

Clementi and the woman at the piano

*Virtuosity and the marketing of music in
eighteenth-century London*

ERIN HELYARD



OXFORD UNIVERSITY
STUDIES IN THE ENLIGHTENMENT

Contents

List of musical examples	xi
List of tables	xiii
List of figures	xv
Preface	xvii
Chapter 1: Clementi and the Enlightenment	1
Introduction	1
Clementi's interests	6
Clementi as "Beethoven's skeleton"	13
<i>Clementi and the work-concept</i>	19
Discussing eighteenth-century virtuosity	23
Chapter 2: Mozart's insult and the irritations of virtuosity	31
Post-Enlightenment responses to difficulty	31
Reconsidering Mozart on Clementi	35
"Virtuosity" versus "difficulty"	54
Cultural and rhetorical responses to difficult music	59
Charlatans and virtuosi: "Est-ce ironie, ou vérité?"	66
Chapter 3: Keyboard performance and gender in eighteenth-century London	73
Introduction	73
Women (and men) at the keyboard in eighteenth-century England: an overview	75
	vii

Reading regulatory texts: ideologies of behavior	90
“Perpetual babyism”: compulsory passivity at the keyboard	94
Resistance, doubt, and the anxiety of performance	103
Conduct books reflect a changing ideology: 1740–1840	109
The reading woman, the performing woman: “misreading” and “misplaying”	112
Chapter 4: Clementi’s “Black joke”	119
The “Black joke” and bawdiness	119
A crude in-joke?	131
Radical pianism?	132
Before Clementi’s Op. 2	136
After Clementi’s Op. 2	141
Chapter 5: Male <i>theoria</i> and female <i>praxis</i>	151
Introduction	151
An overview of English keyboard culture in the late 1770s	155
Male <i>theoria</i> , female <i>praxis</i> , and the accompanied sonata	168
Difficult music and the male gaze	172
Clementi and counterpoint	183
Novelty and shame in post-Op. 2 keyboard culture	190
Chapter 6: Clementi in the marketplace and the Conservatoire	195
Introduction	195
Clementi’s revisions	197
Topical diversity and the legitimization of pleasure in Op. 37	210
Helping to conquer difficulty: the music-master and his “chest of tools”	227
Clementi’s students and dedicatees	232
The father (also) of French pianism	234
Clementi’s European reputation in the 1800s: from Zurich to Paris	239

The importance of fingering: French pianism of the “Clementi epoch”	244
“Un chant aussi suave”: Clementi in France in the nineteenth century	249
Conclusion: Clementi’s coin	259
Appendix: ideological differences regarding keyboard practicing/music education in thirty-six conduct books and treatises, 1741–1829	269
Bibliography	281
Index	309

List of musical examples

- Example 1: The opening of the “trio” section of the last movement of Clementi’s Op. 7 No. 2, an example of the kind of octaves that Mozart mentions in his letter of June 7, 1783. This is taken from a copy of the Artaria print that Mozart might have seen. 47
- Example 2: A radical enharmonic modulation in the final movement of Op. 7 No. 3. This is taken from a copy of the Artaria print that Mozart might have seen. 50
- Example 3: Performative characteristics in Schroeter’s Op. 1/1/i (1777), mm. 1–53. 84
- Example 4: Imaginary first contact with Clementi’s Op. 2/2/i (1779), mm. 1–39. 87
- Example 5: Imaginary first contact with Clementi’s Op. 2/6/i (1779), mm. 1–23. 89
- Example 6: The “Black joke” (c.1730) and Clementi’s 1777 version, mm. 1–17, compared. 128
- Example 7: Muzio Clementi, ending strategies in 1777 and c.1824 versions of the “Black joke” with a “Black joke” allusion in a 1794 sonata (Op. 33/1/ii). 129
- Example 8: Thirds in Pepusch’s “Overture in the beggar’s opera,” transcribed by Thomas Arne (c.1769). 137
- Example 9: Clementi, scale-exercise in G-sharp minor (1811). *Praxis/theoria* united: an infinitely smooth (*sempre legato*) and infinitely long Möbius strip of counterpoint formulated as a scale-exercise. This is a canon in contrary motion at the sixth. 187

- Example 10: Op. 11/ii, *Larghetto con espressione*, originally published in London, John Kerpen, c.1784, and as revised by Clementi in the *Oeuvres complètes* (Leipzig, Breitkopf & Härtel, 1804). 201
- Example 11: Op. 14/3/iii (1786 and 1815 versions compared). 202
- Example 12: Op. 13/5/i (1786 and 1815 versions compared). 204–6
- Example 13: Clementi's Op. 7/2/i, *Allegro* (London, printed for the Author, 1783), p.10–11. 211
- Example 14: Clementi's Op. 34/1/iii, *Finale: allegro* (London, printed for the Author, 1795), p.9. 214–15
- Example 15: Clementi's Op. 11/iii (London, Kerpen, 1784), p.8. 216
- Example 16: Jane Mary Guest, *Adagio con molto espressione* from *Sonata for the piano forte, with an accompaniment for the violin ad libitum* (London, Clementi & Co., 1807). 223
- Example 17: Muzio Clementi, *Didone abbandonata: scena tragica* (Op. 50/2/ii) (London, Clementi & Co., 1821), p.49. 224
- Example 18: Clementi's Op. 2/4/i, mm. 1–21 (London, Welcker, 1779). 238
- Example 19: Clementi's Op. 2/4/i, mm. 1–21, as revised in 1807. *Nouvelle édition [...] avec des augmentations et améliorations considérables, faites par l'auteur pendant son séjour à Vienne* (Vienna, Artaria, 1807). 252
- Example 20: Clementi's Op. 25/4/i from 1790, as edited by Méreaux (1864–1867). 255

List of tables

Table 1: Synonymous terms relating to “power and skill in performing music” for the English language (from the <i>Historical thesaurus of the Oxford English dictionary</i> , ed. Christian Kay et al., Oxford, 2009).	55
Table 2: Ideological dualities for women in <i>Euterpe, or Remarks on the use and abuse of music, as a part of modern education</i> (c.1779). The ellipses indicate contiguous sentences.	96–97
Table 3: Ideological dualities for men in <i>Euterpe, or Remarks on the use and abuse of music, as a part of modern education</i> (c.1779). The ellipses indicate contiguous sentences.	98–99
Table 4: Annotations by “J. W.” in Rev. Thomas Gisborne, <i>An Enquiry into the duties of the female sex</i> (London, Printed for T. Cadell jun. & W. Davies, 1797), in a copy in Fisher Library, University of Sydney, Australia.	104
Table 5: Lyrics taken from “The original coal-black joke.” British Museum, G. 316. e. f.99.	125
Table 6: Op. 1, the “Black joke,” and Op. 2 compared.	135
Table 7: Typical repertoire of a female keyboardist in the 1770s. Music (now lost) belonging to “Miss Orr 1778” as documented by Eric Halfpenny in 1946.	157
Table 8: Maria’s subjectivity and complementary musical genres in Wollstonecraft’s <i>The Wrongs of woman</i> (published posthumously in 1798).	177

List of figures

- Figure 1: Detail from an undated sketch with two Latin aphorisms attributed to Martial in Clementi's hand. Photo by author (Library of Congress Music Division, Washington, DC). 7
- Figure 2: *καταρτιζοντας* in Clementi's hand from Matthew 4.21, "mending." Photo by author (Library of Congress Music Division, Washington, DC). 9
- Figure 3: "Miss Lushington," top right-hand corner. Photo by author (Library of Congress Music Division, Washington, DC). 10
- Figure 4: Graph of ideological differences regarding keyboard practicing/music education in thirty-six conduct books and treatises, 1741–1838. See the Appendix for all citations. 110
- Figure 5: A nineteenth-century pianist "misreads" and "misplays" the "Daily practice," dividing the practice over several days rather than one. Here she pledges to practice D-flat major on Saturday. Photo by author (Library of Congress Music Division, Washington, DC). 116
- Figure 6: Detail from plate 3 of William Hogarth's *Rake's progress* (1735). Google Art Project at English Wikipedia / CC BY-SA (<https://g.co/arts/8eJpNmrg5qGvcoz56>). 124
- Figure 7: Awkward, painful position of the left hand in the final fatiguing measures of Clementi's "Black joke" (1777). Clementi repeats the position for two measures and notates that the first and fifth finger hold the octave as the second finger taps out the dissonant leading note. Photo by author. Photographed on a square piano by Johannes Zumpe and Gabriel Buntebart, London, 1776 (National Music Museum,

- University of South Dakota, Vermillion; cat. no. NMM 3586; Rawlins fund, 1985) with the kind permission of John Koster, curator. 133
- Figure 8: Predominant characteristics of the musical preferences of male and female amateurs in English domestic keyboard culture, c.1770. 170
- Figure 9: A schematic map of the social field of English keyboard culture around 1779, after Bourdieu (“The field of cultural production, or the economic world reversed,” in *The Field of cultural production*, ed. Randal Johnson, New York, 1993, p.29–73). 179
- Figure 10: “A musical definition,” in A. F. C. Kollmann’s *Quarterly musical register* (1812), from Michael Kassler, *A. F. C. Kollmann’s “Quarterly musical register” (1812): an annotated edition with an introduction to his life and works* (Aldershot, 2008). 189
- Figure 11: Eighteenth-century fingerings in a copy of Clementi’s Op. 23/2/iii currently housed in the Library of Congress Music Division, Washington, DC. Photo by author, with fingerings enhanced for clarity. 227