# TORT LAW

# Text, Cases, and Materials

FIFTH EDITION

Jenny Steele Professor of Law, University of York



# CONTENTS

Table of Cases	xxiii
Table of Statutes	xl
Table of European Material	xlvi
Table of Treaties and Conventions	xlvii

\_ \_ \_

-----

- -

----

\_\_\_\_

# PART I INTRODUCTORY

1	IN	TRODUCTION: THE SHAPE OF TORT LAW TODAY	3
	1	Torts as wrongs, and the map of tort law	3
		1.1 Parties and terminology	5
		1.2 Torts	6
	2	The nature of torts: defining the 'wrongs'	7
		2.1 The structure of our map of tort	8
		2.2 Conduct and the special case of negligence	11
		2.3 Protected interests	12
		2.4 The structure of this book	12
	3	Tort law and social purpose	13
	4	Two current challenges	15
		4.1 'Compensation culture' and the costs of tort	16
		4.2 The Human Rights Act 1998	18
	5	Conclusions	28

# PART II INTENTIONAL INTERFERENCES

2

TORTS OF INTENTION		33
1	'Intention'	34
	1.1 Is a general definition of intention possible—or desirable?	34
	1.2 The insufficiency of 'intention'	36
2	Trespass to the person	
	2.1 The relevant torts and their general features	36
	2.2 Trespass in history and modern law: forms of action and	
	causes of action	42
	2.3 The limited role of trespass in actions for personal injury	43
	2.4 Battery: the nature of the required contact	50

# xiv | CONTENTS

3	Defences to assault and battery	55
	3.1 Consent	55
	3.2 Necessity	61
	3.3 Self-defence	61
	3.4 No reduction for contributory negligence	61
4	False imprisonment	63
	4.1 Defining false imprisonment	63
	4.2 Further elements of the tort	65
5	Intentional infliction of physical or mental harm	79
	5.1 The conduct element	80
	5.2 The mental element	82
	5.3 The consequence element	84
6	Statutory action for harassment	85
	6.1 Defining statutory action	85
	6.2 Protected interests	86
	6.3 States of mind	87
	6.4 Vicarious liability	88
	6.5 Corporate defendants	89
7	Intentional interference with economic interests	89
	7.1 The starting point: intentionally causing loss is not a sufficient	
	basis for liability	91
	7.2 Group A: economic torts involving actions or threats	94
	7.3 Intention and means in the Group A economic torts	95
	7.4 Group B: false statements	106
	7.5 Measure of damages	108
	7.6 Defences	109
8	Intentional abuse of power and process	109
	8.1 Malicious prosecution and analogous torts	109
	8.2 Misfeasance in a public office	113
9	Conclusions	116

# PART III THE TORT OF NEGLIGENCE

3	ТН	E STANDARD OF CARE IN NEGLIGENCE	123
	1	Standard of care: what is 'negligence'?	124
		1.1 'Mapping' torts and the negligence standard	125
	2	The objective standard	126
		2.1 Key cases	126
		2.2 Mental and physical impairment	129
		2.3 The nature of the objective standard: what is the standard of care for?	132
		2.4 Variations of the objective standard	133

	3	Assessing professional skill and care	141
		3.1 <i>Bolam</i> in the medical context	142
	4	Reasonable risk-taking	151
		4.1 Common law: when does the reasonable person take risks?	151
		4.2 Reasonable risk taking and desirable activities: two statutes	153
	5	Res ipsa loquitur and absence of evidence of fault	156
	6	Conclusions	158
4	TH	IE DUTY OF CARE: INTRODUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT	160
	1	Duty of care: an introduction	161
	2	The evolution and content of the duty concept: from <i>Donoghue</i> to <i>Robinson</i> and <i>Poole</i>	162
		2.1 A general tort of negligence: <i>Donoghue v Stevenson</i>	162
		2.2 The 'ocean of liability': the Anns test and the prima facie duty of care	170
		2.3 Principle and policy	174
		2.4 An 'irresistible force'? <i>Caparo</i> , three factors, and incremental	
		development	178
		2.5 Incrementalism and established principle: Robinson, Poole, and the	
		reinvention of Caparo	184
	3	The special case of omissions: positive duties to act	194
		3.1 Distinguishing acts from omissions	195
		3.2 Liability for omissions: the general approach	195
	4	Conclusions	198
5	DL	JTY OF CARE: APPLICATIONS	201
	1	Psychiatric damage	202
		1.1 The nature of 'psychiatric damage'	202
		1.2 Control devices	203
		1.3 'Primary victim' claims	207
		1.4 Secondary victims	217
		1.5 Conclusions	232
	2	Pure economic losses	232
		2.1 Recovery of losses	232
		2.2 Relational economic loss (category A)	239
		2.3 Economic losses caused by acquiring defective products or	
		premises (category B)	246
		2.4 Economic loss caused by reliance on negligent statements	
		(category C)	255
		2.5 'Extended' <i>Hedley Byrne</i> liability (category D)	269
		2.6 Developments in categories C and D: the role of 'voluntary assumption of responsibility' considered	279

# xvi | CONTENTS

	3	Public authorities	288
		3.1 The general issues	288
		3.2 The variety of powers and duties	288
		3.3 Leading cases from Geddis to X v Bedfordshire	291
		3.4 After X v Bedfordshire	303
		3.5 The significance of omissions/failures to benefit	311
		3.6 Police liability and the development of Convention rights	319
	4	Immunities	346
		4.1 Immunities and Article 6	346
		4.2 Immunities and common law	346
		4.3 Combat immunity	348
	5	Conclusions	349
6	C	AUSATION, REMOTENESS, AND SCOPE OF DUTY:	
U		ONNECTION TO THE DAMAGE	354
	1	Introduction: how many 'causation' questions are there?	356
	2	'But for' causation	364
		2.1 Defining 'but for' causation	364
		2.2 Further illustrations of the 'but for' test	365
	3	'Cause-in-law'/remoteness/scope of liability	374
		3.1 Introduction: three versions of the remoteness question	374
		3.2 Foreseeability of the type of harm: The Wagon Mound (No 1)	375
		3.3 Lingering problems	379
	4	'Scope of duty' analysis	396
		4.1 The reasoning	402
		4.2 Continuing influence: 'scope of duty' in the Supreme Court	404
		4.3 Remoteness, legal cause, and scope of duty—summary	411
	5	Multiple potential causes: introducing some difficulties	411
	6	'Material contribution': before and after Fairchild	413
		6.1 Material contribution before <i>Fairchild</i>	413
		6.2 The decision in <i>Fairchild</i>	418
		6.3 Applying Fairchild: uncertainty, single agents, and non-tortious sources	423
		6.4 Apportionment and non-tortious potential causes	424
		6.5 Insurance issues and further interpretation	435
		6.6 'Material contribution' after the Fairchild saga	443
	7	Loss of a chance	449
	8	Conclusions	462

-----

7	DE	EFENCES TO NEGLIGENCE	465
	1	Defences to negligence and defences to other torts	466
	2	Contributory negligence	466
		2.1 Relevant legislation	466
		2.2 Applying the statutory provisions: section 1(1)	467
		2.3 Apportionment	469
	3	Volenti non fit injuria: willing acceptance of risk	477
		3.1 The restricted nature of the modern <i>volenti</i> defence	479
		3.2 Applications of the <i>volenti</i> defence	482
	4	Ex turpi causa non oritur actio: 'illegality'	484
		4.1 'Illegality'	485
		4.2 Underlying rationale	486
		4.3 General approach: rules or direct policy reasoning?	487
		4.4 Illegality in tort cases: narrow and wide?	492
	5	Conclusions	500

# PART IV GENERAL MATTERS

8	LI	MITATION AND CONTRIBUTION	505
	1	Limitation of actions	505
		1.1 What are limitation rules and why do we have them?	505
		1.2 The general position under the Limitation Act 1980	506
		1.3 Personal injury cases	507
		1.4 Other cases in negligence	518
	2	Contribution between liable parties	519
		2.1 The starting point: when a liable party may seek contribution	520
		2.2 'The same damage'	520
		2.3 Apportionment	526
		2.4 Time limit for contribution claims	528
	3	Conclusions	529
9	DA	MAGES, COMPENSATION, AND RESPONSIBILITY	531
	1	Compensatory damages	532
		1.1 The basic approach: restitutio in integrum	532
		1.2 Pecuniary losses in personal injury claims: introduction	532
		1.3 Lost earnings and expenses before trial	533
		1.4 Future lost earnings	533

		1.5 Expenses	543
		1.6 Deductions	548
		1.7 Non-pecuniary losses in personal injury cases	550
	2	Death and damages: where the injured party dies	554
		2.1 Claims surviving death	554
		2.2 Claims for the death of another	558
		2.3 Death and damages under the HRA 1998	565
	3	Delivery of compensatory damages: lump sum or periodical	
		payments	566
		3.1 Relevant legislation	566
		3.2 Potential advantages of periodical payments	567
		3.3 Potential problems of periodical payments	569
		3.4 Protecting the value of periodical payments	569
	4	Non-compensatory damages	571
		4.1 Exemplary damages	572
		4.2 Vindicatory damages?	579
		4.3 Gain-based damages and 'negotiating' damages	583
	5	Damages under the Human Rights Act	587
		5.1 Relevant legislation	587
	6	The funding of litigation	590
		6.1 Background to the 2013 reforms	590
		6.2 The 2013 reforms	596
	7	Conclusions	600
10	VI	CARIOUS LIABILITY AND NON-DELEGABLE DUTIES	603
	1	Vicarious liability	604
		1.1 Nature and structure	604
		1.2 Justifications for vicarious liability	605
		1.3 Distinguishing the two limbs	610
		1.4 Relationship between tortfeasor and defendant: for whose torts? The first limb	(1)
		1.5 'Close connection': the second limb	611
	2		623
	2	Non-delegable duties	635
	3	Other primary duties: care in selection and supervision	640
		3.1 Duties to supervise employees	641
	4	Conclusions	641

.....

### PART V NUISANCE AND DUTIES RELATING TO LAND

11	NU	JISANCE	645
	1	Private nuisance	646
		1.1 Making sense of private nuisance	646
		1.2 The basis of liability: placing private nuisance on the 'map'	
		of tort law	646
		1.3 Elements of actionability	648
		1.4 Connection with the nuisance: who may be sued?	664
		1.5 Who may sue?	675
		1.6 Defences	683
		1.7 Remedies	686
	2	Nuisance and the Human Rights Act 1998	693
		2.1 The Convention rights and their status	693
		2.2 Applications	694
	3	Public nuisance	702
		3.1 General statement: varieties of public nuisance	702
		3.2 Amalgamated private nuisances	704
		3.3 Individuals suffering 'special damage'	705
		3.4 Structures adjoining or overhanging the highway	707
		3.5 Public order, injunctions and public nuisance	708
	4	The environmental tort(s)?	710
	5	Conclusions	712
12	RY	LANDS V FLETCHER AND STRICT LIABILITY	715
	1	Introduction	716
	2	Origins of the rule: Rylands & Another v Fletcher	716
	2	2.1 Key cases	716
	3	Elements of actionability	724
	5	3.1 Accumulation of something likely to do mischief	724
		3.2 Escape	725
		<ul><li>3.3 Who can sue and for what damage?</li></ul>	727
		3.4 Defences	728
		3.5 Remoteness	730
		3.6 Non-natural user	730
	4	Categorization and boundaries	731
	•	4.1 The English approach: a species of nuisance	731
		<ul><li>4.2 Australian High Court: non-delegable duties in negligence</li></ul>	746
	5	Conclusions	748

#### xx | CONTENTS

# 13OCCUPIERS' LIABILITY7501Occupiers' liability under statute7501.1Preliminaries7501.2Who is an occupier?7541.3The duty owed to 'visitors' under the Occupiers' Liability Act 19577561.4The duty owed to 'non-visitors' under the 1984 Act7722Conclusions779

#### PART VI DEFAMATION AND PRIVACY

14	DI	BFAMATION	783
	1	Common law and 2013 reforms	784
		1.1 Defamation Act 2013: key provisions	785
	2	The competing interests: expression and reputation	786
		2.1 Freedom of expression	786
		2.2 Reputation	790
	3	Libel, slander, and malicious falsehood	792
		3.1 Libel and slander	792
		3.2 Malicious falsehood	793
	4	Elements of a claim in defamation	793
		4.1 Defamatory meaning	794
		4.2 Serious harm	798
		4.3 Publication	807
		4.4 Reference to the claimant	810
	5	Defences	810
		5.1 The meaning of 'malice'	810
		5.2 Truth (previously justification)	811
		5.3 Honest opinion (previously fair comment)	815
		5.4 Publication on a matter of public interest	821
		5.5 Innocent defamation; distributors and intermediaries	826
		5.6 Privilege	832
	6	Jurisdiction	834
	7	Parties who cannot sue in defamation	834
	8	Remedies	836
	9	Conclusions	842
15	PR	IVACY	844
	1	A new protected interest at common law?	845
	2	'Privacy': one right or four protected interests?	846

CONTENTS | xxi

~ \_

\_

\_\_\_\_

3	Article 8 ECHR and the Human Rights Act 1998	849
	3.1 Article 8, European Convention on Human Rights	849
	3.2 The Human Rights Act 1998	855
4	Development of the new tort	858
	4.1 From confidence to privacy	858
	4.2 An action in tort in respect of private information	860
5	The present law: framework and applications	864
	5.1 Framework: elements of the tort	864
	5.2 Applications	870
6	Intrusion	885
7	Conclusions	887

. . . .

# PART VII STRICTER LIABILITIES

16	PR	ODUCT LIABILITY	891
	1	Defective products and the standard of liability	891
		1.1 From negligence to defectiveness: allocation of risks	893
	2	The broader context: the limited impact of the Consumer	
		Protection Act 1987	894
		2.1 Closeness to negligence	894
		2.2 Regulation of product safety	896
	3	Liability under the Consumer Protection Act 1987	897
		3.1 The liability under the Act and who is liable: section 2	897
		3.2 What is a product?	898
		3.3 Damage	898
		3.4 The crucial concept: defectiveness	900
		3.5 Defences	909
		3.6 Limitation period	915
	4	Conclusions	918
17	BR	EACH OF STATUTORY DUTY	920
	1	Tort and legislation: the distinctiveness of the tort of 'breach	
		of statutory duty'	920
	2	The question of interpretation: does the breach give rise to liability	
		at common law?	921
		2.1 Two potential approaches	921
		2.2 What are we looking for?	921
	3	Injuries at work	922
		3.1 Key cases	922

	4	General evolution	926
		4.1 Sanctions and other means of enforcement	<b>9</b> 26
		4.2 The importance of statutory interpretation in <i>Groves v Wimborne</i>	927
	5	Further restrictions: 'social welfare' legislation and 'public law duties'	932
		5.1 Key cases	932
	6	Recent cases: which approach?	933
	7	The ambit of the tort	938
		7.1 Damage of the type the duty was intended to prevent	938
	8	Conclusions	938
18	TR	ESPASS TO LAND AND GOODS, AND CONVERSION	940
	1	Trespass to land	940
		1.1 Non-deliberate trespass to land	941
	2	Wrongful interference with goods: the types and the legislation	945
		2.1 Key legislation	945
	3	Conversion	946
		3.1 General definition and distinctive features	946
		3.2 Standard of liability	947
		3.3 Which goods can be 'converted'?	951
		3.4 What interest in the chattels must the claimant have?	954
		3.5 What amounts to a conversion?	956
		3.6 What are the remedies?	957
	4	Conclusions	964

#### Index

965