

PRINCIPLES OF PRODUCTS LIABILITY

THIRD EDITION

MARK A. GEISTFELD

Sheila Lubetsky Birnbaum Professor of Civil Litigation
New York University School of Law

CONCEPTS AND INSIGHTS SERIES®

 FOUNDATION
PRESS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---------------------------|----------|
| ACKNOWLEDGMENTS | V |
| A NOTE ON CITATIONS | VII |
| Introduction | 1 |

PART ONE. CONCEPTUAL OVERVIEW

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Chapter 1. The Doctrinal Development of Products Liability | 9 |
| I. The Evolution of Strict Products Liability from the Implied Warranty | 10 |
| II. The Evolution of Strict Products Liability from the Negligence Principle | 21 |
| III. Controversy over the Standard of Liability | 29 |
| IV. The Source of Controversy: The Doctrinal Ambiguity of Consumer Expectations | 33 |
| Chapter 2. Consumer Expectations | 39 |
| I. The Fairness of the Consumer Expectations Test | 40 |
| II. The Relation Between Consumer Expectations and the Risk-Utility Test | 43 |
| A. Actual Consumer Expectations: Malfunctions and the Element of Duty | 45 |
| B. Reasonable Consumer Expectations: A Rationale for the Risk-Utility Test | 52 |
| C. Distinguishing the Two Forms of Consumer Expectations: The Problem of Patent Dangers | 57 |
| Chapter 3. The Problem with Absolute Liability | 65 |
| I. Consumer Expectations of Insurance | 66 |
| II. The Historical Contingency of the Insurance Rationale for Tort Liability | 67 |
| III. The High Cost of Tort Insurance: A Rationale for the Requirement of Defect | 69 |
| IV. The "Makeweight" Insurance Rationale for Strict Liability | 71 |
| Chapter 4. Strict Products Liability 2.0 | 73 |

PART TWO. DOCTRINAL ANALYSIS

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Chapter 5. Construction or Manufacturing Defects | 83 |
| I. The Rationale(s) for Strict Liability | 84 |
| II. Proof of Defect | 86 |
| III. Food Products | 88 |
| Chapter 6. Product Malfunctions | 91 |
| I. Malfunctions as Circumstantial Proof of Defect | 91 |

| | | |
|--|---|------------|
| II. | Identifying Product Malfunctions..... | 93 |
| A. | The Consumer Expectations Test..... | 94 |
| B. | Malfunctions Defined by the Manufacturer's Intentions | 99 |
| III. | Malfunctions and Manufacturing Defects | 103 |
| IV. | Malfunctions and Warnings of Inherent Product Risks | 105 |
| Chapter 7. Design Defects..... | | 107 |
| I. | Design-Defect Jurisprudence: Emerging Consensus or Widespread Disagreement? | 108 |
| A. | "Exclusive" Reliance on the Consumer Expectations Test | 108 |
| B. | "Exclusive" Reliance on the Risk-Utility Test..... | 110 |
| C. | Combining the Two Tests | 110 |
| D. | Differing Approaches to the Same Destination?..... | 114 |
| II. | Proof of Defect: Reasonable Alternative Design | 115 |
| A. | Deviations from Safety Statutes or Market Practices.... | 115 |
| B. | The Risk-Utility Test | 118 |
| C. | Balancing the Risk-Utility Factors..... | 121 |
| III. | Limits on the Duty to Design..... | 126 |
| A. | Foreseeable Product Use | 127 |
| B. | State of the Art..... | 128 |
| C. | Inherent Product Dangers and Categorical Liability..... | 130 |
| IV. | Considerations of Strict Liability: Shifting the Burden of Proof..... | 140 |
| Chapter 8. Warning Defects..... | | 145 |
| I. | The Duty to Warn | 146 |
| II. | The Characteristics of an Adequate Warning..... | 148 |
| III. | Proof of Defect | 155 |
| IV. | The Role of Intermediaries..... | 158 |
| V. | Considerations of Strict Liability: Unforeseeable Risks | 162 |
| VI. | Post-Sale Warnings and Product Recalls..... | 167 |
| Chapter 9. The Relation Between Warnings and Product Design | | 171 |
| I. | Dispelling the Confusion of Comment <i>j</i> | 171 |
| II. | Redesign as a Reasonable Alternative to a Warning | 173 |
| III. | Redesigning the Product to Promote Compliance with Warnings | 176 |
| Chapter 10. Prescription Drugs, Medical Devices, and the "Unavoidably Unsafe" Product Exemption from Strict Liability | | 181 |
| I. | "Unavoidably Unsafe" Products..... | 181 |
| II. | The Different Tests for Evaluating the Defective Design of Pharmaceutical Products | 183 |
| III. | The Puzzle of Comment <i>k</i> | 189 |
| IV. | Manufacturing Defects and the Problem of Malfunction..... | 190 |
| V. | Beyond Pharmaceuticals: Life-Saving Products and the Exemption from Strict Liability | 196 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| Chapter 11. Products Liability in the “Age of Statutes” | 199 |
| I. Violations of Statutory Safety Standards | 201 |
| II. The Regulatory Compliance Defense | 204 |
| III. Statutory Preemption of Tort Claims..... | 210 |
| | |
| Chapter 12. Factual Causation | 221 |
| I. The But-For Test | 223 |
| II. Multiple Tortious Causes | 224 |
| III. Causation in Warning Cases | 228 |
| A. Instructions for Safe Product Use..... | 229 |
| B. Inherent or Unavoidable Risks | 230 |
| IV. Enhanced Injury | 235 |
| V. Alternative Liability and Market-Share Liability..... | 239 |
| A. Alternative Liability | 243 |
| B. Evidential Grouping and Alternative Liability | 245 |
| C. From Alternative Liability to Market-Share Liability .. | 248 |
| D. Evidential Grouping and the Requirements of Market-Share Liability | 253 |
| VI. Scientific Uncertainty About Toxicity | 255 |
| A. Types of Toxicological Evidence | 256 |
| B. The Example of Glyphosate | 258 |
| C. The Types of Toxicological Evidence Required by Courts | 260 |
| D. The Duty to Warn and Scientific Uncertainty | 262 |
| E. Scientific Uncertainty and General Causation..... | 265 |
| F. Scientific Uncertainty and Specific Causation | 266 |
| | |
| Chapter 13. Legal or Proximate Cause (a Reprise of Duty) | 275 |
| I. The Foreseeability Test..... | 276 |
| II. The Directness Test..... | 279 |
| | |
| Chapter 14. Tort Damages and the Types of Compensable Injuries | 285 |
| I. Physical Harm and the Measure of Compensation | 286 |
| II. Pure Economic Loss..... | 290 |
| A. Contracting over Pure Economic Loss..... | 292 |
| B. Contracting in “Mixed” Cases of Pure Economic Loss.... | 294 |
| C. Medical Monitoring..... | 296 |
| D. Asbestos Abatement | 297 |
| E. A More General Formulation of the Economic Loss Rule..... | 299 |
| III. Stand-Alone Emotional Harms..... | 300 |
| IV. Punitive Damages..... | 303 |
| A. The Legal Standard for Awarding Punitive Damages .. | 304 |
| B. The Deterrence and Retributive Rationales for Punitive Damages..... | 306 |
| C. Constitutional Limitations on Punitive Damage Awards..... | 309 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| Chapter 15. Defenses Based on Consumer Conduct | 313 |
| I. Contractual Waivers or Disclaimers of Liability | 313 |
| II. Assumption of Risk | 314 |
| A. Knowledge of Risk | 316 |
| B. Voluntary Choice | 317 |
| C. Primary and Secondary Assumption of Risk | 320 |
| III. Product Misuse and Comparative Responsibility | 322 |
| | |
| Chapter 16. The Scope of Strict Products Liability as Defined by the Nature of the Transaction | 329 |
| I. Distributor and Retailer Liability | 329 |
| II. Used Products | 331 |
| III. The “Sale” of a Product | 334 |
| IV. The Sale of a “Product” | 338 |
| A. The Tangible/Intangible Distinction | 338 |
| B. Misapplication of the Product/Service Distinction in Hybrid Transactions | 340 |
| C. Electricity, Software, and the Product/Service Distinction | 344 |
| | |
| Chapter 17. Bystander Injuries | 349 |
| I. The Extension of Strict Products Liability to Encompass Bystanders | 349 |
| II. Conflicts Between Consumers and Bystanders | 351 |
| III. The Inherent Limitation of Strict Products Liability in Bystander Cases | 354 |
| IV. Negligence Liability and the Protection of Bystanders | 356 |
| V. Normative Confusion in Products Liability | 358 |
| VI. The Normative Structure of Products Liability | 360 |
| | |
| TABLE OF CASES | 363 |
| INDEX | 367 |