

On the Duty and Power of Architectural Criticism

Kenneth Frampton Philippa Tumubweinee
Ruth Verde Zein Zheng Shiling

Elias Constantopoulos Manuel Cuadra
Fernando Diez Hélène Janniére Li Xiangning
Robert McCarter Valerio Paolo Mosco
Louise Noelle Gras Şengül Öymen Gür
Xing Ruan Paolo Scrivano Ana Tostões

Carolina Chaves Błażej Ciarkowski
Carlos Eduardo Comas Marcos Almeida
paolo conrad-bercah Cláudia Costa Cabral
Özlem Erdoğan Erkarşlan Murat Burak Altınışik
Mustafa Batu Kepekçioğlu Jasna Galjer
Christophe van Gerrewey Berna Göl
Kristen Harrison Martin Hartung
Morten Birk Jørgensen Kevin Low
Konstantinos Petrakos Jaime Solares
Alexandra Staub Horacio Torrent
Konstantinos Tsiambaos Caroline Voet
Lynnette Widder Seda Zafer

Editor Wilfried Wang

Table of Contents

Introduction

On the Duty and Power of Architectural Criticism	<i>Wilfried Wang</i>	10
An Outline of Architectural Criticism	<i>Wilfried Wang</i>	13
The Power to Behold	<i>Louise Noelle Gras</i>	18
For a Historiography of Architectural Criticism	<i>Hélène Jannière, Paolo Scrivano</i>	22
The Architect as Critic	<i>Elias Constantopoulos</i>	30
Architectural Curation: A Practice of Architectural Criticism	<i>Li Xiangning, Mo Wanli, Zhang Ziyue</i>	38
Translating Scale from Models to Buildings	<i>Fernando Diez</i>	46
In the Absence of Appropriateness: On the Need to Respect and Sustain Existing Places in Making Additions	<i>Robert McCarter</i>	58
In Praise of Urban Continuity: Siza's Re-creation of the Chiado	<i>Ana Tostões</i>	68

1 Origins and Approaches

Architectural Criticism and the Politics of Architecture	<i>Kenneth Frampton</i>	80
A Critique of Building Construction: Tactics of "Resistance" in Pikionis's Acropolis Works	<i>Kostas Tsiambaos</i>	84
Paradigms of Design and Deep Readings: The Creative Emancipation of Critical Building Analysis	<i>Caroline Voet</i>	94
The Dominant Paradigm We Call Design	<i>Kevin Low</i>	106
Truth Content: SANAA's Rolex Learning Center	<i>Christophe van Gerrewey</i>	116

2 High Culture in Conflict

The End of Architectural Criticism?	<i>Zheng Shiling</i>	126
Niemeyer Do(o)med: Remembrances of Planes Past	<i>Carlos Eduardo Comas, Marcos Almeida</i>	132
"The New MoMA": Architectural Criticism, 1979–2019	<i>Martin Hartung</i>	142
On Lina Bo Bardi's Iconography: Three Drawings	<i>Cláudia Costa Cabral</i>	152
Imported Starchitect in a Local Market	<i>Seda Zafer</i>	162

3 Criticism and Its Effects

The Role of Architectural Criticism in the Design of Twenty-first-century History Surveys	<i>Ruth Verde Zein</i>	172
Architectural Criticism in the Space for the Unexpected	<i>Jasna Galjer</i>	180
Aphaeresis and Urban Policies	<i>Konstantinos Petrakos</i>	192
Nineteen Verdicts on the Viking Ship Hall	<i>Morten Birk Jørgensen</i>	200
Architectural Criticism on Post-World War II Collective Housing: Complicity in a Historical Prejudice?	<i>Carolina Chaves</i>	212

4 Explicit Criticism

Architectural Criticism in the Emergent Urbanscapes of the Global South	<i>Philippa Turnubweinee</i>	224
"The Lightest Parliament in the World": Hans Schwippert's Bundeshaus (1949)	<i>Lynette Widder</i>	234
Whose Architecture? Whose Criticism?: Applying Stakeholder Theory to the Process of Criticism	<i>Alexandra Staub</i>	244
The Lost Battle for Memory: The European Solidarity Centre in Gdańsk and Architectural Criticism in Poland	<i>Błażej Ciarkowski</i>	254
The New Istanbul Museum of Painting and Sculpture as a Case for Multi-perspectival Criticism in Contemporary Turkish Architecture	<i>Özlem Erdoğan Erkarlan, Burak Altınışık, Batu Kepekcioglu</i>	262

5 Critical Reflections

Critical Misfortune, Canonical Narratives, and the Failure of the Practical Sense: The UN-ECLAC Building in Santiago de Chile by Emilio Duhart (1960–1966)	<i>Horacio Torrent</i>	274
Critical Influence: The Influence of the Popular Architectural Critic on Architectural Decision-making	<i>Kristen Harrison</i>	284
In Search of the Latent Kairos of Architectural Form	<i>paolo conrad-bercah</i>	292
The Squatting of Technology: A Twofold Continuum	<i>Berna Göf</i>	302
The Architecture of Redemption: A House on the Periphery of the Discipline	<i>Jaime Solares Carmona</i>	310