

ARBEITEN AUS DEM IURISTISCHEN SEMINAR
DER UNIVERSITÄT FREIBURG SCHWEIZ

Herausgegeben von Jacques Dubey und Hubert Stöckli

437

JIANING SANG

International Online Consumer Contracts

Jurisdiction, Enforcement
and Online Dispute Resolution

Schulthess § 2023

Table of contents

Preface	V
Contents.....	VII
Table of contents.....	IX
List of abbreviations.....	XXI
Bibliography.....	XXV
Table of conventions, legislation and other instruments.....	XLVII
Table of cases	LIII
List of tables and diagrams.....	LIX
Introduction	1

Part I: International Online Consumer Contracts and Dispute Resolution 5

Chapter 1: International Online Consumer Contracts 11

I. Definition of ‘Online Consumer Contracts’	11
1. Contracting Parties	11
1.1 Consumer	11
a Natural person.....	12
b End-user.....	14
1.2 Seller	15
a Frequency	16
b Auxiliary criteria on business behavior.....	17
1.3 The Third-Party Supplier.....	18
2. Content of the Contract	20
2.1 Contract Objects: Goods and Services	20
a Goods and immovable property.....	20
b Services.....	21
2.2 Contract Object: Digital Content.....	22
a Illustrations of digital content.....	23

b	Other requirements on digital content.....	26
2.3	Consumption Purpose and Contract Objects	27
a	Be of modest amount in value.....	27
b	Fulfill the requirement of daily use.....	27
2.4	Conclusion.....	28
3.	Formation of Online Consumer Contracts.....	29
3.1	Three Types of Online Consumer Contract.....	29
3.2	Requirements.....	30
a	Offer	30
b	Acceptance.....	31
c	Conclusion.....	32
II.	Extension of the Definition	32
1.	Extending the meaning of ‘Contracting Parties’: Aim of Consumer Protection	33
1.1	The Online Consumer is Still the Weak Party.....	33
1.2	Approaches Proposed on Protection of Online Consumers	36
a	Increased disclosure.....	37
b	List of presumptively unenforceable terms.....	38
c	Pre-approval procedure.....	39
d	Term auditing process by the seller	40
e	Mandatory default rules.....	40
f	Conclusion.....	41
1.3	Consumer Organization.....	41
a	Brief introduction of consumer organization and class action	41
b	Requirements for a qualified consumer organization.....	43
2.	Extension of Content: Purpose of Contract	47
2.1	Future Purpose.....	47
2.2	Dual-Purpose.....	49
a	Dual-purpose and the personal overseas purchase	49
b	Prior intention of overseas purchaser	50
c	Mixed prior intention.....	51
2.3	Awareness of Purpose	52
a	Necessity for awareness of purpose in online consumer contract	52
b	Objective criteria on verifying the seller’s awareness.....	53
c	Time requirement for awareness.....	54
3.	Extension of Conclusion Method: Contract Through Electronic Agent.....	55
3.1	EDI and Electronic Agent	56
3.2	Shall the Electronic Agent be Endowed with Personality?.....	59

a	Interest protection	59
b	Allocation of responsibility.....	60
3.3	Relationship with Agency Law	62
a	Legal capacity	63
b	Consent	64
c	Authority.....	65
3.4	Liability	67
a	General rule in solving technical errors	67
b	Problems of the general rule	69
c	Possible solutions to solve this problem	70
III.	Conclusion	70

Chapter 2: International Online Consumer Contract Dispute Resolution **73**

I.	International Litigation.....	74
1.	Challenges of the Internet for International Litigation of Online Consumer Contract Disputes	75
1.1	Global Nature of the Internet.....	75
a	Non-boundary.....	75
b	Virtuality.....	76
1.2	Challenges to Current Connecting Factors	76
a	Challenges on connecting factors concerning persons	77
b	Challenges on connecting factors concerning behavior	78
1.3	Internet-generated Connecting Factors.....	78
a	Location of Internet Protocol Address	79
b	Domain name.....	80
c	Conclusion	82
2.	Current Legislation on Jurisdiction	82
2.1	Access to Justice: International Jurisdiction.....	82
2.2	Consumer Domicile Jurisdiction	84
a	Consumer domicile in consumer contract disputes	84
b	Problems that arise from the consumer domicile	85
2.3	Choice of Court Clause	87
a	Party autonomy: freedom and certainty	87
b	Current legislation.....	88
c	Problems raised.....	90
2.4	Conclusion.....	91

II.	Online Dispute Resolution and International Online Consumer Contracts	92
1.	Internet-generated Theories and Proposals.....	92
1.1	Cyberspace as a Place.....	92
a	Introduction	92
b	Problems	93
c	Conclusion.....	95
1.2	Theory of International Space	96
a	The fourth international space and nationality	96
b	Problems raised.....	97
1.3	<i>An Independent Legal System Regarding Digital Content?</i>	97
1.4	Conclusion.....	99
2.	ODR under Internet Law: Definition and Development	100
2.1	ODR: An Evolving Concept.....	100
a	Internet law perspective	101
b	Extension of ADR in the Internet age?	102
c	<i>A sui generis</i> form of dispute resolution?	104
d	Is ICT another party to ODR?.....	104
e	Conclusion	106
2.2	ODR: Stages of Development	106
a	The blank stage: 1969-1992.....	107
b	The infancy stage: 1992-1998.....	107
c	The stage of formalization: the early 2010s	109
d	The stage of perfection: present day	110
e	Conclusion	112
2.3	The Current Stage: Voices from the World	112
a	EU.....	113
b	US.....	114
c	United Nations	115
d	OECD	116
3.	Challenges for ODR and Its Possible Solutions	116
3.1	ODR: Current Challenges.....	116
a	Communication challenges.....	116
b	Technical challenges.....	117
c	Challenges of general adoption.....	118
d	Challenges of differing perceptions	119
e	Challenge of funding	120
f	Conclusion.....	121

3.2 State Control.....	121
a Building confidence in ODR	121
b Control over ODR via state intervention.....	122
c Means of state control.....	124
d Conclusion	126
III. Conclusion	126

Part II: Jurisdiction Rules and Enforcement of Judgments..... 129

Chapter 1: Consumer Domicile Jurisdiction..... 135

I. Consumer Domicile in the EU	135
1. Introduction to the Brussels I Regulation (recast) System.....	135
1.1 Article 4: defendant’s domicile and special jurisdictions	135
1.2 Articles 17 to 18: special jurisdiction over consumer contracts	136
2. Evolution of Legislation on Consumer Domicile in the EU.....	137
3. Brussels Convention: Specific Invitation, Advertising and Necessary Steps .	138
3.1 Specific Invitation and Advertising.....	139
a Objective element: behavior with connection.....	139
b Subjective element: intention.....	141
c Purpose: connection.....	141
d Problems: lack of online elements	142
3.2 Necessary Steps.....	143
a What constitute “Necessary Steps”: the Gabriel case	144
b Difficulty for its application online.....	146
3.3 Conclusion.....	146
4. Brussels I Regulation (recast): Directed Behaviors of the Seller.....	147
4.1 Brussels I Regulation (recast) in comparison with the Brussels	147
Convention	147
a Change of the form of the legal instrument.....	148
b Changes of contents: electronic commerce	148
c Changes in content: removal of “necessary steps”.....	149
d Changes in content: directed behavior	149
4.2 Balance of Parties’ Interests	150
a The issue of high cost	150
b The issue of e-commerce development.....	151

c	Conclusion	152
4.3	Article 17(1)(c): “Directed Behavior” Approach	153
a	From accessibility to interactivity of commercial websites	153
b	Activity: subjective purpose of the seller	155
c	Objective elements: specific “circumstances”	157
5.	Conclusion: A Hybrid Method for Applying EU “Directed Behavior”	158
II.	Consumer Domicile in the US.....	160
1.	Long-arm Jurisdiction	161
1.1	In Personam Jurisdiction	161
a	Strict territorial limitations: the <i>Pennoyer</i> Case	161
b	Long-arm statute and expansion: the <i>International Shoe</i> Case	162
c	A flashback: the <i>Hanson</i> and <i>Shaffer</i> cases	163
d	Modification: the <i>Volkswagen</i> case.....	165
1.2	Later Development of Long-Arm Statute in the Online Circumstance case.....	166
a	First step: conducting business with a fair measure of permanence and continuity	167
b	Second step: additional activities.....	169
2.	Sliding Scale Approach	170
2.1	Initiation Stage: the <i>Zippo</i> Case	171
a	Case brief.....	171
b	A sliding scale based on interactivity of website	171
c	Active and passive websites.....	172
d	Interactive website.....	173
e	Conclusion of <i>Zippo</i> Case.....	174
2.2	Current Stage: the <i>BMS</i> Case.....	175
a	Criticisms of the sliding scale approach following <i>Zippo</i>	175
b	Rejection by the <i>US Supreme Court</i> on application of the sliding scale approach in a specific jurisdiction: the <i>BMS</i> case.....	176
c	Proposal for future development.....	178
3.	A Proposed Guideline for Application of Consumer Domicile Jurisdiction	179
3.1	Comparison between the US and EU Approach.....	179
3.2	Proposed legislation: a Harmonised Guideline.....	180
III.	Conclusion	182
	Chapter 2: Choice of Court Clauses	185
I.	Introduction to the Choice of Court Clause.....	186

1.	Party Autonomy and State Sovereignty.....	186
1.1	Prorogation and Derogation	186
1.2	Party Autonomy and State Sovereignty.....	187
2.	Legislation on Choice of Court Clauses in the EU, US and HCCH.....	189
2.1	EU: the Brussels Regime.....	189
2.2	US.....	190
2.3	HCCH: 2005 Choice of Court Convention.....	192
II.	Validity of Choice of Court Clause	192
1.	Formal Validity	193
1.1	Electronic Form of Choice	193
1.2	Warning Function and Transparency.....	195
a	“Warning function” of online consumer contract is missing	195
b	The principle of transparency in general.....	196
c	Application of principle of transparency: from available to visible. .	197
2.	Exclusivity.....	199
2.1	EU: Exclusive Choice of Court Clause	199
a	Exclusivity and <i>lis pendens</i>	200
b	Meaning of ‘exclusivity’	201
c	Exception on exclusivity for consumers	201
d	Exclusivity of the jurisdiction of the chosen court and tacit prorogation	202
2.2	US: Non-Exclusive Choice of Court Clause.....	203
2.3	HCCH: Exclusive Choice with Declarations on Non-Exclusivity.....	204
3.	Time of Conclusion.....	204
4.	Sufficient Connection.....	207
III.	Online Standard Form Choice of Court Clause.....	208
1.	Standard Choice Form: Shrink-wrap and Browse-wrap.....	209
1.1	<i>Shrink-wrap</i>	209
1.2	<i>Click-wrap</i> and <i>Browse-wrap</i>	210
2.	Substantive Analyses of EU Regulation on Standard Choice of Court Clause	212
2.1	Unfair Contract Terms Directive: “Minimum Standards” for Consumer Protection	212
2.2	Article 3: Requirement of Full Negotiation.....	213
a	The <i>Amazon</i> case	213
b	Comments.....	215
2.3	Annex I of the Directive	215

a	<i>Océano Case</i>	216
b	Requirement over valid choice of court clause from Annex list	217
2.4	Illegality of Pre-ticked Boxes and General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR)	218
a	Facts and preliminary ruling of ECJ	218
b	Inspiration on choice of court	220
3.	Substantive Analyses of US Regulation on Standard Choice of Court Clause	221
3.1	Continuous Controversy Between Revised Article 2 and Proposed Article 2B on Electronic Standard Form Contracting	222
a	Initial proposal	222
b	Diverging efforts	223
3.2	The Current Approaches	225
a	Section 2-302 of the U.C.C.: unconscionability	226
b	Restatement (second) section 211(3)	227
c	The doctrine of reasonable expectations	229
d	Conclusion: “blanket assent”	230
4.	Differences between the EU and US on Standard Form Contracting	231
4.1	Status of Consumer Contract	231
4.2	Enforceability of Standard Form Contract	231
4.3	Market Regulation and Consumer Protection	232
IV.	Conclusion: Proposal	234
Chapter 3: Recognition and Enforcement of Judgments		239
I.	Recognition and Enforcement in the EU	240
1.	Preliminary: Background Information on Judgment Recognition and Enforcement	240
1.1	Doctrine of Comity	241
1.2	No Review of Merits	242
2.	Procedure for Judgment Recognition and Enforcement under Brussels Regime	243
2.1	Abolition of Exequatur	244
2.2	Grounds for Refusal of Judgment Recognition and Enforcement	245
a	Public policy	245
b	Procedural deficiency	246
c	Irreconcilable judgment	246
d	In conflict with a special jurisdiction: article 45(1)(e)	247
2.3	European Small Claim Procedures (“ESCP”)	248

3.	Conclusion.....	250
II.	Recognition and Enforcement in the US.....	250
1.	Mandatory Grounds for Refusal of Judgment Recognition and Enforcement	251
1.1	Due process	251
1.2	Lack of Jurisdiction.....	251
2.	Discretionary Grounds for Refusal of Judgment Recognition and Enforcement	252
2.1	Fraud	253
2.2	Inconsistency with the choice of court clause	253
2.3	<i>Forum non-conveniens</i>	254
3.	Small Claims Court.....	254
III.	Recognition and Enforcement under the 2019 Convention.....	255
1.	Overview of the 2019 Judgments Convention.....	255
2.	Indirect Jurisdiction Bases and Consumer Protection	257
2.1	Article 5: reasonable connection and protection over consumers.....	257
2.2	Article 5(1)(e): express consent to jurisdiction.....	258
2.3	Article 5(1)(f): implied consent to jurisdiction.....	258
2.4	Article 5(1)(g): contract jurisdiction.....	259
2.5	Article 5(1)(m): choice of court agreements.....	259
2.6	Conclusion.....	260
3.	Obligation of Mutual Recognition and Enforcement	261
3.1	Article 4: general provisions on mutual recognition and enforcement	261
3.2	Article 7: grounds for refusal and <i>lis pendens</i>	262
4.	Conclusion: Limited Applicability of the 2019 Judgments Convention in Solving International Online Consumer Contract Disputes.....	264
4.1	Fragmented illustration on the choice of court clause	264
4.2	Future proposal.....	265
IV.	Conclusion	266

Part III: Online Dispute Resolution..... 269

Chapter 1: ODR Methods and Procedural Rules for Operation..... 273

I.	Online Private Settlement Method	273
1.	Online Negotiation and Online Mediation	273
1.1	Online Negotiation	273

a	Assisted negotiation	274
b	Automated negotiation.....	274
c	Conclusion.....	275
1.2	Online Mediation.....	276
a	Third-party involved resolution method	276
b	An entirely online process	277
c	An alternative solution to adjudicative method.....	278
d	Conclusion.....	278
2.	Practical Application and Further Recommendation.....	280
2.1	Online Negotiation: SquareTrade and Taobao Platform.....	280
a	SquareTrade: a pioneer and historic example	280
b	Taobao Platform: a current practitioner	283
2.2	Online Mediation: Smartsettle.....	287
2.3	Conclusion and Suggestions for Future Development of Online Private Settlement Method	289
II.	Online Arbitration	292
1.	Non-binding Online Arbitration.....	292
1.1	Two Levels of Criteria for Identifying Non-Binding Online Arbitration	294
a	Binding force of the outcome.....	294
b	Acceptance.....	295
c	Conclusion.....	296
1.2	Arbitrability of Online Consumer Contractual Disputes	297
1.3	Basis for Online Arbitration: Arbitration Agreement.....	299
a	Consumer protection and time for the conclusion of arbitration agreement	299
b	Requirements for a valid pre-dispute agreement.....	299
1.4	Requirements for an Eligible Online Arbitration Provider.....	300
2.	Unilaterally Binding Online Arbitration.....	301
2.1	Unilaterally Binding Online Arbitration for Online Consumer Contract Disputes.....	301
a	Online consumer has the right of acceptance.....	301
b	Uncertainty of arbitration process and outcome.....	303
2.2	Unilaterally Binding Online Arbitration in Practice: Ford Dispute Mechanism	303
a	CIArb Program	304
b	CAP-Motors Programme	304

3.	Conclusion: Proposal for Future Unilaterally Binding Online Arbitration Mechanism	305
III.	Online Litigation	307
1.	Overview of Internet Courts	307
2.	Hangzhou Internet Court and Its Operation Process	308
2.1	Introduction of Hangzhou Internet Court	309
a	Legal bases for Hangzhou Internet Court	309
b	Hangzhou Litigation Platform	310
2.2	Jurisdiction	311
a	Centralized jurisdiction.....	311
b	The problem of conflict of jurisdiction	312
2.3	Pre-trial Online Mediation.....	313
2.4	Online Litigation Process Assisted by ICT	314
2.5	The Cross-Border Trade Tribunal	316
3.	The AI Judge.....	317
3.1	Current Stage of Development and Practical Cases	318
3.2	Questions Arising.....	319
a	Bias	320
b	Law and algorithm.....	320
4.	Conclusions	321
4.1	Technology Supported Online Litigation	321
4.2	Limited capability in solving cross-border disputes	323
	Chapter 2: Enforcement of ODR Results	325
I.	Regular Public Enforcement Mechanisms	325
1.	Online Arbitration Enforcement.....	326
1.1	Arbitration agreement and arbitral award in electronic form	326
1.2	Validity and binding force of arbitral award	327
1.3	The challenge of enforcing online arbitral awards under the New York Convention	328
1.4	Conclusion.....	329
2.	Enforcement of Online Judgments	330
2.1	Requirements of and procedure for online judgment enforcement.....	330
2.2	The Enforcement Platform: methods of enforcement.....	331
a	5G+Blockchain+Enforcement: A technology-supported enforcement method.....	332
b	Social norms: electronic reward order and headlines of enforcement....	333

- 2.3 Conclusion..... 334
- II. Private Enforcement Mechanisms 334
 - 1. The UNCITRAL Private Enforcement Mechanisms 336
 - 1.1 Working Group III and the Draft ODR Rules 336
 - 1.2 UNCITRAL Private Enforcement Mechanisms 337
 - a UNCITRAL two-track system of ODR 337
 - b Private enforcement mechanisms..... 338
 - c The object of UNCITRAL private enforcement mechanisms 339
 - d Follow-up: a change of focus in 2015..... 340
 - 2. Incentive Enforcement 342
 - 2.1 Rating 342
 - 2.2 Trustmarks..... 344
 - 3. Automatic Enforcement 344
- III. Conclusion 345

Conclusion 349

Index..... 365