

**The Implementation of Free, Prior and Informed Consent and
Indigenous Peoples' Rights under the OECD Guidelines for
Multinational Enterprises**

**An Analysis of the Regulatory Framework
and
OECD National Contact Point Cases**

Dissertation
der Rechtswissenschaftlichen Fakultät
der Universität Zürich
zur Erlangung der Würde einer Doktorin der Rechtswissenschaft

vorgelegt von

Fanny Pulver
von Aarberg BE

betreut durch
Prof. Dr. Christine Kaufmann
Zweitgutachter
Prof. Dr. Bas Rombouts

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	VII
Content Overview	IX
Table of Contents	XI
Table of Figures.....	XVII
List of Abbreviations	XIX
Bibliography.....	XXIII
Jurisprudence	LV
Chapter 1: Introduction.....	1
I. Business and Indigenous Peoples: Setting the Scene.....	4
A. Key Parties and Relations in Development Projects: The Larger Picture	10
1. Indigenous Peoples	11
2. States and Human Rights Obligations.....	12
3. Corporations and Human Rights Responsibilities.....	15
B. Indigenous Peoples' Rights.....	16
II. Research Gap, Aim, Questions, and Scope.....	19
III. Methodology and Sources.....	25
IV. Structure of this Thesis.....	26
Chapter 2: International Legal Framework on Indigenous Peoples' Rights and FPIC: State Obligations.....	29
I. ILO Framework.....	30
A. ILO's Indigenous and Tribal Populations Convention, 1957 (No. 107).....	31
B. ILO's Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention, 1989 (No. 169).....	34
1. ILO's Supervisory System and ILO C 169.....	37
(a) Brief Outline.....	37
(b) Challenge of Accessibility	39
2. Consultation and Participation in ILO C 169	40
(a) Concept of Consultation and Participation	41
(i) Arts. 6 and 7 of ILO C 169	41
(ii) Controversy.....	42
(iii) Duty Bearer	43
(iv) Rights Holders and the Issue of Representation	44
(v) Good Faith Consultation with the Objective of Obtaining Consent	46

(b)	Consultation and Participation in Relation to Land and Natural Resources.....	49
(i)	Land Rights	49
(ii)	Resource Rights.....	52
(iii)	Indigenous Peoples' Relocation.....	56
3.	Business Perspective.....	59
4.	Politics of Interpretation.....	62
C.	Interim Conclusion.....	65
II.	UN Framework	67
A.	UNDRIP	68
1.	Rationale, Scope and Controversies.....	70
2.	Land and Resource Rights in the UNDRIP	71
(a)	Indigenous Peoples' Rights to Lands, Territories, and Resources	72
(b)	Indigenous Peoples' Land and Resource Rights in the Context of Development Projects	75
(c)	Implementation of Development Projects: Limitations on Rights and the State Duty to Protect Indigenous Peoples' Rights in International Practice.....	78
(i)	Inter-American Human Rights System: IACHR and IACtHR.....	78
(ii)	UN SRRIP	81
(iii)	UN Treaty Bodies: HR Committee, CESCR, and CERD.....	86
(d)	Interim Conclusion.....	93
3.	Participation, Consultation, and FPIC in the UNDRIP.....	93
(a)	General Remarks.....	93
(b)	FPIC in the UNDRIP: Arts. 10, 19, 29(2) and 32(2).....	95
B.	Consultation and FPIC in the Work of the UNPFII, SRRIP, and EMRIP.....	97
1.	Rationale and Normative Grounding of Consultation and FPIC	98
2.	Duty Bearer(s).....	99
3.	Consultation and FPIC: Substantive Dimension	101
(a)	Notions of FPIC	101
(b)	Material Scope.....	103
(i)	Obligation to Consult.....	103
(ii)	Obligation to Obtain FPIC: Sliding Scale Approach	103
4.	Consultation and FPIC: Procedural Dimension	106
(a)	Fair and Adequate Consultation	106
(b)	'Free', 'Prior', 'Informed', 'Consent'	107
C.	Consultation and FPIC: The Practices of the CERD, HR Committee, and CESCR.....	110
1.	CERD.....	110
2.	HR Committee.....	112
3.	CESCR.....	114
D.	Interim Conclusion.....	115
III.	Consultation and FPIC in the Jurisprudence of the IACtHR.....	116

A. Institutional Setting and Mandate of the IACtHR	117
B. Effective Participation: Consultation and FPIC	118
1. Saramaka People v Suriname	118
2. Kichwa Indigenous People of Sarayaku v Ecuador	121
3. Kaliña and Lokono Peoples v Suriname	124
C. Interim Conclusion	125
IV. Conclusion	126

Chapter 3: Business and Indigenous Peoples' Rights: Regulatory Framework on the Corporate Responsibility to Respect

Indigenous Peoples' Rights and FPIC 131

I. Business and Human Rights	132
A. Background	132
B. End of the Beginning: Key Instruments and a Paradigm Shift	134
1. UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights	135
(a) The Three Pillars	135
(b) Legal Nature and Normative Value	136
2. OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises	138
3. ILO Tripartite Declaration of Principles Concerning Multinational Enterprises and Social Policy	140
4. Paradigm Shift	142
5. Criticism	146
C. Corporate Responsibility to Respect Human Rights: Conceptualization and Operationalization	147
1. Conceptualization: Type of Involvement in Adverse Human Rights Impacts	148
2. Operationalization	151
(a) Human Rights Policy Commitment	151
(b) Human Rights Due Diligence	153
(c) Remediation	155
D. Recent Developments: 2011 until the Beginning of 2022	155
II. Business and Indigenous Peoples' Rights	158
A. Indigenous Peoples' Rights and FPIC in the Key RBC Instruments	161
1. Explicit Reference	161
2. Implicit Reference	163
(a) Stakeholder Engagement	163
(b) Sustainable Development and Environmental Protection	168
B. OECD RBC Guidance Documents, Indigenous Peoples' Rights and FPIC	169
1. OECD Due Diligence Guidance for Responsible Business Conduct (2018)	171
2. OECD-FAO Guidance for Responsible Agricultural Supply Chains (2016)	174
(a) Customary Land Tenure Rights	174
(b) Benefit Sharing	177
(c) Consultation and the Principle of FPIC	178

(d) Interim Conclusion.....	181
3. OECD Due Diligence Guidance for Meaningful Stakeholder Engagement in the Extractive Sector (2017).....	183
(a) Due Diligence Framework and Meaningful Stakeholder Engagement.....	184
(i) Engagement with Indigenous Peoples: Understanding the Local Context.....	186
(ii) Identification and Prioritization of Indigenous Peoples.....	188
(iii) Support System for Meaningful Engagement with Indigenous Peoples.....	189
(iv) Designing Appropriate and Effective Activities and Processes for Engagement with Indigenous Peoples.....	190
(b) Interim Conclusion.....	193
C. IFC Performance Standards, Indigenous Peoples' Rights and FPIC.....	195
1. General Remarks.....	195
2. Performance Standard 1.....	197
3. Performance Standard 7.....	198
(a) Free, Prior, and Informed Consultation and Participation.....	199
(b) Free, Prior, and Informed Consent.....	201
4. Interim Conclusion and Criticism.....	203
III. Conclusion.....	206
Chapter 4: OECD National Contact Points.....	213
I. Preliminary Remarks.....	214
II. Institutional Setting.....	217
III. Mandate.....	219
A. Promotional Activities.....	220
B. Dispute Resolution or the 'Handling of Specific Instances'.....	220
1. Procedures for Handling Complaints.....	222
(a) Coordination and Cooperation.....	223
(b) Step 1: Initial Assessment.....	224
(c) Step 2: Dispute Resolution.....	225
(i) Procedural Aspect.....	225
(ii) Substantive Aspect.....	226
(d) Step 3: Conclusion of the Procedure.....	227
2. NCPs and Remedy.....	229
3. NCPs as Potential Sources of Guidance and Norms for Responsible Business Conduct.....	232
(a) General Remarks.....	232
(b) NCP Statements: Recommendations and Determinations.....	236
(i) Facts and Figures.....	236
(ii) Opportunities and Challenges.....	238
IV. Critics and Challenges.....	240
V. Conclusion.....	242

Chapter 5: NCPs' 'Jurisprudence' on Indigenous Peoples	243
I. Methodology of Chapter 5.....	244
A. NCP Case Collection and Selection Process.....	245
B. Methods Applied in the Analysis of NCPs' Cases on Indigenous Peoples... ..	248
II. Typology of NCPs' Indigenous Peoples' Cases.....	250
A. NCPs Involved, Submission Dates, and Case Status	250
B. Parties Involved and the Country of Business Operation.....	253
C. Cited Chapters of the OECD Guidelines and Key Issues Raised.....	255
III. Key Issues of the Corporate Responsibility to Respect Indigenous Peoples' Rights and FPIC: A Closer Look at NCPs' Reasoning	257
A. Meaningful Stakeholder Engagement, Consultation, and FPIC	258
1. Adopted Reasoning.....	258
2. Summary and Reflections	273
B. Environmental, Social, and Human Rights Impact Assessments	281
1. Adopted Reasoning.....	281
2. Summary and Reflections	284
C. Corporate (Human Rights) Policy.....	286
1. Adopted Reasoning.....	286
2. Summary and Reflections	290
D. (Human Rights) Due Diligence.....	291
1. Adopted Reasoning	291
2. Summary and Reflections	296
E. Remediation	298
1. Adopted Reasoning.....	298
2. Summary and Reflections	301
F. Indigenous Peoples' Rights.....	302
1. Adopted Reasoning	302
2. Summary and Reflections	307
IV. Conclusion.....	309
Chapter 6: Conclusions and Way Forward	317
I. Summary of the Findings	317
A. States as the Main Duty Bearers	317
B. Politics of Interpretation.....	318
C. Corporate Responsibility to Respect Indigenous Peoples' Rights and FPIC: Governing Rules, Content, and Operationalization	319
D. NCPs' Contribution	321
II. Shortcomings and the Way Forward.....	322
A. Shortcomings.....	322
1. Shortcomings of the OECD Guidelines	322
2. Shortcomings of NCPs' Indigenous Peoples' Rights 'Jurisprudence'	326
B. Suggestions and Recommendations.....	326
III. Concluding Remarks	328
Annex: NCP Case Study	329

Table of Figures

Figure 1: Seventeen Lead NCPs and the Number of Cases Handled by Them.....	250
Figure 2: Distribution of NCP Cases Concerning Indigenous Peoples Submitted to the NCPs throughout a Period of Seventeen Years	251
Figure 3: Status of NCP Cases as of 1 March 2021	252
Figure 4: Number of NCP Cases Submitted by Notifying Parties	253
Figure 5: Distribution of the Respondent Industry Sectors Involved in the NCP Cases Concerning Indigenous Peoples	254
Figure 6: Distribution of the Countries in which Business Operations Affecting Indigenous Peoples Took Place.....	254
Figure 7: Distribution of Cited Chapters of the OECD Guidelines in the NCP Cases Concerning Indigenous Peoples.....	256