
Game Theory and Behavior

Jeffrey Carpenter and Andrea Robbett

The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England

Contents

Preface xvii

Acknowledgments xxi

I Introduction to the Theory of Games

1 Games of Strategy 3

What Is Game Theory? 3

Non-cooperative versus Cooperative Game Theory 4

Individual versus Game Theoretic Decision Making 5

An Individual Decision Problem 5

Other People Complicate Things 7

Theory of Mind 8

Thinking Strategically: Reasoning about the Reasoning of Others 9

A Betting Game 9

The Beauty Contest Guessing Game 11

The Prisoner's Dilemma 12

This Book 15

2 Game Representations 19

The Elements of a Game 19

Background Assumptions 21

Extensive Form Games 23

Normal Form Games 26

Worked Example 30

Strategy Profiles and Payoffs 32

Exercises 33

II Solving Games

3 Dominated Strategies 41

The Logic of Dominance 41

	<i>Strictly Dominated Strategies</i>	42
	<i>Weakly Dominated Strategies</i>	44
	<i>Example: The Prisoner's Dilemma</i>	45
	<i>Example: The Second-Price Auction</i>	46
How Far Can Dominance Take Us?		49
	<i>Iterated Elimination of Dominated Strategies</i>	50
Example		51
	<i>Does Order Matter?</i>	52
	<i>The Beauty Contest</i>	53
	<i>The Traveler's Dilemma</i>	55
Behavior in Games: Playing Dominated Strategies		56
	<i>Playing Dominated Strategies</i>	57
	<i>Evidence-Based Adaptations of the Standard Model</i>	58
Exercises		61
4	Equilibrium	65
	Zero-Sum Games without Dominance	66
	<i>Cake Cutting</i>	67
	Solving Games Using the Maximin/Minimax Approach	67
	<i>Maximin: Maximizing Your Minimum Possible Payoffs</i>	68
	<i>Minimax: Minimizing Your Opponent's Maximum Possible Payoffs</i>	69
	<i>The Solution to Zero-Sum Games: Maximin Playing against Minimax</i>	70
	<i>Worked Examples</i>	71
	<i>Do the Maximin and Minimax Payoffs Always Correspond?</i>	72
	General-Sum Games and the Collapse of the Minimax Approach	73
	Nash's Contribution	74
	<i>Best Responding</i>	75
	<i>Nash Equilibrium: Mutual Best Responses</i>	76
	<i>Is the Nash Equilibrium Unique?</i>	77
	<i>What Is the Relationship between the Nash Equilibrium and the Minimax Solution?</i>	78
	<i>What Is the Relationship between the Nash Equilibrium and Dominance-Solvable Outcomes?</i>	79
	<i>Does the Nash Equilibrium Always Exist?</i>	80
	Exercises	80
5	Mixed Strategies	85
	The Trouble with Perfect Foresight	85
	When Best Responding Involves Risk	88
	<i>Expected Payoffs</i>	88
	<i>Randomizing Requires Indifference</i>	90

	Mixed-Strategy Nash Equilibrium	92
	Solving for Mixed-Strategy Nash Equilibria	93
	<i>The Princess Bride Game</i>	94
	<i>Stag Hunt: A Game with Pure- and Mixed-Strategy Nash Equilibria</i>	94
	<i>Mixing over Multiple Pure Strategies</i>	96
	Best Responding, Dominated Strategies, and Rationalizability	97
	Behavior in Games	100
	<i>Playing Mixed-up Strategies</i>	100
	<i>Evidence-Based Adaptations of the Standard Model</i>	103
	Exercises	104
6	Equilibrium in Nonmatrix Games	107
	Nonmatrix Games and Their Solutions	107
	Demanding an Infinitely Divisible Cake	108
	The Bertrand Pricing Game	110
	<i>The Bertrand Game with a Large Strategy Set</i>	111
	<i>The Bertrand Game with a Continuous Strategy Set</i>	112
	Expanding the Strategy Set in the Traveler's Dilemma	113
	Finding Best Response Functions Using Calculus	114
	The Cournot Duopoly	117
	n -Player Games with Discrete Strategies	119
	<i>The Volunteer's Dilemma</i>	121
	n -Player Games with Continuous Strategies	123
	<i>The n-Player Cournot Oligopoly</i>	123
	<i>Application: The Tullock Contest</i>	124
	Behavior in Games: Do Travelers Think of a Lost Bag as a Dilemma?	125
	Exercises	132
7	Equilibrium Selection	137
	Payoff-Based Selection Criteria	140
	Focal Points	144
	Forward Induction	145
	Correlated Equilibrium	145
	Behavior in Games: Equilibrium Selection in Coordination Games	148
	Exercises	154
III	Analyzing Sequential-Move Games	
8	Subgame Perfection	161
	Nonsensical Nash Equilibria in Sequential Games	161
	<i>The Martian Game</i>	162

	<i>Clean Your Room or Die</i>	164
	Subgame Perfect Nash Equilibria	165
	Solving for Subgame Perfect Nash Equilibria Using Backward Induction	166
	<i>Backward Inducting</i>	167
	<i>Centipede Game</i>	168
	<i>Hit 15</i>	169
	Continuous Games	169
	<i>Example: Stackelberg Competition</i>	171
	Games of Imperfect Information	171
	<i>Subgames</i>	172
	<i>Example with Multiple Subgame Perfect Nash Equilibria</i>	173
	Behavior in Games	174
	<i>Playing Incredible Strategies</i>	174
	<i>Evidence-Based Adaptations of the Standard Model</i>	176
	Exercises	178
9	Finitely Repeated Games	183
	Definitions	184
	Finitely Repeated Games with a Single Stage Equilibrium	185
	Finitely Repeated Games with Multiple Stage Equilibria	188
	Behavior in Games—Playing (Un?)ravelled Strategies	193
	Exercises	200
10	Infinitely Repeated Games	205
	Discounted Utility	206
	Equilibria in Infinitely Repeated Games	209
	Subgame Perfection and the One-Stage Deviation Principle	212
	The Folk Theorem	214
	Behavior in Games—Playing “Anything Goes” Strategies	216
	Exercises	220
IV	Incomplete Information	
11	Simultaneous Games of Incomplete Information	225
	The Conditional Cooperator’s Dilemma	226
	<i>Harsanyi Transformation</i>	227
	<i>Bayesian Games</i>	228
	Solving for Bayesian Nash Equilibria	229
	<i>Going Hunting with a Flatlander</i>	232
	Continuous Strategies	234
	The Acquiring a Company Game and the Market for Lemons	236

Behavior in Games	237
<i>Failures of Contingent Thinking</i>	237
<i>Evidence-Based Adaptations of the Standard Model</i>	238
Will Information Be Revealed?	240
Exercises	241
12 Signaling: Sequential Games of Incomplete Information	245
Sequential Games of Incomplete Information	246
Updating Beliefs	249
<i>Bayes' Rule</i>	249
<i>Belief Updating in Sequential Games</i>	251
<i>Perfect Bayesian Equilibrium</i>	254
Finding Perfect Bayesian Equilibria in Costly Signaling Games	255
<i>Job Market Signaling</i>	256
<i>The Beer-Quiche Game</i>	261
<i>The Meaning of Beer and Quiche</i>	263
Perfect Bayesian Equilibria in Cheap Talk Games	264
Behavior in Games	266
<i>Overcommunicating in Costly Signaling and Cheap Talk Games</i>	266
<i>Evidence-Based Adaptations of the Standard Model</i>	269
Exercises	271
13 Auctions	277
A Typography of Auction Formats	278
Private Value Auction Preliminaries	279
Private Value Auctions with Two Bidders	281
A More General Analysis Is Needed	284
The All-Pay Auction	287
Revenue Equivalence	288
Private Value Auctions with n Bidders	292
Common Value Auctions	294
Behavior in Games—Revenue Nonequivalence?	297
Evidence-Based Adaptations of the Standard Model	301
Exercises	302
V Bargaining and Cooperative Game Theory	
14 Non-cooperative Bargaining	307
The Bargaining Problem	308
<i>Agreeing, Disagreeing, and Individually Rational Outcomes</i>	308
The Ultimatum Game	311

Alternating Offers	312
<i>Finite Number of Stages</i>	314
<i>Infinite Stages</i>	316
Bargaining in Committees: The Baron-Ferejohn Legislative Bargaining Model	319
Behavior in Games	320
<i>Evidence-Based Adaptations of the Standard Model</i>	323
Exercises	327
15 Cooperative Bargaining	331
Cooperative Versus Non-cooperative Bargaining	332
The Nash Bargaining Solution	335
Alternative Solutions to the Cooperative Bargaining Problem	338
Behavior in Games—Which of Nash’s Axioms Seem to Resonate with Bargainers?	342
<i>Evidence-Based Adaptations of the Standard Model</i>	344
Exercises	345
16 Cooperative Game Theory	347
Cooperative Games	348
Coalitions and Values	350
<i>Prisoner’s Dilemma</i>	351
<i>The Merger Game</i>	351
<i>Buyers and Sellers</i>	352
<i>Ride Sharing</i>	352
Distributing Payoffs: The Core	353
<i>Imputation</i>	354
<i>Blocking Coalitions and the Core</i>	354
<i>The Core in the Merger Game</i>	357
<i>Buyers and Sellers: Application to Markets</i>	357
<i>Dividing a Dollar</i>	359
Distributing Payoffs: Shapley Value	359
<i>The Shapley Value When Dividing a Dollar</i>	361
<i>The Shapley Value in the Merger Game</i>	362
<i>The Shapley Value in Competitive Markets</i>	363
<i>Voting Power</i>	363
<i>Cost Sharing</i>	364
Behavior in Games	365
<i>Can We Agree to Disagree?</i>	365
<i>Evidence-Based Adaptations of the Standard Model</i>	366
Exercises	368

17	Matching Market Design	371
	Matching Markets	373
	One-Sided Matching Markets	375
	<i>Top Trading Cycle (TTC) Algorithm</i>	375
	<i>House Allocation with Squatting Rights</i>	377
	Two-Sided Matching	379
	<i>Deferred Acceptance Algorithm</i>	380
	School Choice	383
	<i>School Placement When All Schools Have the Same Priorities</i>	383
	<i>Extending the Deferred Acceptance and Top Trading Cycle Algorithms to School Choice</i>	384
	<i>Example</i>	387
	Behavior in Games	388
	<i>Lying to Strategy-Proof Mechanisms</i>	388
	<i>Evidence-Based Adaptations of the Standard Model</i>	390
	Exercises	392
VI	Social Dilemmas	
18	Social Dilemmas	397
	The Trust Game	398
	Social Dilemmas	399
	Continuous Social Dilemmas	401
	Behavior in Games—Trust, Reciprocity, and Efficiency	403
	Exercises	407
19	Public Goods	411
	The Logic of Public Goods	411
	Exogenous Mechanisms to Increase Contributions	414
	Endogenous Mechanisms to Increase Contributions	417
	Behavior in Games—Contributions to a Public Good	418
	Exercises	424
20	Common Pool Resources	427
	Common Pool Resources and the Tragedy of the Commons	428
	A Static Common Pool Resource Game	430
	<i>Efficient Extraction</i>	430
	<i>Nash Equilibrium Extraction</i>	431
	<i>Does Group Size Matter?</i>	433
	<i>A General Model</i>	434
	Dynamic Common Pool Resource Games	434

<i>The Quadratic Production Function as the Steady State of a Dynamic System</i>	434
<i>An Example of a Dynamic Game</i>	435
<i>Probabilistic Destruction of a Resource</i>	437

Governing the Commons 440

Behavior in Games 442

Over-Overextraction 442

Evidence-Based Adaptations of the Standard Model 445

Exercises 448

VII Social Choice and Voting

21 Social Choice 453

Determining a Group's Preference Ranking 454

When There Are Only Two Alternatives 454

Condorcet Winners and Cycles 455

Voting Rules Affect the Outcome 458

Borda Count 459

Instant Runoff Voting 459

Approval Voting 460

Arrow's Impossibility Theorem 461

Spatial Voting 462

Single-Peaked Preferences 463

Multiple Dimensions and Radial Symmetry 466

Strategic Voting 471

The Problem of the Divided Majority 472

Incentives for Strategic Voting 473

Gibbard-Satterthwaite Theorem 474

Candidate Competition Games 476

The Hotelling Model 476

When Two Candidates Compete for Votes 477

Behavior in Games 480

Voting Sincerely and Not Particularly Chaotically 480

Evidence-Based Adaptations of the Standard Model 484

Exercises 487

22 The Paradox of Voting 491

The Calculus of Voting 491

The Paradox That Ate Rational Choice 492

Noninstrumental Motives 493

Voter Turnout as a Participation Game 494

Pure-Strategy Nash Equilibria in the Participation Game 495

Mixed-Strategy Nash Equilibria in the Participation Game	496
<i>Pure-Mixed-Strategy Nash Equilibria</i>	496
<i>A Three-Player “Chicken’s Dilemma”</i>	497
<i>The Equilibrium Conditions for an n-Player Game</i>	498
The Participation Game with Incomplete Information	500
Behavior in Games	502
<i>Evidence of Noninstrumental Voting: Voting Expressively and to Tell Others</i>	504
<i>Evidence-Based Adaptations of the Standard Model</i>	505
Exercises	508
23 Voting with Private Information	511
Voting to Aggregate Information	512
The Jury Game	513
<i>The Optimal Decision of a Single Juror</i>	514
Voting Strategically against Your Own Evidence	515
<i>Conditioning on Being Pivotal Under Unanimity</i>	516
<i>Conditioning on Being Pivotal Under Majority Rule</i>	516
Bayesian Nash Equilibria: Convicting the Innocent under Unanimity	518
The Swing Voter’s Curse	520
<i>Rational Abstention</i>	521
<i>Voting to Counteract Partisans</i>	523
Costly Information Acquisition and Rational Ignorance	524
Behavior in Games	526
<i>Evidence-Based Adaptations of the Standard Model</i>	527
Exercises	529
VIII Behavioral Extensions of Standard Theory	
24 Belief-Based Learning	533
Best Response Dynamics	534
Fictitious Play	537
Behavior in Games—Are Adaptive Beliefs Enough?	540
Exercises	542
25 Evolutionary Game Theory	545
Replicator Dynamics	546
<i>The Evolution of Hawks and Doves</i>	549
<i>Evolution in the Stag Hunt</i>	550
<i>The Stability of Evolutionary Equilibria</i>	552
<i>Evolutionarily Stable Strategies</i>	555

	Asymmetric Contests	558
	Behavior in Games—Can Evolutionary Dynamics and Imitation Predict Play?	564
	Exercises	570
26	Quantal Response Equilibrium	575
	Letting Players Make Mistakes	576
	Better Responding: Quantal Response Functions	577
	Better Responding to Each Other: Quantal Response Equilibrium	580
	Better Responding in the Matching Pennies Game	581
	Better Responding in Symmetric 2x2 Games	585
	Structural Basis of Quantal Response Functions	586
	Better Responding in the Volunteer's Dilemma	587
	Extension to Sequential Games: Agent Quantal Response Equilibrium	590
	<i>Centipede Game</i>	591
	Exercises	593
27	Level- k Reasoning	597
	Level- k Reasoning	597
	<i>Level-k Reasoning and Nash Equilibrium</i>	598
	<i>The 11–20 Money Request Game</i>	599
	Level- k Reasoning in Matrix Games	600
	Level- k Reasoning in Guessing Games	602
	<i>The Beauty Contest</i>	602
	<i>Other Guessing Games</i>	604
	Level- k Reasoning in Sequential Games	606
	Level- k Reasoning in Games with Incomplete Information	609
	<i>Incomplete Unraveling of Information about Movie Quality</i>	612
	Cognitive Hierarchy: Reasoning about the Reasoning of Others	613
	Exercises	616
28	Psychological Game Theory	619
	Psychological Games	621
	Incorporating Guilt into Games	621
	Psychological Equilibria	624
	<i>Example: The Bravery Game</i>	625
	<i>Psychological Equilibria in the Trust Game with Guilt Aversion</i>	626
	Intention-Based Reciprocity	627
	Reciprocity in Simultaneous-Move Games	630
	<i>Prisoner's Dilemma</i>	632
	<i>Battle of the Sexes</i>	633

Reciprocity in Sequential Games	635
<i>Sequential Reciprocity in the Prisoner's Dilemma</i>	636
<i>Sequential Reciprocity in the Mini-Ultimatum Game</i>	638
The Hold-up Problem with Vengeful Players	640
Exercises	642
Appendix	645
Set Notation	645
Optimizing a Function of a Single Variable	646
Optimizing a Function with Variables out of the Decision Maker's Control	649
Integration	652
Probability	653
Expected Value	655
Expected Payoff: A Model of Choice under Risk	656
Choice over Time	657
References	661
Index	679