

The Tangle of Science

*Reliability Beyond Method,
Rigour, and Objectivity*

Nancy Cartwright, Jeremy Hardie,
Eleonora Montuschi, Matthew Soleiman,
and Ann C. Thresher

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
<i>List of Figures</i>	xi
Introduction	1
PART I. THE USUAL SUSPECTS	
1. Scientific Method	17
1.1 Where's the Bite in the Scientific Method?	18
1.2 Dealing with Objection (1): What's Really There in the Empty Half?	25
1.3 Dealing with Objection (2): Privilege Is Pernicious	31
1.4 Dealing with Objection (3): From Truth to Reliability	33
1.5 In Defence of Reliability	37
1.6 Returning to Scientific Method	50
2. Rigour	51
2.1 Setting the Agenda	52
2.2 What Can You Do with Rigour?	53
2.3 A Primer on RCTs	61
2.3.1 The Proof	64
2.4 Rigour and the RCT	65
2.5 Getting Beyond the Study Population	72
2.6 Tackling the Job of Prediction Directly	75
2.7 Final Remarks	81
3. Objectivity	83
3.1 Our Argument at a Glance	86
3.2 What Is Objectivity?	87
3.2.1 Objectivity: A Praise Word for Science and Beyond	87
3.2.2 Various Attempts to Capture the Meaning	93
3.2.3 Reflecting on Context	98
3.3 Saving Objectivity: Preliminary Steps	100
3.3.1 What Is the Threat?	100
3.3.2 What Kind of Concept Are We Dealing With?	103
3.3.3 Some Standard Reasons Not to Discard <i>Ballung</i> Concepts	106
3.3.4 Objectivity As We Know It: World-Guided and Action-Guiding	107
3.3.5 Objectivity, Subjectivity, and Value Neutrality	110
3.4 Objectivity to Be Found	114
3.4.1 What Is 'Context'? How Does It Relate to Objectivity?	114
3.4.2 Objectivity in Context: The Vajont Dam Disaster	119
3.5 Final Remarks	126

PART II. THE TANGLE OF SCIENCE

4. The Tangle	131
4.1 In Defence of the Tangle: From Truth and Confirmation to the Tangle	132
4.1.1 HD: Number and Stretch of Ingredients Needed	135
4.1.2 Probabilistic Theories	141
4.1.3 In Sum	142
4.2 In Defence of the Tangle: What's Happened When Things Have Gone Wrong?	143
4.3 In Defence of the Tangle: Constraints Make It Hard to Misstep	145
4.4 The 'Virtuous' Tangle: Three General Features	156
4.5 What's in a Tangle?	165
4.6 What's So Good About a Virtuous Tangle?	173
5. Illustrating the Tangle: Episodes from the History of Science	179
5.1 Boiling Point(s)	181
5.2 The Making of an Antibiotic	188
6. The Tangled Principle of the Democratic Peace	194
6.1 Introducing the Democratic Peace and Our Claims About It	198
6.2 Theories of the Democratic Peace	201
6.2.1 Kant's Perpetual Peace [Monadic-Normative]	202
6.2.2 Social Constructivism [Dyadic-Normative]	203
6.2.3 Increased Signalling Theory [Monadic-Structural]	204
6.2.4 Democratic Commitment [Dyadic-Structural]	204
6.3 Defining Democracy and War: Fuzzy and Precise Boundaries	205
6.3.1 Divergent Definitions and Measures of Democracy	205
6.3.2 Divergence Constraints: Making 'Democracy' Precise	207
6.3.3 Convergence Constraints: How Uncontroversial Examples Constrain the Tangle	208
6.3.4 Inter-Theory Criticism, Fringe Cases, and Constraining the Tangle	210
6.4 The Reliability of the Democratic Peace by Anybody's Book	212
6.5 Overdetermination and the <i>Ceteris Paribus</i> Nature of Democratic Peace Principle Theories	216
A Cautionary Lesson: The Study of Gravitational Waves	220
A.1 How LIGO Detects Gravitational Waves	221
A.2 High Tangles	223
A.3 Low Tangles	227
A.4 Conflicting Explanations of What Was Observed at LIGO	229
A.5 Reliability, Conflict, and Our Final Caution	230
A.6 Parting Thoughts	232
<i>References</i>	235
<i>Index</i>	245

List of Figures

1.1.	The heliocentric model of the solar system, drawn by Nicolai Copernicus in <i>De Revolutionibus Orbium Coelestium</i> (1543)	27
1.2.	The apparent orbits of the sun and planets on a geocentric model from <i>Encyclopaedia Britannica</i> (1st edition, 1771; facsimile reprint 1971), Volume 1, Figure 2 of Plate XL facing page 449. Artist: James Ferguson	28
2.1.	A pToC for mHealth, a mobile phone app nutrition programme in Indonesia	78
2.2.	Jacana bird and its nest	82
3.1.	Cull the badgers?	111
3.2.	The Vajont dam	120
4.1.	Sticks in a Jacana bird's nest	133
4.2.	The Jacana bird and its nest	134
4.3.	Starting with confirmation, ending with the tangle	135
4.4.	Data on women's say in decision-making in Bangladesh	139
4.5.	Knowledge gaps in participating mothers in BINP	140
4.6.	Meccano 5 hole strip	152
4.7.	Meccano fish plate	152
4.8.	Meccano spur gear	152
4.9.	Meccano triangular plate	152
4.10.	Meccano impostor 5 hole strip	153
4.11.	Meccano impostor gear wheel	154
4.12.	Meccano shuttle for loom	155
4.13.	Meccano 7 hole strip	155
4.14.	Securing reliability from nature's point of view	167
5.1.	A drawing of Cavendish's vessel taken from the report of the Royal Society's committee	183
5.2.	A group portrait at Oxford including Howard Florey (back row, second to left) and Ernst Boris Chain (back row, second to right)	191
6.1.	Overlapping concepts of democracy and war	210
6.2.	Overlapping DPP theories	214
6.3.	A rudimentary theory of change for Kant's perpetual peace	218

xii List of Figures

A.1. Experimental setup at LIGO	222
A.2. Gravitational waves incident on a stick with two beads	228
Closing Figure. An illustration of floating nests from <i>The Universe, Or, The Wonders of Creation: The Infinitely Great and the Infinitely Little</i> by F.A. Pouchet (1883). Illustration by A. Mesnel	233