

Systemic Stability and the Role of Macro-Prudential Policy

An Analysis of Policy Objectives, Tools and
Implementation in the UK, Switzerland and the US

DISSERTATION

der Rechtswissenschaftlichen Fakultät
der Universität Zürich

zur Erlangung der Würde einer Doktorin der Rechtswissenschaft

vorgelegt von

Ruby Pillai

von
England

genehmigt auf Antrag von

Prof. Dr. Samuel Kern Alexander
und
Prof. Dr. Christos Gortsos

Contents

Foreword	V
Abstract.....	VII
Acknowledgements	IX
Abbreviations.....	XVII
Chapter 1.....	1
1. Introduction: Tackling Complexity and Scale to Engender a more Stable and Sustainable Financial System	1
1.1. Introduction	1
1.2. Book Objectives	8
1.3. The contributions of the book.....	9
1.4. Chapter roadmap.....	10
Chapter 2.....	15
2. Understanding Systemic Risk: Evolution of Perspective on Risk	15
2.1. Introduction	15
2.2. Understanding the Banking Business and its Evolution	18
2.3. Understanding Systemic Risk.....	21
2.4. Distinguishing a System from an Ecosystem.....	22
2.5. Defining Systemic Risk	24
2.6. Definition of Systemic Risk and the Social Cost of Systemic Risk	27
2.7. Factors Affecting Financial System Performance: Endogenous and Exogenous Risks.....	28
2.7.1. Endogenous Risk	32
2.7.1.1. Interconnectedness Created by Interbank Borrowing and Lending Activities.....	32
2.7.1.2. Syndicated Loan Market, Interbank, LIBOR Rate, and Monetary Policy Interactions.....	37
2.7.1.3. Interconnectedness Created by Securities Trading Activities	39
2.7.1.4. Interconnectedness and the Importance of Large Financial Institutions	41
2.7.1.5. Interconnectedness in the Financial System with Shadow Banking.....	43
2.7.2. Exogenous Risks.....	46
2.7.2.1. Household and Property Cycles and Financial Sector Instability.....	47

2.7.2.2.	Business Cycles, Bank Performance, and Systemic Risk.....	50
2.7.2.3.	Systemic Risk, Developed Economies and their Impact on the Development of Emerging Economies	52
2.7.2.4.	Economic Policy, Bank Performance, and Systemic Risk.....	53
2.7.2.5.	Foreign Capital Flows and Systemic Risk.....	57
2.8.	Conclusion.....	58
Chapter 3.....		61
3.	Regulation of Systemic Risk and the Emergence of Macro-Prudential Policy	61
3.1.	Introduction	61
3.2.	A Legal Perspective on Financial Regulation and Supervision.....	62
3.3.	Rationale for Macro-Prudential Policy: Moving Away from Private Interest to a Global Public Interest Approach.....	64
3.4.	What is Public Interest in a Globalised World?	65
3.4.1.	Pursuance of Collective Goals Through Internalising Costs	67
3.5.	Overview of Pre-crisis Financial Regulation: Micro-prudential Policy and its Evolution	69
3.5.1.	Pre-crisis Regulatory Objectives.....	71
3.5.2.	Improvement of Basel 1: The 1996 Amendment	75
3.5.3.	Core Principles of Banking Supervision: Individual Institution-focused Approach.....	77
3.6.	Understanding Macro-Prudential Policy.....	78
3.6.1.	Defining Macro-prudential Policy	80
3.6.2.	Objectives of Macro-Prudential Policy.....	81
3.7.	Some Distinguishing Aspects of Macro-Prudential Policy.....	81
3.7.1.	Flexible Policy and Adaptation to Changing Environmental Conditions.....	82
3.7.2.	Fusion of the Private and Public Interest: A New Collective Approach	84
3.7.3.	Moving Away from an Individual System to an ‘Ecosystem as a Whole’ Approach.....	85
3.7.4.	Supervision in the Form of System-Wide Surveillance	86
3.7.5.	Renewed Appreciation for the Role of Central Banks.....	88
3.8.	Conclusion.....	89

Chapter 4	91
4. Macro-prudential Policy Frameworks: Institutional Structure and Instruments.....	91
4.1. Introduction	91
4.2. A Legal Perspective on Policy Instruments	93
4.3. Macro-prudential Policy Frameworks	95
4.4. Instruments of Macro-Prudential Policy.....	96
4.4.1. Macro-prudential Policy Instruments	96
4.4.2. Objectives, Tools, and Risk	97
4.5. Liquidity-based Instruments	98
4.5.1. Liquidity Coverage Ratio.....	99
4.5.2. Net Stable Funding Ratio.....	102
4.6. Capital-based Instruments	103
4.6.1. Countercyclical Capital Buffers.....	104
4.6.2. Credit-to-GDP.....	105
4.6.3. Different Approaches	106
4.6.4. Other Possible Indicators	107
4.7. Sectoral Capital Buffer	108
4.8. Structural Instruments.....	111
4.9. Asset-based Instruments (Sectoral or Borrower-based Instruments).....	112
4.9.1. Loan-to-Value Ratio.....	112
4.9.2. Debt-to-Income Ratio	114
4.10. Leverage Ratio.....	116
4.11. Comparison of the Use of Macro-Prudential Tools in Some Emerging Economies.....	117
4.11.1. Macro-Prudential Cross-Country Comparison Table.....	120
4.12. Non-instrumental aspects of Macro-prudential Policy	125
4.12.1. Supervisory Process.....	126
4.13. Conclusion.....	128
Chapter 5	133
5. Implementation of Macro-Prudential Policy in the UK, Switzerland and the US.....	133
5.1. Introduction	133
5.2. Evolution of the Statutory Framework for UK Financial Services Regulation.....	133
5.2.1. The European Community Entry and Harmonisation of Banking Laws.....	134

5.2.2.	EEC Banking Directive 1977 and Banking Act 1979	135
5.2.3.	The Banking Act 1987	136
5.2.4.	Banking Reform in 1997: Introduction of the FSA.....	138
5.3.	Crisis and Financial Services Regulatory and Supervisory Reform in the UK	139
5.3.1.	Regulatory Response: Changes in the Institutional Structure of Supervision and Regulation	141
5.3.2.	FSA 2012 and a Central Bank-based Control Model.....	143
5.3.3.	Macro-prudential Supervision in the UK.....	145
5.3.3.1.	The FPC and Macro-Prudential Supervision	146
5.3.3.2.	Members of the FPC.....	147
5.3.4.	The FPC and Macro-Prudential Regulatory Tools.....	147
5.3.4.1.	Capital Requirements Regulation and Directive: CRD IV.....	148
5.3.4.2.	CRD IV: The PRA Rulebook.....	149
5.3.5.	PRA: Micro-prudential and Macro-Prudential Tools.....	150
5.3.5.1.	Internal Risk Capital Assessment Requirements	152
5.3.6.	The FPC and Macro-Prudential Toolkit.....	152
5.3.6.1.	Countercyclical Capital Buffer	153
5.3.6.2.	Sectoral Capital Requirements	153
5.3.6.3.	Leverage ratio	154
5.3.6.4.	Housing Market Tools	155
5.3.7.	Single Supervisory Mechanism and the UK.....	156
5.3.8.	Brexit and UK Financial Regulation: Impact on Directives and Regulations	157
5.3.9.	Conclusion.....	159
5.4.	Crisis and Financial Services Regulatory and Supervisory Reform in Switzerland.....	160
5.4.1.	Overview of the Swiss Banking System	162
5.4.2.	Swiss Law and Legal Instruments	163
5.4.3.	Evolution of Swiss Financial Services Regulation	164
5.4.4.	Post-Crisis Regulatory Reform and Supervisory Structure.....	166
5.4.4.1.	Implementing Basel III: Macro-prudential Policy Objectives in Switzerland.....	167
5.4.4.2.	Swiss Approach to Macro-Prudential Regulation: Abolishment of the ‘Swiss Finish’.....	168
5.4.4.3.	Implementing Basel III Objectives.....	168
5.4.4.4.	Changes to the Definition of Capital	169
5.4.4.5.	Countercyclical Capital Buffer	171

5.4.4.6.	Swiss National Bank, FINMA and the Federal Council	172
5.4.5.	Systemic Risk Buffer for Globally Systemically Important Banks	173
5.4.5.1.	Total Loss Absorbing Capacity (TLAC).....	175
5.4.5.2.	Leverage Ratio and Large Exposures	175
5.4.5.3.	Liquidity Coverage Ratio and Net Stable Ratio	176
5.4.6.	Conclusion	176
5.5.	Evolution of Financial Regulation in the US.....	177
5.5.1.	The US Legal and Regulatory Framework and its Evolution	177
5.5.2.	Crisis and Changes in Regulation and Supervision	180
5.5.3.	Basel III: Macro-prudential Tools.....	181
5.5.3.1.	Leverage Ratio.....	182
5.5.3.2.	Countercyclical Capital Buffer	183
5.5.3.3.	Liquidity Coverage Ratio	184
5.5.3.4.	Net Stable Funding Ratio	184
5.5.3.5.	Caps on Loan-to-Value Ratios	185
5.5.4.	TLAC: Additional Capital Requirements for G-SIBs.....	185
5.5.5.	Conclusion	186
5.6.	A Cross-Country Comparison of Macro-prudential Supervision and Regulation.....	187
5.7.	Overall Conclusion	194
Chapter 6.....	197	
6.	Conclusion: An Ideal Public Policy for the Financial Sector: A Collaborative Approach.....	197
6.1.	Introduction	197
6.2.	A Collaborative Approach to Financial Regulation	201
6.3.	Legalising a Supervisory Process	202
6.4.	Using Agile Technology to Track Systemic Risk	203
6.5.	Green Business Model and Reward-Based Policy Tools.....	205
6.6.	Granular risk approach	207
6.7.	Impact assessment of financial innovation	208
6.8.	Allowing financial institutions to fail	209
6.9.	Some Personal Reflections on Financial Regulation and the Role of Law.....	209

Appendix.....	213
7. Bibliography.....	213
7.1. Legislation.....	213
7.1.1. UK Legislation.....	213
7.1.2. EU Legislation.....	213
7.1.3. US Legislation.....	213
7.1.4. Swiss Legislation.....	214
7.2. UK Policy Documents and Information.....	214
7.3. EU Policy Documents and Information.....	216
7.4. Australia, New Zealand, Swiss and US Policy Documents and Information.....	217
7.4.1. Australia.....	217
7.4.2. New Zealand.....	218
7.4.3. Switzerland.....	219
7.4.4. United States.....	220
7.5. Books and Article.....	223
7.6. BIS Report and Papers.....	226
7.7. Other International Organisations and Papers.....	230
7.8. News and Market Information.....	231