introductory comments .....	107
6.2	Taxable presence .....	108

6.2.1	Social networks .....	108
6.2.2	Device manufacturer .....	108
6.2.3	Cloud computing.....	109
6.3	Profit attribution .....	110
6.3.1	Online advertiser .....	110
6.3.2	Article 5(5) OECD MC Pre-BEPS wording (Google in France) .....	111
6.3.3	Article 5(5) OECD MC Post-BEPS wording.....	112
6.3.4	Profit attribution under Articles 7 and 9 OECD MC.....	112
6.3.4.1	Article 7(2) OECD MC .....	113
6.3.4.2	Article 9 OECD MC.....	114
6.3.5	Intermediary remarks .....	114
7	Practicability.....	116
7.1	Indefinite legal terms and proxies.....	116
7.1.1	Normative evolution .....	116
7.1.1.1	The separate-entity principle .....	116
7.1.1.1.1	Private-law logic .....	116
7.1.1.1.2	A fiscal myth .....	117
7.1.1.1.3	Control features .....	118
7.1.1.2	The illusion of comparability .....	119
7.1.1.3	Difficulties with the functional analysis.....	120
7.1.1.3.1	BEPS Action 8-10 .....	120
7.1.1.3.2	The artificiality of risk allocation.....	121
7.1.1.3.3	The importance of data .....	121
7.1.1.3.4	On-demand economy .....	123
7.1.2	Compliance and administrative burden .....	124
7.1.2.1	Normative inflation.....	124
7.1.2.2	Documentation requirement.....	124
7.1.2.3	Uncertainty .....	125
7.2	Fertile ground for disputes.....	125
7.2.1	The Ciba-Geigy case .....	125
7.2.2	MAP statistics.....	126



8	Efficiency .....	127
8.1	Relation between complexity and aggressive tax planning .....	127
8.1.1	The two options .....	127
8.1.2	A strong incentive for aggressive tax planning.....	128
8.2	Aggressive tax-planning opportunities .....	128
8.2.1	Introductory comments .....	128
8.2.2	Kering case.....	129
8.2.3	Double Irish Dutch Sandwich.....	130
8.2.4	IP-holding structure .....	133
8.2.5	McDonald’s Case .....	134
8.2.6	Flaws of the international tax system .....	137
8.2.6.1	Separate-entity principle .....	137
8.2.6.2	Comparability analysis .....	138
8.2.6.3	Functional analysis .....	138
8.2.7	Three main profit-shifting channels.....	139
8.3	Corporate tax-avoidance statistics .....	140
8.3.1	A difficult estimation .....	140
8.3.2	Profit-shifting indicators.....	141
8.3.2.1	Foreign direct investments.....	141
8.3.2.2	Special-purpose entities.....	141
8.3.2.3	OECD indicators .....	142
8.3.2.4	Other studies .....	142
8.3.2.5	Post-BEPS world .....	143
8.3.3	Revenue losses .....	144
8.3.3.1	Examples of national studies .....	144
8.3.3.2	Contradictions.....	145
8.4	The ALP encourages tax competition.....	145
8.4.1	Statutory corporate income-tax drop.....	145
8.4.2	Tax revenues as a share of GDP .....	146
8.4.3	Unilateral measures in the digital economy .....	147
9	Fairness .....	150
9.1	Repatriation of the international corporate tax base .....	150
9.1.1	Inter-State equity.....	150

9.1.2	Risk of double taxation .....	150
9.1.3	Different profit allocation under Articles 7 and 9 OECD MC.....	151
9.2	Supply and demand .....	152
10	Synthesis.....	152
<b>Part III Non-arm's-length approaches.....</b>		<b>155</b>
1	Contents.....	155
2	Formulary apportionment .....	156
2.1	Illustration.....	156
2.2	Introductory comments .....	156
2.2.1	Single-factor formula.....	157
2.2.2	Multi-factors formula.....	158
2.3	CCCTB project.....	159
2.3.1	Introductory comments .....	159
2.3.2	Key features.....	161
2.3.2.1	Optionality of the CCCTB .....	161
2.3.2.2	Delegation.....	161
2.4	Whom to tax?.....	162
2.4.1	Introductory comments .....	162
2.4.2	Definition of a group.....	163
2.4.2.1	Taxable units .....	163
2.4.2.2	Entities eligible for consolidation.....	164
2.4.2.3	Ownership and control.....	164
2.4.2.3.1	Ownership threshold .....	164
2.4.2.3.2	Notion of control.....	165
2.4.2.4	Liability to tax .....	166
2.4.3	Definition of the group in the CCCTB.....	166
2.4.3.1	Taxable unit.....	166
2.4.3.2	Entities eligible for consolidation.....	166
2.4.3.3	Ownership and control.....	168
2.4.3.3.1	Ownership threshold .....	168
2.4.3.3.2	Notion of control.....	169

2.4.3.4	Liability to tax .....	170
2.5	What to tax? .....	170
2.5.1	Introductory comments .....	170
2.5.2	Business lines.....	171
2.5.3	Common accounting standards.....	173
2.5.4	Common accounting standards in the CCCTB .....	174
2.5.4.1	Common tax base .....	174
2.5.4.2	Tax period and valuation .....	175
2.5.4.3	Amortization .....	175
2.5.4.4	Supplementary means of interpretation .....	176
2.5.5	Treatment of assets .....	177
2.5.5.1	Quarantine .....	178
2.5.5.2	Deemed sale.....	179
2.5.5.3	Rollover .....	180
2.5.5.4	Intragroup asset transfers.....	181
2.5.6	Treatment of assets under CCCTB .....	181
2.5.6.1	Introductory comments .....	181
2.5.6.2	Joining time / during consolidation .....	182
2.5.6.3	Leaving time.....	183
2.5.6.4	Intragroup asset transfers under CCCTB.....	183
2.5.7	Treatment of intragroup shareholdings .....	185
2.5.7.1	Illustration.....	185
2.5.7.2	Treatment of intragroup shareholdings in the CCCTB.....	187
2.5.8	Treatment of losses .....	188
2.5.8.1	Pre-consolidation losses and group losses.....	188
2.5.8.1.1	Cancellation.....	189
2.5.8.1.2	Suspension.....	189
2.5.8.1.3	Quarantine.....	189
2.5.9	Treatment of losses in the CCCTB.....	190
2.5.9.1.1	Joining time / during consolidation .....	190
2.5.9.1.2	During consolidation .....	191
2.5.9.1.3	Leaving time.....	191
2.6	Where to tax?.....	192

2.6.1	Introductory comments .....	192
2.6.2	Sales factor .....	193
2.6.2.1	Remote sales and sales through intermediaries .....	193
2.6.2.2	Sales of raw material, components, and intermediate goods .....	195
2.6.2.3	Portfolio investment.....	196
2.6.2.4	Services.....	197
2.6.3	Payroll / Employees factor .....	197
2.6.4	Property factor .....	198
2.6.5	Article 29 CCCTB.....	199
2.7	2018 Reports.....	200
2.8	Practicability .....	201
2.8.1	Introductory comments .....	201
2.8.2	Indefinite legal terms and proxies.....	202
2.8.2.1	Issues with the question: Whom to tax? .....	202
2.8.2.2	Issues with the question: What to tax? .....	204
2.8.2.3	ALP within the CCCTB.....	204
2.8.3	Administrative burden and tax disputes .....	205
2.8.4	Implementation.....	206
2.9	Efficiency .....	208
2.9.1	Aggressive tax-planning opportunities.....	208
2.9.2	Factor manipulation (issues with the question: Where to tax?).....	209
2.9.3	Tax Competition .....	211
2.10	Fairness.....	212
2.10.1	Reparation of the international corporate tax base.....	212
2.10.2	Supply and demand .....	213
2.10.3	Arbitrariness of a single allocation key .....	214
3	Residual profit allocation .....	215
3.1	Illustration.....	215
3.2	Introductory comments .....	215
3.3	Residual profit allocation by income .....	217
3.3.1	Whom to tax?.....	217

3.3.2	What to tax? .....	217
3.3.3	Where to tax? .....	217
3.3.4	Example .....	218
3.3.4.1	Routine profits .....	219
3.3.4.2	Residual profit .....	219
3.3.4.3	Losses .....	221
3.3.4.3.1	Total residual profit of the group is positive but negative in at least one jurisdiction .....	221
3.3.4.3.2	Insufficient profit .....	222
3.3.4.3.3	Group is at loss .....	223
3.4	Practicability .....	223
3.4.1	Indefinite legal terms and proxies .....	223
3.4.1.1	Whom to tax? .....	223
3.4.1.2	What to tax / Where to tax .....	223
3.4.2	Administrative burden and tax disputes .....	224
3.4.3	Implementation .....	225
3.5	Efficiency .....	226
3.5.1	Aggressive tax-planning opportunities .....	226
3.5.2	Tax competition .....	227
3.6	Fairness .....	227
3.6.1	Repatriation of international corporate income tax base .....	227
4	Destination Taxation .....	229
4.1	Illustration .....	229
4.2	Introductory comments .....	229
4.3	Destination-based-cash-flow-tax .....	230
4.3.1	Whom to tax? .....	230
4.3.2	What to tax? .....	231
4.3.3	Where to tax? .....	231
4.3.4	Destination-based-cash-flow-tax vs sales-based FA and border adjustment .....	232
4.4	Practicability .....	233
4.4.1	Indefinite legal terms and administrative burden .....	233
4.4.2	Implementation .....	234

4.4.2.1	Compatibility with WTO law .....	234
4.4.2.2	Interaction with DTAs .....	234
4.4.2.3	Unilateral adoption .....	235
4.5	Efficiency .....	236
4.5.1	Aggressive tax-planning opportunities .....	236
4.5.1.1	Immobile factor .....	236
4.5.1.2	Issues with remotes sales .....	236
4.5.2	Tax competition .....	237
4.6	Fairness .....	237
4.6.1	Reparation of the international corporate tax base .....	237
5	Synthesis .....	238
5.1	Formulary apportionment .....	238
5.2	Residual profit allocation .....	239
5.3	Destination taxation .....	240

**Part IV Influence of the non-arm’s-length approaches ..... 243**

1	Contents .....	243
1.1	Introductory comments .....	243
1.1.1	Economic evolution of the ALP .....	243
1.1.2	Scope of this chapter .....	244
1.2	Allocation keys .....	245
1.2.1	Transactional profit split method .....	245
1.2.1.1	Two-sided method .....	245
1.2.1.2	Latest guidance .....	246
1.2.1.3	Profit split method and formulary apportionment .....	246
1.2.2	Intangible Property .....	247
1.2.2.1	Definition of intangible .....	248
1.2.2.1.1	Definition .....	248
1.2.2.1.2	Identification .....	249
1.2.2.2	Ownership .....	250
1.2.2.2.1	Introductory comments .....	250
1.2.2.2.2	Development, enhancement, maintenance, protection, and exploitation functions (DEMPE) .....	251

1.2.2.2.3	GlaxoSmithKline case .....	252
1.2.2.3	Intellectual property transactions .....	253
1.2.2.3.1	Single intangible transaction.....	253
1.2.2.3.2	Combination of intangibles or bundled transactions.....	254
1.2.2.4	Arm’s-length price of intellectual property transactions.....	255
1.2.2.4.1	Valuation of an intangible asset .....	255
1.2.2.4.1.1	Absence of comparables .....	255
1.2.2.4.1.2	Specific features .....	255
1.2.2.4.1.3	Hard-value-intangible .....	256
1.2.2.4.2	Selecting the appropriate transfer-pricing method ....	257
1.2.2.4.2.1	Transfer-pricing methods.....	257
1.2.2.4.2.2	Valuation techniques .....	257
1.2.2.5	The ALP in the context of intangible assets .....	258
1.2.2.5.1	Intangible exploitation.....	258
1.2.2.5.2	BEPS and intangibles .....	258
1.2.2.5.3	Intangibles in the future .....	259
1.2.3	Intragroup Services .....	260
1.2.3.1	Introductory comments .....	260
1.2.3.2	Has a service effectively been rendered? .....	260
1.2.3.3	What is the arm’s-length intragroup charge for such service? .....	261
1.2.3.3.1	The direct-charge method .....	261
1.2.3.3.2	The indirect-charge method.....	261
1.2.3.3.3	Example.....	262
1.2.4	Cost contribution arrangements.....	264
1.2.5	MNE group synergies .....	265
1.2.5.1	Introductory comments .....	265
1.2.5.2	Example.....	266
1.2.5.3	Cash Pooling Arrangements .....	267
1.2.5.3.1	Example of a cash pooling arrangement.....	267
1.2.5.3.2	In-house bank structure.....	268

1.2.5.3.3	Domestic cases .....	269
1.2.5.3.4	Latest update .....	270
1.2.5.3.5	Final remarks.....	271
1.2.6	Location specific advantages .....	271
1.2.6.1	Definition .....	271
1.2.6.2	Example.....	272
1.2.6.3	Final remarks.....	272
1.3	Safe harbors .....	273
1.3.1	Low-value-adding services .....	274
1.3.2	Domestic practice.....	275
1.3.2.1	India.....	275
1.3.2.2	China.....	276
1.3.2.3	Brazil.....	278
1.3.2.4	Switzerland.....	279
1.3.2.5	Australia.....	279
1.3.2.6	The adoption of safe harbors in many other countries .....	280
2	Pillar One.....	281
2.1	Introductory comments .....	281
2.1.1	Background.....	281
2.1.2	Relation between Pillar One, residual profit allocation, and formulary apportionment systems.....	283
2.1.3	Pillar One “Unified Approach” .....	283
2.2	Whom to tax?.....	284
2.2.1	Definition of the group .....	284
2.2.2	Scope tests .....	284
2.2.2.1	Activity test.....	284
2.2.2.2	Threshold tests .....	286
2.2.2.2.1	Global revenue test.....	286
2.2.2.2.2	De-minimis foreign in-scope revenue test.....	286
2.3	What to tax.....	287
2.3.1	Defining the tax base .....	287
2.3.2	Amount B.....	287
2.3.3	Losses.....	288



2.4	Where to tax.....	289
2.4.1	Nexus test in each market jurisdiction .....	289
2.4.2	Revenue sourcing rules.....	290
2.4.3	Profit allocation.....	291
2.5	Example.....	291
2.5.1	Amount A profit allocation.....	291
2.5.2	Summary figure .....	292
2.6	Practicability .....	293
2.6.1	Indefinite legal terms and proxies.....	293
2.6.1.1	Amount A.....	293
2.6.1.1.1	Whom to tax? .....	293
2.6.1.1.1.1	MNE definition .....	293
2.6.1.1.1.2	Automated digital services .....	294
2.6.1.1.1.3	Consumer-facing businesses.....	294
2.6.1.1.2	What to tax?.....	295
2.6.1.1.2.1	Accounting standards.....	295
2.6.1.1.2.2	Business lines .....	296
2.6.1.1.3	Where to tax?.....	296
2.6.1.2	Amount B.....	298
2.6.1.2.1	Definition of entities and baseline activities.....	298
2.6.1.2.2	Fixed margins vs safe harbors .....	298
2.6.1.2.3	Overlaps between Amount A and B.....	300
2.6.2	Implementation.....	301
2.6.3	Tax disputes.....	302
2.6.3.1	From two-country transaction-based to multi-country income-based disputes.....	302
2.6.3.2	Dispute prevention and resolution .....	303
2.7	Efficiency .....	304
2.7.1	Aggressive tax-planning opportunities.....	304
2.7.1.1	Whom to tax? .....	305
2.7.1.2	What to tax?.....	305
2.7.1.3	Where to tax?.....	305
2.7.2	Tax competition .....	306

2.8	Fairness.....	306
2.8.1	Repartition of international tax base.....	306
2.8.2	Equality among taxpayers.....	307
2.8.3	Relief of double taxation.....	307
3	Synthesis.....	309
3.1	Allocation keys and safe harbors.....	309
3.2	Pillar One.....	309
<b>Part V Orientations toward reform.....</b>		<b>311</b>
1	Contents.....	311
2	Moving toward the source principle.....	311
2.1	Introductory comments.....	311
2.2	Residence manipulation.....	313
2.3	Fairness.....	314
2.4	BEPS objective.....	314
2.5	CEN and CIN.....	315
2.5.1	Introductory comments.....	315
2.5.2	Nationalism.....	316
2.5.3	Limits of efficiency.....	317
2.5.4	CEN and tax planning.....	317
2.5.5	Developing countries.....	318
3	Adapting the source threshold.....	318
3.1	Introductory comments.....	318
3.2	Academic proposal.....	319
3.3	International proposals.....	320
3.3.1	European Union.....	320
3.3.2	United Nations.....	322
3.3.3	OECD.....	322
3.4	Tax base to the demand side.....	323
3.5	Distinction between PEs and subsidiaries.....	324
3.6	Factor thresholds.....	325
3.6.1	Introductory comments.....	325
3.6.2	Sales factor.....	327

- 3.6.3 Payroll / employee factor..... 328
- 3.6.4 Asset factor ..... 330
- 3.6.5 Users ..... 330
- 3.7 Example 1 (traditional MNE)..... 333
- 3.8 Example 2 (digital MNE)..... 334
- 3.9 Advantages over the Pillar ONE proposal..... 336
- 4 Synthesis ..... 337
- Conclusion ..... 339**
- 1 Summary ..... 339
- 2 Final word ..... 344
- Bibliography ..... 347**
- Books..... 347
- International Organizations ..... 353
- Articles..... 362
- Others..... 374