

International Taxation of Cloud Computing

Permanent Establishment, Treaty
Characterization, and Transfer Pricing

Alexander Weisser



**UNIVERSITÉ
DE GENÈVE**



**EDITIONS JURIDIQUES LIBRES
FREIER JURISTISCHER VERLAG**

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	XIX
List of Abbreviations	XXI
Bibliography	XXXIII
Part I: <i>De Lege Lata</i>	1
Chapter 1: Introduction	3
Chapter 2: Cloud Computing	5
Section I Basics	5
Section II Typical Fact Patterns	9
§ I. Introduction	9
§ II. Case Study A: Cloud Provider	9
§ III. Case Study B: Cloud Customer	10
Section III Types of Transactions	13
§ I. Introduction	13
§ II. Taxonomy	14
§ III. Commentary	16
Section IV Parties to Transactions	19
§ I. Introduction	19
§ II. Cloud-Specific Transactions with a Centralized Provider	22
A) Cloud-Specific Pricing	22
B) Risks	25
§ III. Transactions within a Decentralized Cloud Provider	27
A) Introduction	27
B) Software Development Team	28

C)	Hardware Operation Team	29
D)	Intellectual Property Rights Company	32
E)	Real Estate Company	35
Section V	Summary.....	37
Chapter 3:	Current International Taxation Rules	39
Section I	Permanent Establishments	39
§ I.	Introduction.....	39
§ II.	General Definition of Permanent Establishment..	42
A)	Introduction	42
B)	Place of Business Test	43
1)	Introduction	43
2)	Tangible Nature of a Place of Business	44
3)	Right of Use ("at disposal")	44
a)	Introduction	44
b)	Negative Definition.....	48
i)	Legal Right.....	48
ii)	Association with Other Permanent Establishment Tests.....	48
iii)	Association with Other Types of Permanent Establishments	51
iv)	Mere Presence.....	52
4)	Conclusion on the Place of Business Test	53
C)	Fixation Test	53
1)	Introduction	53
2)	Geographical Link.....	54
3)	Duration	54
a)	Required Minimum Period of Time	55

b)	Non-temporary Nature	56
4)	Conclusion on the Fixation Test	57
D)	Business Activity Test	57
1)	Introduction and General Features of Business Activity	57
2)	Functional Integration ("through which")	60
3)	Attribution of Activity ("of an enterprise")	64
a)	Introduction	64
b)	Standard Case: Personnel	65
c)	Subcontractors?	66
d)	Conclusion on the Attribution of Activity	69
4)	Conclusion on the Business Activity Test	69
E)	Preparatory or Auxiliary Activities Exception	70
1)	Introduction	70
2)	List of Examples	71
3)	General Criterion	73
4)	Anti-avoidance Rules	75
5)	Conclusion on the Activities Exception	76
F)	Conclusion on the General Definition	77
§ III.	Dependent Agent Permanent Establishment	77
A)	Treaty Definition	77
B)	Person	80
C)	Authority to Conclude Contracts in the Name of the Enterprise	81
1)	Literal Meaning of Pre-BEPS Art. 5(5) MOECD ...	81
2)	"Commissionnaire" Arrangements and Similar Schemes	83

3)	BEPS Action 7	84
4)	Economic Interpretation of the Pre-BEPS Art. 5(5) MOECD	88
5)	Summary.....	91
D)	Exclusion of Independent Agents	91
1)	Introduction	91
2)	Independence of the Agent	92
3)	Acting in the Ordinary Course of the Agent's Business	94
4)	BEPS Action 7	95
5)	Summary.....	97
E)	Habitual Exercise.....	97
F)	Preparatory or Auxiliary Activities Exception	99
G)	Conclusion on Dependent Agent Permanent Establishments	99
§ IV.	Services Permanent Establishment.....	100
§ V.	Substantial Equipment Permanent Establishment	101
§ VI.	Swiss Domestic Permanent Establishment.....	102
A)	Introduction and Scope of Application	102
B)	Basics and Legislative History.....	103
C)	Comparison with the MOECD General Definition	105
D)	Comparison with a Dependent Agent Permanent Establishment.....	107
E)	Summary.....	110
§ VII.	Conclusion on Permanent Establishments	111
Section II	Treaty Characterization.....	113

§ I.	Introduction	113
§ II.	Income from Immovable Property	114
A)	General Features.....	114
B)	Immovable Property	115
C)	Accessories to Immovable Property.....	117
D)	ICS Equipment	118
E)	Summary	119
§ III.	Royalties.....	120
A)	General Features.....	120
B)	Definitions	121
1)	Royalties.....	121
2)	Copyright.....	122
3)	Know-How	122
C)	Summary	124
§ IV.	Capital Gains.....	124
§ V.	Technical Services.....	125
A)	General Features	125
B)	MOECD	128
C)	UN Model.....	128
D)	Law of the Source Jurisdiction.....	129
E)	Summary	130
§ VI.	Business Profits	130
§ VII.	Summary of Treaty Characterization	132
Section III	Transfer Pricing	135
§ I.	Introduction	135
§ II.	Associated Enterprises	137

§ III.	Arm's Length Principle	138
§ IV.	Comparability Analysis.....	140
§ V.	Transfer Pricing Methods	141
A)	Introduction	141
B)	Comparable Uncontrolled Price Method.....	142
C)	Cost-Plus Method	142
D)	Transactional Net Margin Method	144
E)	Transactional Profit Split Method	147
F)	Summary on Transfer Pricing Methods	149
§ VI.	Swiss Legal Basis for Initial Adjustment	150
A)	Introduction	150
B)	Commercial Accounts.....	150
C)	Corrective Rules and Adjustments	151
D)	Connection with Profit Attribution to Permanent Establishments	152
§ VII.	Summary of Transfer Pricing	154
Section IV	Summary of the Relevant Rules	157
Chapter 4:	Application to Cloud Computing	159
Section I	Permanent Establishment	159
§ I.	General Definition of Permanent Establishment	159
A)	Introduction	159
B)	Case Study A: Cloud Provider	162
1)	Introduction	162
2)	Place of Business Test	163
3)	Fixation Test	165
4)	Business Activity Test.....	166
a)	Introduction	166

b)	General Features	166
c)	Functional Integration ("through which").....	166
d)	Attribution of Activity ("of an enterprise")	168
e)	Conclusion on the Business Activity Test.....	169
5)	Exception of Preparatory or Auxiliary Activities	169
a)	Introduction.....	169
b)	Lists of Examples	170
c)	General Criterion.....	172
d)	Conclusion on the Exception of Activities	174
6)	Conclusion on Case Study A: Cloud Provider ...	174
C)	Case Study B: Cloud Customer.....	175
1)	Introduction	175
2)	Place of Business Test	175
a)	Introduction.....	175
b)	Tangible Nature of the Place of Business.....	175
c)	Right of Use ("at disposal")	177
i)	Introduction.....	177
ii)	Right of Use in the Context of E-commerce	177
iii)	Critical Appraisal	179
iv)	Application to Cloud Computing	182
v)	Possible Answer No. 1: Cloud Customers Have a Right of Use over the Physical Server	183
vi)	Possible Answer No. 2: Cloud Customers Have No Right of Use over the Physical Server	185
d)	Conclusion on the Place of Business Test....	188

3)	Fixation Test	188
a)	Introduction	188
b)	Execution of Virtual Servers Shared Between Different Items of Physical Infrastructure	189
c)	Interruptions	190
d)	Conclusion on the Fixation Test.....	191
4)	Business Activity Test.....	192
a)	Introduction	192
b)	General Features of the Business Activity.....	192
c)	Functional Integration ("through which")	193
d)	Attribution of Activity ("of an enterprise").....	194
e)	Conclusion on the Business Activity Test	195
5)	Exception of Preparatory or Auxiliary Activities	195
a)	Introduction	195
b)	Lists of Examples.....	195
c)	General Criterion	196
d)	Anti-avoidance Rules.....	197
e)	Conclusion on the Exception of Activities.....	199
6)	Conclusion on Case Study B: Cloud Customer..	199
D)	Conclusion on the Application of the General Definition.....	200
§ II.	Dependent Agent Permanent Establishment.....	200
A)	Introduction	200
B)	Person	200
C)	Authority to Conclude Contracts in the Name of the Enterprise	203
1)	Literal Meaning of Pre-BEPS Art. 5(5) MOECD..	203

2)	BEPS Action 7	204
3)	Economic Interpretation of Current Art. 5(5) MOECD	206
D)	Exclusion of Independent Agents	207
E)	Habitual Exercise	209
F)	Exception of Preparatory or Auxiliary Activities	210
G)	Conclusion on the Application of the Dependent Agent Permanent Establishment	210
§ III.	Services Permanent Establishment	211
§ IV.	Substantial Equipment Permanent Establishment	211
§ V.	Swiss Domestic Permanent Establishment	212
A)	Introduction	212
B)	Case Study A: Cloud Provider	213
1)	Introduction	213
2)	Place of Business Test	213
3)	Fixation Test	214
4)	Business Activity Test and Exception of Preparatory or Auxiliary Activities	214
5)	Conclusion on Case Study A: Cloud Provider ...	215
C)	Case Study B: Cloud Customer	216
1)	Introduction	216
2)	Place of Business Test	216
3)	Fixation Test	217
4)	Business Activity Test and Exception of Preparatory or Auxiliary Activities	217
5)	Conclusion on Case Study B: Cloud Customer .	218

D)	Conclusion on the Application of the Swiss Domestic Permanent Establishment	218
§ VI.	Conclusion on the Cloud Computing Permanent Establishment	219
Section II	Treaty Characterization.....	221
§ I.	Introduction.....	221
§ II.	Income from Immovable Property	223
A)	Transactions	223
B)	Data Center as Immovable Property	225
C)	Server as a Constituent Part.....	225
D)	Server as an Accessory.....	227
E)	Server as ICS Equipment	228
F)	Conclusion	231
§ III.	Royalties	232
A)	Copyright	232
1)	Introduction in the Context of E-Commerce.....	232
2)	Cloud Computing Transactions at Issue	235
3)	Distinction from Software Code Transmission	238
4)	Conclusion	240
B)	Know-How.....	240
C)	Conclusion	242
§ IV.	Capital Gains	243
§ V.	Technical Services	245
A)	OECD and UN Model	245
B)	Law of the Source Jurisdiction	248
§ VI.	Business Profits	249
A)	General Considerations.....	249

B)	Summary	250
§ VII.	Conclusion on Treaty Characterization	252
Section III	Transfer Pricing	255
§ I.	Introduction	255
§ II.	Comparability Analysis	256
A)	Cloud-Specific Transactions with a Centralized Provider	256
B)	Transactions within a Decentralized Cloud Provider	258
1)	Between the Software Development and Hardware Operation Teams.....	258
2)	Between Software Development Team and Intellectual Property Rights Company.....	262
3)	Between Hardware Operation Team and Real Estate Company	263
C)	Conclusion on the Comparability Analysis	264
§ III.	Choice of Transfer Pricing Method	265
A)	Introduction	265
B)	Comparable Uncontrolled Price Method	265
C)	Cost-Plus Method.....	266
D)	Transactional Net Margin Method	270
E)	Transactional Profit Split Method	272
§ IV.	Conclusion on Transfer Pricing	274
Chapter 5:	Conclusion De Lege Lata	277
Part II: Are the Current Rules Appropriate?		279
Chapter 1:	Introduction	281
Chapter 2:	Ottawa Principles of Taxation	285
Section I	Effectiveness and Fairness	285

Section II	Certainty and Simplicity	289
Section III	Flexibility	295
Section IV	Neutrality	301
Section V	Efficiency	303
Section VI	Summary.....	305
Chapter 3:	Prior Work	307
Section I	Introduction	307
Section II	Modification of the OECD COMMENTARY	311
Section III	PE Report	315
Section IV	TP Report.....	319
Section V	Example in BEPS Action 1	323
§ I.	Problem	323
§ II.	Risk Level	325
§ III.	Connection with Cloud Computing	332
§ IV.	Conclusion on BEPS Action 1	334
Section VI	Summary of Prior Work	335
Chapter 4:	Application to Cloud Computing	337
Section I	Introduction	337
Section II	Effectiveness and Fairness	337
§ I.	Introduction.....	337
§ II.	Permanent Establishment	339
A)	Manipulation of the Location of Virtual Servers.....	339
1)	Problem	339
2)	Connection with Cloud Computing.....	340
3)	Risk Level.....	341
4)	Conclusion	342

B)	Avoidance of Permanent Establishment Status Through Lack of Personnel	344
1)	Problem.....	344
2)	Connection with Cloud Computing	345
3)	Risk Level	345
4)	Conclusion.....	346
C)	Avoidance of Permanent Establishment Status Through Outsourcing	347
1)	Problem.....	347
2)	Connection with Cloud Computing	348
3)	Risk Level	350
4)	Conclusion.....	351
§ III.	Avoidance of Withholding Taxes	352
A)	Problem.....	352
B)	Connection with Cloud Computing	352
C)	Risk Level	353
D)	Conclusion.....	354
§ IV.	Transfer Pricing.....	354
A)	Difficulty of Valuing Intangibles	354
1)	Problem.....	354
2)	Connection with Cloud Computing	356
3)	Risk Level	359
4)	Conclusion.....	361
B)	Effects of Cost Savings on Transfer Pricing	361
1)	Problem.....	361
2)	Connection with Cloud Computing	362
3)	Risk Level	362

4)	Conclusion	363
C)	Shifting of Business Functions to Low-Tax Jurisdiction	363
1)	Problem	363
2)	Connection with Cloud Computing.....	364
3)	Risk Level.....	366
4)	Conclusion	368
§ V.	Enforcement.....	368
A)	Problem	368
B)	Connection with Cloud Computing.....	369
C)	Risk Level.....	370
D)	Conclusion	371
§ VI.	Conclusion on Effectiveness and Fairness	372
Section III	Certainty and Simplicity	375
§ I.	Introduction.....	375
§ II.	Permanent Establishment	375
§ III.	Treaty Characterization	377
A)	Significance in General	377
B)	Application to Cloud Computing	379
§ IV.	Transfer Pricing	382
A)	Introduction	382
B)	Data Centers	383
C)	Intangibles	384
D)	Remote Control and Automation	386
E)	Choice of Method	387
§ V.	Future Tax Policy	390
§ VI.	Conclusion on Certainty	391

Section IV	Flexibility	393
§ I.	Introduction	393
§ II.	Absence of Physical Presence	394
A)	Problem.....	394
B)	Technological Advancements	396
C)	Tax System Inflexibility.....	397
D)	Conclusion.....	400
§ III.	Disintermediation and Outsourcing	400
A)	Problem.....	400
B)	Tax System Inflexibility.....	402
C)	Technological Advancements	402
D)	Conclusion.....	402
§ IV.	Automation and Remote Control	403
A)	Problem.....	403
B)	Tax System Inflexibility.....	403
C)	Technological Advancements	405
D)	Conclusion.....	406
§ V.	Empirical Evidence of Flexibility Issues	407
§ VI.	Conclusion on Flexibility	410
Section V	Neutrality.....	413
§ I.	Between Cloud Computing and Brick-and-Mortar Businesses	413
§ II.	Between Similar Cloud Computing Businesses	414
§ III.	Specific Areas of Application	414
A)	Introduction	414
B)	Permanent Establishment.....	415
C)	Treaty Characterization	416

G)	Summary of the Justification.....	457
§ IV.	Examples	458
§ V.	Alternative	463
§ VI.	Connection with Cloud Computing.....	465
§ VII.	Conclusion.....	467
Section III	Permanent Establishment.....	469
§ I.	Abolition of Right of Use.....	469
A)	General Idea	469
B)	Implementation.....	469
C)	Justification	470
D)	Connection with Cloud Computing	473
E)	Conclusion.....	475
§ II.	Positive Meaning of Right of Use.....	476
A)	General Idea	476
B)	Implementation.....	476
C)	Justification	477
D)	Connection with Cloud Computing	478
E)	Conclusion.....	479
§ III.	Concretization of Essential vs. Auxiliary	479
A)	General Idea	479
B)	Implementation.....	480
C)	Justification	481
D)	Connection with Cloud Computing	484
E)	Conclusion.....	485
§ IV.	Independence vis-à-vis On-Site Personnel.....	486
A)	General Idea	486

B)	Implementation	486
C)	Justification	487
D)	Connection with Cloud Computing.....	488
E)	Conclusion	489
Section IV	Treaty Characterization.....	491
§ I.	Reducing Withholding Tax Compliance Costs...	491
A)	General Idea	491
B)	Implementation	491
C)	Justification	493
D)	Connection with Cloud Computing.....	493
E)	Conclusion	494
§ II.	Adapting Income from Employment	494
A)	General Idea	494
B)	Implementation	495
C)	Justification	496
D)	Connection with Cloud Computing.....	499
E)	Conclusion	500
Section V	Summary of the Present Recommendations.....	501
Chapter 3:	Avenues of Further Research	503
Section I	Introduction	503
Section II	Other Aspects of Tax Law	503
Section III	Other Fields of Legal Study	507
Section IV	Quantitative Research.....	509
Section V	Conclusion on Further Research	511
Chapter 4:	Summary of the International Taxation of Cloud Computing	513